TENNESSEE JOURNAL OF LAW AND POLICY
SECOND ANNUAL SYMPOSIUM

THE TENNESSEE SUPREME COURT’S
IMPACT ON LAW AND POLICY:
CELEBRATING THE LEGACIES OF
JUSTICES ANDERSON, BIRCH, AND DROGOTA

WELCOME AND INTRODUCTION
Thomas C. Galligan, Jr., Dean, University of Tennessee
College of Law

INTRODUCTION TO SYMPOSIUM
Joseph Hyder, 2005-06 Editor-in-Chief

THE COURT’S CONTRIBUTIONS TO PROFESSIONAL ETHICS,
PUBLIC CONFIDENCE IN THE JUDICIARY, AND PUBLIC
ACCESS TO THE COURTS
Kelly Randall, 2006-07 Editor-in-Chief, Moderator

PROFESSIONALISM
Lance Bracy, Chief Disciplinary Counsel, Tennessee Board
of Professional Responsibility

SCALES- SUPREME COURT ADVANCING LEGAL
EDUCATION FOR STUDENTS
Sue Allison, Public Information Officer, Tennessee
Supreme Court

CAMERAS IN THE COURTROOM
Judge Richard Baumgartner, Knox County Criminal Court
COMPARATIVE FAULT: HOW THE COURT CHANGED TORT LAW IN TENNESSEE

Dr. Otis H. Stephens, Alumni Distinguished Service Professor of Political Science and Resident Scholar of Constitutional Law, University of Tennessee College of Law

THE JUDICIAL PERSPECTIVE
Marshall Davidson, Staff Attorney, Tennessee Supreme Court

THE PLAINTIFF’S PERSPECTIVE

THE DEFENDANT’S PERSPECTIVE
Andrew Tillman, Attorney, Paine, Tarwater, Bickers & Tillman, Knoxville, Tennessee

TRIBUTE TO JUSTICE ANDERSON
Rodd Barckhoff, Judicial Clerk, Tennessee Supreme Court

RESPONSE OF JUSTICE ANDERSON
E. Riley Anderson, Justice, Tennessee Supreme Court

TRIBUTE TO JUSTICE BIRCH
Raney Irwin, Assistant General Counsel, Tennessee Department of Health

RESPONSE OF JUSTICE BIRCH
Adolpho A. Birch, Jr., Justice, Tennessee Supreme Court

TRIBUTE TO JUSTICE DROWOTA
Lisa Rippy, Judicial Clerk, Tennessee Supreme Court
RESPONSE OF JUSTICE DROWOTA
Frank F. Drowota, III, Justice, Tennessee Supreme Court

CONCLUDING REMARKS
Penny J. White, Associate Professor, University of Tennessee College of Law

ARTICLE

THE RETIREMENT OF CHIEF JUSTICE FRANK F. DROWOTA, III: A TRIBUTE TO A LEGAL LEGEND AND ALL AROUND NICE GUY
Lisa Rippy and Marshall Davidson
2006-07 Editorial Board

KELLY RANDALL
Editor-In-Chief

CHASITY SHARP
Managing Editor

IAN HENNESSY
Publication Editor

ASHLEY SMITH
Articles Editor

LISA WHITE
Research Editor

STEVIE N. PHILLIPS
Deputy Publication Editor

JILL SHOTZBERGER
Deputy Research Editor

JEREMY COTHERN
Deputy Research Editor

JOSEPH VIGLIONE
Deputy Editor of Administration

Editors
JON T. MEAGHER
CHARLES TRAUGHBER
ELLEN SCHOOLAR
Faculty Advisors

PENNY J. WHITE
Associate Professor of Law

OTIS H. STEPHENS, PH.D.
Alumni Distinguished Service Professor of Political Science
and Resident Scholar of Constitutional Law

University of Tennessee College of Law Administration

JOHN L. SOBIESKI, JR.
Lindsay Young Distinguished Professor of Law
and Associate Dean for Academic Affairs

Douglas A. Blaze
Interim Associate Dean for Academic Affairs and Art Stolnitz and Evlin
E. Overton Distinguished Professor of Law

DOLORES J. WHITERS
Assistant Dean for Student Affairs
INTRODUCTION

Penny White

When the staff of the Tennessee Journal of Law and Policy began to discuss a topic for their Spring 2006 Symposium, their focus quickly became the Tennessee Supreme Court. For the first time in history, three outstanding justices of longstanding tenure were announcing their upcoming retirements. As we considered the many contributions that Justices Anderson, Birch, and Drowota had made to the Court, to the profession, and to the state, the Symposium topic became obvious. What was much more difficult was trying to narrow the particular subject matters for discussion. After consulting with lawyers, judges, and law professors, the Journal staff decided on a format that would allow discussion not only of the justices' contributions but of the justices themselves. In this way, we would honor the individuals' personal and professional legacies.

Two substantive topics emerged among the many considered as symbolic of the justices lasting impact on the profession. The first was comparative fault, which we believed would generate a lively discussion of how the Court's decision in McIntyre v. Balentine and its progeny had changed tort law in Tennessee. The second topic was professionalism. Specifically, the Journal wanted to highlight the leadership role the Court had played in promoting public confidence in the profession and public access to the courts through programs like SCALES (Supreme Court Advancing Legal Education for Students).

---

1 Penny White is an Associate Professor at the University of Tennessee College of Law.
2 McIntyre v. Balentine, 833 S.W.2d 52 (Tenn. 1992).
and Tennessee Supreme Court Rule 30, commonly known as the "Cameras in the Courtroom" rule.3

The Journal staff selected excellent representatives among the Bench and the Bar to address the two topics from a variety of perspectives. In addition, the staff invited former and current judicial clerks for each of the justices to bring a personal message about each of the honorees. The participants engaged the audience with wonderful stories, memories, and highlights of the combined eighty years of judicial service. The reactions of the in-person audience of federal and state judges, lawyers, law professors, law students, and citizens proved that the Journal staff's intuition was right — "The Tennessee Supreme Court's Impact on Law and Policy: Celebrating the Legacies of Justices Anderson, Birch, and Drowota" was an ideal Symposium topic.

The Journal staff brings you this Symposium edition, a near transcript of that memorable event, in the hope that you, like those present at the event, will have the opportunity to reflect upon the remarkable contributions of these three legal giants. As one of two faculty advisors to the Tennessee Journal of Law and Policy, I am as proud of the staff's accomplishments with this Symposium as I was to be the former colleague of our retiring justices.

---

3 TENN. SUP. CT. R. 30.
CONTENTS

WELCOME AND INTRODUCTION
Thomas C. Galligan, Jr., Dean, University of Tennessee College of Law.........................................................14

INTRODUCTION TO SYMPOSIUM
Joseph Hyder, 2005-06 Editor-in-Chief..........................14

THE COURT’S CONTRIBUTIONS TO PROFESSIONAL ETHICS, PUBLIC CONFIDENCE IN THE JUDICIARY, AND PUBLIC ACCESS TO THE COURTS
Kelly Randall, 2006-07 Editor-in-Chief, Moderator........16

PROFESSIONALISM
Lance Bracy, Chief Disciplinary Counsel, Tennessee Board of Professional Responsibility.........................17

SCALES- SUPREME COURT ADVANCING LEGAL EDUCATION FOR STUDENTS
Sue Allison, Public Information Officer, Tennessee Supreme Court.................................................................23

CAMERAS IN THE COURTROOM
Richard Baumgartner, Judge, Knox County Criminal Court.................................................................29
COMPARATIVE FAULT: HOW THE COURT CHANGED TORT LAW IN TENNESSEE
Dr. Otis H. Stephens, Alumni Distinguished Service Professor of Political Science and Resident Scholar of Constitutional Law, University of Tennessee College of Law

THE JUDICIAL PERSPECTIVE
Marshall Davidson, Staff Attorney, Tennessee Supreme Court

THE PLAINTIFF’S PERSPECTIVE

THE DEFENDANT’S PERSPECTIVE
Andrew Tillman, Attorney, Paine, Tarwater, Bickers & Tillman, Knoxville, Tennessee

TRIBUTE TO JUSTICE ANDERSON
Rodd Barckhoff, Judicial Clerk, Tennessee Supreme Court

RESPONSE OF JUSTICE ANDERSON
E. Riley Anderson, Justice, Tennessee Supreme Court

TRIBUTE TO JUSTICE BIRCH
Raney Irwin, Assistant General Counsel, Tennessee Department of Health

RESPONSE OF JUSTICE BIRCH
Adolpho A. Birch, Jr., Justice, Tennessee Supreme Court
TRIBUTE TO JUSTICE DROWOTA
Lisa Rippy, Judicial Clerk, Tennessee Supreme Court ................................................................. 80

RESPONSE OF JUSTICE DROWOTA
Frank F. Drowota, III, Justice, Tennessee Supreme Court ................................................................. 84

COMMENTS OF CHIEF JUSTICE BARKER
William M. Barker, Chief Justice, Tennessee Supreme Court ................................................................. 91

CONCLUDING REMARKS
Penny J. White, Associate Professor, University of Tennessee College of Law ............................................. 92

ARTICLE

THE RETIREMENT OF CHIEF JUSTICE FRANK F. DROWOTA, III: A TRIBUTE TO A LEGAL LEGEND AND ALL AROUND NICE GUY
Lisa Rippy and Marshall Davidson .................................................. 95