
Marva Duerksen
Willamette University, trace@utk.edu

Follow this and additional works at: https://trace.tennessee.edu/gamut

Recommended Citation

Available at: https://trace.tennessee.edu/gamut/vol2/iss1/13
Review


Marva Duerksen

Gary Karpinski’s Manual for Ear Training and Sight Singing, with its accompanying Anthology for Sight Singing (with Richard Kram), Instructor’s Dictation Manual, Student Recordings CD-ROM, and Instructor’s CD-ROM: An Anthology Search Disc, marks a distinctive contribution to the burgeoning market of aural skills textbooks. As one reviewer wrote of Karpinski’s 2000 publication, Aural Skills Acquisition: The Development of Listening, Reading, and Performing Skills in College-Level Musicians, in his work we find a “synthesis of cognitive research, pedagogical and other more qualitative studies, textbook approaches, and Karpinski’s personal experiences in teaching aural skills. No such synthesis exists elsewhere in such a comprehensive form.” Indeed, it is Karpinski’s commitment to research and writing about aural skills acquisition, fueled by his own experience in applying principles of music cognition to aural skills pedagogical settings, that distinguishes his Manual and its accompanying materials from other recent efforts. His earlier Aural Skills Acquisition, about

which I will say relatively little in this review, serves as an invaluable preface to the *Manual* and should be required reading for instructors using his materials.

For the texts and other materials reviewed here, the *Manual* is clearly the foundational volume, with the *Anthology* serving as close companion. It is in the *Manual* that Karpinski presents theoretical explanations, as well as foundational exercises for sight singing and ear training. The *Anthology* is what its name suggests: a collection of musical excerpts correlated with the *Manual* to reinforce its theoretical framework. Instructors will likely require that students purchase both volumes, as well as the *Student-Recordings CD-ROM*, which includes numerous recorded examples for dictation practice. Essential for the instructor is the *Instructor’s Dictation Manual*, which collects all the dictation examples into one volume. Helpful, but to my mind not critical, is the *Instructor’s CD-ROM: An Anthology Search Disc*, which “treats the excerpts as a database,” allowing instructors “to select excerpts appropriate for any level or topic of study.”

*Karpinski’s* *Manual* consists of seventy-eight chapters presented in a carefully graduated course of study that is designed to take students through a two-year sequence of primarily tonal aural skills training. The preface outlines three curricular models, one that covers all seventy-eight chapters, a second that omits fundamentals (Chapters 1–10), and a third that covers fundamentals through chromatic harmony but omits modulation. Karpinski also divides the chapters into broad categories of “essential” and “optional.” Instructors will be wise to heed this distinc-

---

tion and to choose carefully their curricular models, as the comprehensive approach mapped out in the *Manual* will surely challenge the time constraints of any two-year aural skills program.

Karpinski begins the *Manual* with “protonotation” and proceeds through diatonic harmony, chromatic harmony, modulation, and form, with chapters on rhythm interspersed throughout. While he does not intend the *Manual* to be a stand-alone music theory text, the elegant theoretical explanations that begin each chapter distinguish it markedly from a publication such as Robert Ottman’s and Nancy Rogers’s *Music for Sight Singing*, which contains minimal theoretical discussion. Karpinski’s lucid explications are matched by a systematic progression of topics within the larger categories described above. In his chapters on diatonic harmony, for instance, he is especially thorough in his introduction of triads on different scale degrees, with an entire chapter given to each (Chapters 25, 30, and 40–43). Karpinski’s treatment of applied chords is just as systematic, with individual chapters devoted to chords applied to the dominant, the subdominant, the supertonic, the submediant, and the mediant (Chapters 54–58). Other elements of chromatic harmony presented include the Neapolitan and augmented-sixth chords, and chords of mixture (Chapter 59–61). Topics in modulation comprise closely related modulation from the major and minor modes, distant modulations achieved by common tone or enharmonically reinterpreted common chords, and successive modulations (Chapters 68–72). Karpinski also devotes one chapter to common non-diatonic pitch collections, including whole tone, octatonic, and quartal. The concluding chapter on form assumes students’ familiarity with binary, rounded binary, ternary, compound ternary, rondo, sonata allegro, and

---

theme-and-variations forms. Karpinski’s focus here is on having students develop metric and thematic grids as visual maps of larger tonal structures.

Chapters devoted to rhythm proceed in the systematic manner observed for topics in harmony, with such subjects as simple meters (Chapters 1, 3, 5, 7), ties and the dotted beat (Chapter 12), compound meters (Chapter 16), triplets and duplets (Chapter 20), quadruple division of the beat in simple meters (Chapter 22), sextuple division of the beat in compound meters (Chapter 28), syncopation (Chapter 31), advanced triplets (Chapter 51), hemiola (Chapter 65), advanced metric concepts and rhythms (Chapter 75), and hypermeter (Chapter 77). Advanced rhythmic concepts include smaller divisions of the beat, especially thirty-second notes, and irregular divisions such as quintuplets and septuplets. The topic of hypermeter, with its emphasis on thinking and listening at a level larger than the individual measure, provides a practical segue to the final chapter on form. (Students have had some earlier preparation for this larger-scale schematic listening in Chapter 34: “Introduction to Harmonic Listening: Harmonic Rhythm and Cadences”).

Especially distinctive in the beginning of Karpinski’s Manual is his introduction of “protonotation,” which he launches and develops in three stages: rhythm, pitch, and rhythm and pitch combined.4 In Chapter 1, devoted to fundamentals of meter and rhythm, Karpinski argues that his rhythmic notation, beginning with short vertical lines that show different levels of pulse, “allows us to develop skills in hearing and reading meter and rhythm without worrying about ‘what kind of note gets the beat’ and other notational complications” (1). In this chapter, Karpinski uses simple duple and triple meters, exemplified (respectively) by the familiar tunes

---

4 Cummings and Palto note Karpinski’s “original contribution to aural skills pedagogy through his explanation and championing of prenotational skills, which he terms ‘protonotation’” (review of Aural Skills Acquisition, 94).
“Twinkle, Twinkle” and “Pop Goes the Weasel.” In Chapter 2, he establishes protonotation principles for pitch, beginning with horizontal lines at graduated levels to represent the melodic contour of “Frère Jacques” (7). Then, using the same tune, Karpinski translates the contour dashes into both scale-degree and solmization notations. On p. 10, he presents a series of scalar fragments that combine the three pitch notational systems: scale-degree numbers with carets, solmization syllables, and relative contour.

It is not clear to me how Karpinski makes the transition between the “pitch patterns” of his Exercise 2 (just described), and the “sequential” that constitutes his Exercise 3; both are reproduced here as Figure 1. It is in the latter exercise that Karpinski first combines the rhythmic lines of Chapter 1 with the pitch designations of Chapter 2. Conspicuously absent in Exercise 3, however, is any visual representation of melodic contour. This absence of contour is surprising in at least two respects: first, Karpinski does not explain its disappearance; second, his earlier publication, Aural Skills Acquisition, draws attention to the fact that contour recognition is a significant intermediate step between tonic inference and scale-degree identification for musical listeners. In addition, in a section of the earlier book titled “Perception of Melodic Contour,” Karpinski notes the success he has achieved both with having students trace the melodic shape “with a hand in the air” (“as a diagnostic tool in individual meetings with students”) and “drawing horizontal lines to represent the relative heights of the pitches” (“as part of entrance and diagnostic examinations”). If these visual analogues of melodic contour have served well in the

---

5 “A sequential is an exercise in which a pitch pattern is repeated on successive scale degrees” (Gary S. Karpinski, Manual for Ear Training and Sight Singing [New York: W. W. Norton, 2007], 10).
7 Karpinski, Aural Skills Acquisition, 49, n.55.

(a) Exercise 2

| 1a. 1/do | 2/re | 3/mi | 1/do | 1b. 1/do | 3/mi | 1/do |
| 2a. 1/do | 2/re | 3/mi | 4/fa | 5/sol | 1/do |
| 3a. 1/do | 2/ti | 6/la | 5/sol | 1/do | 3b. 5/sol |
| 4a. 3/mi | 2/re | 1/do | 3/mi | 4b. 3/mi | 1/do | 3/mi |
| 5a. 5/sol | 4/fa | 3/mi | 2/re | 1/do | 5b. 5/sol |
| 8a. 5/sol | 6/la | 2/ti | 1/do | 8b. 5/sol | 5/sol |

(b) Exercise 3

---

Gamut 2/1 (2009)
settings noted, why eliminate them from the protonotation, especially since the “real” notation introduced in the Manual’s Chapter 7 includes precisely this visual analogue?

One further point concerning the protonotation requires attention. Karpinski’s Chapter 3 contributes an additional element to the pitch notation: directional arrows to indicate *skips* up or down. While helpful to the conceptual processing of the student, to my mind these arrows do not compensate for the more general disappearance of contour in the notation. Moreover, the “+/-” notation proposed in *Aural Skills Acquisition* (“with + representing ascending motion, - representing descending motion, s representing motion by step, and l representing motion by leap”) hardly seems a viable alternative, especially as compared to the elegance and efficiency of the protonotation thus far.

Other matters of concern in the *Manual* as a whole include components that might very well be considered central to an aural skills curriculum, but for which Karpinski provides an introduction with little or no follow-through. First is the place of keyboard applications. For example, in Chapter 36 of the *Manual*, titled “Bass Lines,” he instructs students to practice singing bass lines of multiple-part musical excerpts and provides a number of excerpts for bass-line dictation. In the corresponding section of the *Anthology*, however, Karpinski (and Kram) provide five exercises in which students are instructed to sing the bass voice while playing the upper three voices on the piano. Surprisingly, this type of exercise does not appear again. In another setting, when students are asked to arpeggiate chord progressions by singing solmization syllables, the *Manual* also instructs students to play these at the keyboard but provides no models. To my mind, the *Manual* would be greatly enhanced by a greater and more consistent

---

9 The first instance of this appears in Chapter 44, p. 187, with many instances in subsequent chapters.
integration of keyboard applications for Karpinski’s excellent materials. In fact, I believe it would be appropriate for Karpinski to prepare an entire volume devoted precisely to this topic.

Another element that receives only cursory attention is dictation for more than one part. Karpinski devotes one chapter to two-part dictation (Chapter 35) and does not revisit the topic in significant depth again. His next chapter, on bass-line dictation, sets the Manual on a pronounced harmonic path from which it will not depart. Indeed, the remainder of the Manual’s dictation materials consists almost entirely of alternating melodic dictations, with clear-cut harmonic profiles, and four-part harmonic dictations given primarily in keyboard style. Karpinski does indicate in the Manual that some instructors may require that students notate both the soprano and bass. Still, the harmonic dictation exercises differ quite noticeably from Karpinski’s two-part exercises, the latter being marked by much greater independence between the parts. For me, an obvious question arises: if two-part dictation receives just one chapter out of seventy-eight, what is its significance in the method as a whole?


The Anthology for Sight Singing, coordinated with the Manual, provides a rich resource of materials, in keeping with Karpinski’s and Kram’s stated intent to “provide progressively graded excerpts that allow instructors and students to focus on very specific musical elements while dealing entirely with real music” (x). In their preface to the Anthology, the authors outline the principles that have informed their compilation and printing philosophy. Foundational is the

---

10 On p. 160 of the Manual, in his instructions for harmonic dictation, Karpinski writes: “Listen to excerpts 37.1–37.8 and write out the bass line for each. Then supply the appropriate Roman numerals and figured bass symbols to represent each chord. Your instructor may also choose to have you write out the top ("soprano") voice as well [emphasis added].” Karpinski repeats this instruction in subsequent harmonic dictation exercises throughout the Manual.
coordination of the Anthology with the Manual—to my mind, its greatest merit. I do not know of any resource that provides so many real-music excerpts that are as well organized as the Anthology, and that have such a systematic theoretical underpinning. For instance, the detail observed above, in Karpinski’s mapping out the triads formed on each scale degree, correlates with individual chapters that present excerpts featuring each of these triads.

Further, Karpinski and Kram show tremendous rigor in their efforts to include composers both familiar (Bach, Haydn, and Mozart) and unfamiliar (Konrad von Würzburg and Hélène Riese Liebmann), and to cover an extensive historical range, from as far back as the late medieval Meistersingern up through David Del Tredici and Dave Brubeck. Each excerpt is meticulously annotated with the composer’s name, the title of work and the date of its composition, and the measure numbers excerpted.\footnote{For instructors wishing to supplement student performances with recordings that place melodic excerpts in context, this scrupulous attention to detail is most welcome.} In all excerpts with text, the text appears in the original language but without translations—an omission that merits attention in a future edition. Finally, each chapter in the Anthology supplies a variety of keys (once all the keys have been introduced) and meter signatures, as well as a mixture of single-line and multi-part excerpts, and frequent excerpts in tenor and alto clefs (again, once these have been introduced).

Another principle is Karpinski’s and Kram’s desire to maintain the original appearance of the music from which they have excerpted their anthology items. Each excerpt reproduces the tempo marks, dynamics, articulation, phrasing, and register of the original. The last element especially may require that students sing ledger lines more frequently than in other sight-singing texts, but the authors rightly defend such reading as a valuable skill. Further, wherever possible, they have used the most authentic sources available, including Urtext editions and editions over-
seen by the composer. Thus, Karpinski’s and Kram’s *Anthology* includes ample resources for sight singing and, at the same time, engages students with real music written in real notation and based on authoritative sources.

The accompanying software—*Instructor’s CD-ROM: An Anthology Search Disc*—treats the *Anthology* as a database that allows instructors to search for excerpts with particular parameters, including mode, scale-degrees used in the excerpts, and particular harmonies, such as applied dominants. Karpinski’s and Kram’s aim with the *Search Disc* is to render the *Anthology* flexible enough to accommodate different approaches to sight singing. For the less technologically inclined, the authors include “Helpful Lists” at the back of the print collection, with these headers: stepwise excerpts, excerpts with a range of a fifth or smaller, two-part excerpts, three-part excerpts, four-part excerpts, excerpts with five or more parts, excerpts from folk sources and from popular and jazz sources.

*Instructor’s Dictation Manual; Student Recordings CD-ROM.*

The hefty collection of dictation examples presented in the *Instructor’s Dictation Manual*, most of which appear on the accompanying *Student Recordings CD-ROM*, is a treasure trove for dictation practice. When using Karpinski’s materials prior to their publication, I faced the dilemma of many aural skills teachers: providing students with a sufficient quantity of appropriately graded exercises for dictation practice. The *Student Recordings CD-ROM* responds admirably to this need with clearly organized materials, all recorded with fine sound quality.

---

12 Karpinski and Kram cite a prominent exception to the *Urtext* principle: works such as those in *Twenty-Four Italian Songs and Arias* that are encountered “so frequently in other editions that we have opted to reproduce them as they appear in those settings” (*Anthology for Sight Singing*, xi).

13 Instructors and students should be aware that the CD-ROM plays only on a computer. If classrooms lack a computer, Karpinski provides a website from which sound files may be downloaded and burned onto CDs.
The Instructor’s Dictation Manual contains all of the dictation exercises presented in the Manual and the Anthology. This makes possible a survey of all of the types of dictation exercises Karpinski includes across his two-year curriculum. Concurrent listening to the CD-ROM recordings contributes other significant data. My own examination of the Dictation Manual and listening to the CD-ROM has led to the following observations: first, author-composed melodies and chord progressions in four parts make up the bulk of the dictation exercises;\(^\text{14}\) and second, the vast majority are performed on piano. At a number of levels, the use of author-composed materials makes perfect sense. Karpinski has written melodies and progressions to correlate with his systematic and carefully graduated theoretical schematic. In addition, the composed melodies put forward in sharp relief the harmonic underpinnings of tonal music that Karpinski emphasizes in the Manual as a whole. However, given Karpinski’s and Kram’s commitment to having students engage real music (as stated in their preface to the Anthology), I believe the method as a whole would benefit from the authors applying this emphasis to dictation materials much earlier, and more consistently within the method as a whole. Compensation comes in later chapters when students are asked to transcribe elements of real-music excerpts, but such a focus is lacking in the earlier chapters. Furthermore, and in keeping with the emphasis on real music, students would profit from more melodic excerpts that include text in English or a foreign language (a few are included), and melodies performed on instruments other than the piano.

---

\(^{14}\) After an introductory chapter engaging students with recordings of real music, it is not until Chapter 44 that dictation examples involving real music become a regular feature. Exceptions include: Chapter 15, which asks that students listen to literature excerpts to determine tempi; Chapter 21, an introduction to transcription with melodies performed on oboe, violin, piano, organ, voice, harpsichord, cello, and trumpet; Chapter 28, with excerpts from J. S. Bach and F. Couperin; and Chapter 34, with numerous symphonic and piano excerpts that introduce students to harmonic listening—that is, harmonic rhythm and cadences.
Another matter concerns the prevalence of harmonic dictation exercises written in keyboard style and, again, performed on piano. Keyboard-style voicing, while easier for the non-pianist to perform under the pressures of a classroom setting, artificially isolates the bass line. Notably, when Karpinski includes excerpts from Bach chorales, they appear in a true, four-voice registral arrangement. Performance of the chorales on piano, however, misses a significant opportunity to expose students to the sound of SATB singing (or, possibly, to a family of brass, string, or woodwind instruments); perhaps most significantly, it also misses an opportunity to emphasize the contrapuntal individuality of the voices—a task for which the piano is not as well suited.

Conclusion.

The materials reviewed here, the product of Karpinski’s own systematic work in the area of aural skills acquisition extending over several decades, and the practical fruits of his desire to “bridge the gap between music cognition research and aural skills instruction,” constitute an achievement in the field of aural skills pedagogy that is both profound and practical. Moving beyond “a collection of items for mere testing,” Karpinski has indeed articulated in the course of his Manual an approach to teaching aural skills that “conveys methods by which students—through study and practice—will be able to improve their listening, reading, and performing skills” (xiv). Additionally, Karpinski and Kram have compiled a meticulously annotated Anthology rich in its collection of real music excerpts. Finally, Karpinski and Kram have developed valuable technological resources in the form of Student and Instructor CD-ROMs. I used the

---

Manual, the Instructor’s Dictation Manual, and the Anthology with great success prior to their publication, and I am delighted that they are now available for widespread pedagogical application. I have no doubt that many teachers of aural skills will share this positive assessment.
WORKS CITED


ABOUT THE AUTHOR

Marva Duerksen is Associate Professor of Music at Willamette University, where she teaches music theory and aural skills, advanced music theory and music history offerings, and general education courses devoted to women in the arts. Duerksen’s research, teaching, and performing interests focus on music by women composers, with special emphasis on the vocal music of American composer Libby Larsen. Duerksen has presented papers and lecture-performances on Larsen’s music at regional, national, and international conferences. She recorded a CD of Larsen’s music with soprano, Ann Tedards, in the summer of 2007. In the spring of 2008, with funding from the University of Oregon’s Center for the Study of Women in Society, Duerksen and Tedards presented recitals of Larsen’s music at the University of Massachusetts-Amherst,
Bowdoin College, and Brooklyn College of the City University of New York. In addition to her work on women composers, Duerksen also has an article on organicism in the work of Heinrich Schenker forthcoming in the journal *Intégral*.

*This article uploaded to the Gamut site on 1 July 2009.*