



12-1958

## **A Study of Top Executive Selection in Industry with Implications for the Selection of College Presidents**

Ramon Leonard Carroll  
*University of Tennessee - Knoxville*

Follow this and additional works at: [https://trace.tennessee.edu/utk\\_gradthes](https://trace.tennessee.edu/utk_gradthes)



Part of the [Educational Administration and Supervision Commons](#)

---

### **Recommended Citation**

Carroll, Ramon Leonard, "A Study of Top Executive Selection in Industry with Implications for the Selection of College Presidents. " Master's Thesis, University of Tennessee, 1958.  
[https://trace.tennessee.edu/utk\\_gradthes/2947](https://trace.tennessee.edu/utk_gradthes/2947)

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Graduate School at TRACE: Tennessee Research and Creative Exchange. It has been accepted for inclusion in Masters Theses by an authorized administrator of TRACE: Tennessee Research and Creative Exchange. For more information, please contact [trace@utk.edu](mailto:trace@utk.edu).

To the Graduate Council:

I am submitting herewith a thesis written by Ramon Leonard Carroll entitled "A Study of Top Executive Selection in Industry with Implications for the Selection of College Presidents." I have examined the final electronic copy of this thesis for form and content and recommend that it be accepted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Education, with a major in Educational Administration.

Dr. John W. Gilliland, Major Professor

We have read this thesis and recommend its acceptance:

Dr. Orin B. Graff, Dr. Galen N. Drewry, Dr. E.M. Ramer, & Professor I.N. Chiles

Accepted for the Council:

Carolyn R. Hodges

Vice Provost and Dean of the Graduate School

(Original signatures are on file with official student records.)

November 14, 1958

To the Graduate Council:

I am submitting herewith a thesis written by Ramon Leonard Carroll entitled "A Study of Top Executive Selection in Industry with Implications for the Selection of College Presidents." I recommend that it be accepted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Education, with a major in Educational Administration and Supervision.

John W. Gililand  
Major Professor

We have read this thesis and  
recommend its acceptance:

Walen N. Drewry

Gray N. Chiles

Chris B. Gray  
Carl M. Rando

Accepted for the Council:

Osak Hanthling  
Dean of the Graduate School

A STUDY OF TOP EXECUTIVE SELECTION IN  
INDUSTRY WITH IMPLICATIONS FOR THE  
SELECTION OF COLLEGE PRESIDENTS

---

A THESIS

Submitted to  
The Graduate Council  
of  
The University of Tennessee  
in  
Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements  
for the degree of  
Doctor of Education

---

by

Ramon Leonard Carroll

December 1958



## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Deep gratefulness is hereby expressed to all those who have given so generously of their time and effort without which the successful completion of this study would have been impossible.

The writer is especially indebted to the members of his sponsoring committee: Dr. John W. Gilliland, Chairman, Dr. Orin B. Graff, Dr. Galen N. Drewry, Dr. E. M. Ramer, and Professor I. N. Chiles, who counseled with the writer and gave many helpful suggestions.

Appropriate acknowledgment is made to the jury of industrial managers and personnel specialists for their services and full cooperation.

Special thanks are due to Dr. John W. Gilliland for invaluable guidance and encouragement throughout the course of the study.

The writer particularly wishes to express sincere gratitude to his loyal and faithful wife and son whose endless patience and understanding have made the burden of this study lighter.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER	PAGE
I. INTRODUCTION . . . . .	1
Statement of the problem . . . . .	3
Statement of the sub-problems . . . . .	4
Basic assumptions . . . . .	5
Definitions . . . . .	5
Limitations . . . . .	6
Significance of the study . . . . .	6
Methods of procedure . . . . .	12
Sub-problems and procedures . . . . .	13
Organization of the study . . . . .	17
II. THE DEVELOPMENT OF CONCEPTS OF TOP EXECUTIVES .	20
Introduction . . . . .	20
The top executive in industry . . . . .	21
The college president . . . . .	37
The college governing board . . . . .	62
Chapter summary . . . . .	68
III. TOP EXECUTIVE SELECTION IN INDUSTRY . . . . .	71
Introduction . . . . .	71
A guide to selection methods . . . . .	74
A point of view regarding selection devices .	76
A review and analysis of selection devices .	77

## CHAPTER

## PAGE

## III. (continued)

An examination and analysis of four formal programs of selection . . . . .	88
A critique of the four programs of selection . . . . .	104
Chapter summary . . . . .	110

## IV. IDENTIFICATION AND APPRAISAL OF SIGNIFICANT

PATTERNS OF TOP EXECUTIVE SELECTION . . . .	112
Introduction . . . . .	112
Identification of significant patterns of executive selection in industry . . . . .	113
Significance of suggested patterns of selection . . . . .	117
Analysis and appraisal of significant patterns of top executive selection . . . .	130
Chapter summary . . . . .	152

## V. IMPLICATIONS FOR THE SELECTION OF COLLEGE

PRESIDENTS . . . . .	153
Introduction . . . . .	153
A theory of top leadership selection . . . .	154
The importance of the college president and type of appointment . . . . .	156
Implications in regard to the nature and function of selection . . . . .	166

# CHAPTER

v  
PAGE

## V. (continued)

Implications for those entrusted with the function of executive selection . . . . .	170
Implications in regard to basic policy formulation in area of executive selection . . . . .	174
Implications for the organization and administration of a program of executive selection . . . . .	175
Chapter summary . . . . .	182
VI. SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS .	184
Summary . . . . .	186
Conclusions . . . . .	192
Recommendations . . . . .	193
BIBLIOGRAPHY . . . . .	195
APPENDIX . . . . .	203

## LIST OF TABLES

TABLE	PAGE
I. Jury Appraisal of Twenty-Four Basic Patterns of Selection (Importance) . . . . .	132
II. Jury Appraisal of Twenty-Four Basic Patterns of Selection (Feasibility) . . . . .	139
III. Comparison of Ratings by Jury as to Importance and Feasibility of Twenty-Four Basic Patterns of Selection . . . . .	146
IV. Range of Jury Ratings . . . . .	151

## CHAPTER I

### INTRODUCTION

During the past decade, the rating of leadership has achieved a substantial degree of maturity and the various selection methods and devices have gained wide acceptance, particularly in industry. More recent research in general leadership selection has resulted in proliferations, no two of which are identical, yet there has been very little painstaking research and few systematic experiments which have been directly concerned with improving the training and selection of college presidents. Industrial executives and college presidents are vital to the American way of life and they constitute centers of power. Yet, top leaders seem to have avoided critical and objective scrutiny of themselves while they have asserted the necessity of determining the selection of those beneath them by the most scientific methods available.<sup>1</sup> As a result, attempts to investigate problems relating to the selection of college presidents appear to have been subtly avoided, thereby deterring the unlocking of essential disciplines of high-level educational leadership. The need for systematic programs of selection for college presidents accentuates the probability that there could be gullible

---

<sup>1</sup>Alvin W. Goullder, Studies in Leadership (New York: Harper and Brothers, 1950), p. 48.

acceptance of lower-echelon selection principles and procedures which may appear potentially useful, with little regard for how dubious the basis may be for determining their value. The urgency of the desire for something more than mediocrity in top leadership by all groups is indicative of the imperative confronting those who are entrusted with selecting competent top executives.

Perhaps the limited knowledge about top leadership selection accounts for the seemingly vociferous disagreement in regard to what are proper selection techniques and procedures. It seems that the rapid and healthy growth of industry during the last quarter of a century may be due largely to the accurate and deliberate selection of top executives. Is it not possible that the patterns of selection in industry, if used carefully by those entrusted with the function of selecting the college president, may have reciprocal influence in the educational enterprise? The purpose of this study, therefore, was to examine the literature dealing with leadership selection, to analyze four selected experiments in industry which were concerned with executive selection, corroborate the findings, analyze resultant data, appraise patterns of selection, and propose meaningful implications which may be used when selecting the college president.

This study centers in drawing out of four industrial programs of selection a positive, unified, and consistent

plan for selecting college presidents. The study was organized not simply to be a lucid summary of studies but rather to indicate a framework of patterns relative to top executive selection which have been tested in industry. It was hoped that this study would help to clarify and increase value judgments of college governing boards. The study is permeated throughout with a democratic concept which attempts to assess experimental selection practices which are currently in vogue in industry and to create from formal programs of selection a systematic approach to the selection of college presidents. It was also hoped that this study would help to bridge the gap that exists in this segment of literature by corroborating experimental selection findings in industry. It is hoped further that the implications will be meaningful and that the suggested framework of patterns will serve as a guide for college boards of control who are seeking to appraise, refine, or revamp their selection practices in an attempt to achieve a fundamental goal of high-quality executive leadership.

#### Statement of the Problem

The purpose of this study was to investigate the problem area suggested by the following questions:

What have been the findings in industry concerning the selection of top executives? What implications may formal



programs of selection in industry have for the selection of college presidents?

The primary concern of this investigation was to examine the literature and four programs of selection which are currently used in industry for selecting executives and attempt to identify and to appraise factors which appeared significant for the selection of college presidents.

#### Statement of the Sub-Problems

An analysis of the major problem area involved a scrutiny of the following adjuvant problems:

1. To survey literature in order to develop concepts of the industrial executive and the college president.
2. To examine and analyze four formal programs of selection in industry.
3. To identify and appraise significant patterns of executive selection which emerge from the findings of the four programs of selection in industry.
4. To identify implications which the programs of selection in industry have for the selection of the college president.

### Basic Assumptions

The logic underlying the analysis of the problem rested upon the following assumptions:

1. That formal programs of selection in industry contain patterns which will help insure intelligent selection of college presidents.
2. That findings relative to leadership selection in industry are valid evidence for determining patterns for the selection of college presidents.
3. That there is no single factor in selection that can guarantee the effective selection of college presidents.
4. That the selection of the executive is as crucial as selection at lower levels.
5. That many boards of control do not have a positive, unified, and consistent program of selection.

### Definitions

The terminology used in this study accepts meanings as found in standard reference works within the area involved. In order to clarify specific meanings, some of the terms were defined as follows:

Top executive. One whose job requires at least 50 per cent of his time in work related to policy planning, program

selling, and coordination.<sup>2</sup>

Framework of patterns. A composite of patterns of selection developed from formal programs of selection in industry.

### Limitations

Certain limitations were imposed upon the study which attempted to confine the scope of inquiry in such a way as to enhance the probability of thorough accomplishment. These restrictions were:

1. That the study should be made within the framework of findings in industry relating to executive selection between 1930 and 1959.
2. That the study be confined to analyzing and appraising data from four programs of selection in industry.

### Significance of the Study

Spears<sup>3</sup> indicated the importance of the function of selection for in the last resort everything depends on the

---

<sup>2</sup>T. E. Coffin, "A Three-Component Theory of Leadership," Journal of Abnormal and Social Psychology, 39:63, January 1944.

<sup>3</sup>Edward L. Spears, Assignment to Catastrophe (Vol. 2; New York: A. A. Wynn, Inc., 1954), p. 130.

ability of selectors to identify and evaluate accurately the potential head of affairs. Industry<sup>4</sup> and education (several notable efforts have been made under the direction of Southern States Cooperative Program in Educational Administration) have increasingly recognized the need for improved solutions to the intricate problems involved in finding the right top leader.

Despite the general selection devices and methods, Harvey<sup>5</sup> stated that personnel consultants feel that no one set of appraisal techniques is fool-proof. Tests, interviews, and theories of how to determine good leadership traits may give insight into the problem of executive selection, all of which may improve the understanding, but any one or a combination of such approaches may be responsible for hiring some poor risks and letting some good ones get away.

The different approaches to leadership selection are important; nevertheless, it appears that the strength of a program of selection is proportional to the ability of the governing board to understand its function and the board's ability to translate its philosophic-mindedness into

---

<sup>4</sup>M. Joseph Doohar and Elizabeth Marting, Selection of Management Personnel (Vol. 1; New York: American Management Association, Inc., 1957), pp. 184-351.

<sup>5</sup>W. W. Harvey, "Search for the Right Executive," Journal of Educational Sociology, 30:31-34, September 1956.

intelligent behavior. Corroboration, analysis, and synthesis of findings of programs of selection in industry may be a means of assisting boards of control in acquiring a better understanding of top executive selection. The way a board of control rationalizes is important for it is from this pivotal point that criteria for selection purposes are developed. The human animal seems to overlook criteria until it sees the need for them. Too often passive unproductiveness results in blunders.<sup>6</sup> It appears that boards of control could avoid much of the risky speculation by embracing tested patterns of selection. Further, it is their obligation to examine critically and reconstruct changing concepts in relation to what they are supposed to do. The rapid and profound changes that have taken place in higher education for which governing boards have the obligation to provide effective top leadership confirms the assumption that a board of control should be a democratic agency for improving executive leadership in higher education.

It is appropriate to query why a scientific procedure has not been employed more extensively as a bulwark for the general trusteeship of the educational enterprise. The hectic evolution of leadership selection indicates that the method of intelligence may be a feasible approach to solving

---

<sup>6</sup>Herman G. James, "How To Be A University President," The American Mercury, 43:46-50, January 1938.

the problem of selecting top leaders. An emphasis on group-problem-solving is being evidenced within the framework of the college and should bring about an awareness of findings that might enhance the effectiveness of boards in the function of selection. The possibilities contained in the method of intelligence need not be complicated by the insistence that the purpose and structure of boards governing academic institutions exempt them from the influence of scientific media for certain and effective use. Barnard<sup>7</sup> indicated that the universal characteristics of organization are applicable to clergymen, military men, government officials, and men of widely diversified businesses.

The management of higher education is becoming increasingly complicated, therefore, the achievement of maximum effectiveness, of desirable relationships, and over-all efficiency will depend greatly upon the caliber, aptitudes, and attitudes of the chief executive officer. From this point of view, the selection of the college president becomes the first prerequisite for the success of the college program. Selection guide-lines from industry, then, may be meaningful to trustees and may help selection committees to avoid costly mistakes that often result in irreparable institutional damages.

---

<sup>7</sup>C. I. Barnard, Functions of the Executive (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1938), p. 8.

The problem of selecting competent top leadership has stimulated a voluminous flow of literature, yet, in the opinion of Mandell<sup>8</sup> there are no conclusive and simple answers. The variables and eccentric conditions involved in selection situations tend to deter any one proposition that sets forth an absolute and constant answer.

Top leadership selection is a crucial function in any area. There is an indication of an enlivened interest in selecting college presidents in a more scientific way. General experiments in selection have indicated the direction toward more effective top leadership selection though at the moment there is not a completely charted course.

The functions of a college make the application of a scientific program of selection appropriate. The orderliness with which millions of dollars are spent each year in the operation of institutions of higher education is an indication for concern. The Federal Security Agency<sup>9</sup> reported that the fiscal year 1953-54 the current income of

---

<sup>8</sup>Milton M. Mandell, "The Selection of Executives," quoted in M. Joseph Doohar and Elizabeth Marting, Selection of Management Personnel (Vol. 1; New York: American Management Association, Inc., 1957), p. 191.

<sup>9</sup>United States Department of Health, Education, and Welfare, Statistics of Higher Education: Receipts, Expenditures and Property 1953-54, Chapter IV, Section II (Washington: Government Printing Office, 1957), p. 18.



institutions of higher education in the United States amounted to \$2,945,550,446. This sum exceeded the current income of colleges in 1951-52 by \$383,099,056 or by an increase of 15 per cent. The 1953-54 sum exceeded the 1949-50 total income by 24 per cent. During the 1953-54 school term administrative expenses amounted to \$290,532,949 in American colleges. Administrative expenditures constituted 16 per cent of the total of educational and general expenses omitting research and extension, 13 per cent of the entire educational and general group, and 10 per cent of all current expenditures.<sup>10</sup> The expenditure for administration indicates another reason why a formal system of executive selection should be developed. It appears that enlarging expenditures can be maintained only if they benefit the major purposes of the college. The fact that the expenditure was made, in itself, is prima facie evidence of the desperate need for adequate and tested patterns of selection.

The American people have entrusted to institutions of higher education their greatest treasures, the formative period of the lives of their youth and the abilities of their scholars. The manner in which the institutions severally and collectively discharge their responsibilities will be determined by the quality and the suitability of their plans for

---

<sup>10</sup>Ibid., p. 51.



selecting the right person in the right place. The behavioral image of the college president will be mirrored from every facet of the institution. The need for this study seems to be clear.

### Methods of Procedure

The general research procedures for the study were survey, synthesis, analysis, and appraisal. The problem and the corollary areas indicated the need for gathering information from two important sources.

The first source of information existed in four formal programs of leadership selection in industry. Materials received from corporations that are experimenting with formal programs of selection provided data for the identification of patterns of selection. A jury of industrial managers and personnel specialists served as an additional source of data. It was believed that these two sources afforded a base upon which to identify and appraise a framework of patterns of selection.

A review of the literature on leadership selection and experiments in selection conducted in industry was made during 1958. Analysis and synthesis of the literature afforded useful data which revealed conceptions of executives they expressed. This research also provided a background for the identification, analysis, and appraisal of the patterns

of selection which emerged from the four formal programs of selection in industry.

### Sub-Problems and Procedures

The procedure followed in treating each of the four sub-problems was as follows:

#### A Review of Literature in Order to Develop Concepts of the Industrial Executive and the College President

In order to maintain a balanced approach to this sub-problem area, the data which formed the basis for Chapter II were obtained through surveying intensively the literature relating to the top executive. It was assumed that a careful analysis of literature provided a valid basis for the development of concepts of the top industrial executive and the college president. These data revealed the impact of various elements upon evolving concepts of the top leader. The concepts of the leader seemed to be related to patterns of selection.

#### An Examination, Analysis, and Appraisal of Four Programs of Selection in Industry

This area of the study was approached through a careful examination and analysis of four programs of leadership selection currently in vogue in industry. In order to select those programs of selection which appeared to hold more

significance to the selection of college presidents, the following steps were taken:

1. The writer's Advisory Committee was requested to suggest programs of selection which were felt to hold special significance to the selection of college presidents.

2. After the programs of selection were chosen, inquiries were addressed to the officials of the respective corporations requesting up-to-date data on their particular program of selection. This was done in an attempt to secure the latest available information.

3. Personal interviews were held with industrial managers and personnel specialists. This technique was employed in an attempt to secure information that probably would not be secured by the use of the traditional questionnaire. It was believed that the interviews would give the writer firsthand selection information that would be valuable in assessing the four formal programs of selection.

#### The Identification and Appraisal of Significant Patterns of Executive Selection Emerging from the Findings of Programs of Selection

Significant patterns of selection were identified from the four programs of selection by the process of analysis and synthesis. The synthesis reduced the data to generalizations or patterns of top leadership selection in industry. The

purpose of this procedure was to observe implications for the selection of the college president.

The significant patterns of top leadership selection were presented to a jury for their appraisal. The jury was selected carefully to insure a professional point of view. Each member of the jury was asked to appraise the patterns of selection as to fundamental importance and practicability. The rating process provided the study with the specialist's concept of each pattern of selection as to importance and feasibility. Jurors were also requested to add and rate any selection pattern which was not included but which in their opinion should be included. Each member of the jury was requested to rate the basic patterns of leadership selection in accordance with a scale which would elicit value judgments which were imposed for this purpose.

For the purpose of facilitating ratings, a three point rating scale was devised and each juror was requested to rate each pattern according to the following scale:

Highly desirable	-	3
Of some value	-	2
Of no value	-	0

Highly desirable. A pattern of leadership selection, which in the opinion of the juror, was necessary and/or a prerequisite for effective selection was scored a number value of three on the rating sheet.

Of some value. If, in the opinion of a juror, a pattern of selection was of some importance but not necessarily essential for effective selection, a number value of two was given on the rating sheet.

Of no value. A pattern of doubtful significance was assigned a number value of zero on the score sheet.

The following rating guide was established in order to determine the practicability of each pattern:

Highly practical	- 3
Of some practicability	- 2
Of no practicability	- 0

Highly practical. If a pattern was capable of being effected and of unquestionable usage, it was rated a number value of three on the score sheet.

Of some practicability. If a pattern was of some degree of feasibility in effecting successful leadership selection, a number value of two was given on the score sheet.

Of no practicability. A pattern of noted difficulty to effect was assigned a number value of zero on the score sheet.

The final scoring of each pattern was obtained by securing the sum of the point values given by each of the jurors. Ratings of significance and practicability were determined separately. The average rating value of each pattern was secured by dividing the total rating value by the

number of jurors voting on each respective statement.

In stating the framework of patterns, the following criteria were observed:

1. The framework of patterns must be stated in a simplified form.
2. The framework of patterns must provide flexibility in application.
3. The framework of patterns must avoid artificial relationships.

The Identification of Implications which Programs of Top Executive Selection in Industry Have for the Selection of College Presidents

An attempt was made by the writer to analyze the research findings and to project meaningful implications for the selection of college presidents. An effort was made to keep the implications positive, unified, and consistent.

Organization of the Study

The report of the study was organized in six chapters. The contribution of each chapter is indicated as follows:

Chapter I includes an introduction to the study, a statement of the problem, sub-problems, assumptions, definition of terms, limitations, significance of the study,

methods of procedure, and organization of the report.

Chapter II presents the development of concepts of the industrial executive, the college president, and the college governing board. Data gathered from the literature in the field of leadership selection provided the general background necessary for the development of the study.

Chapter III attempts to examine and analyze four programs of selection which are currently employed in industry. The data contained in this chapter are designed to present a continuity of development in the study by presenting an abridged account of four formal programs of selection from industry. This chapter also serves as a basis for the identification and appraisal of significant patterns of selection.

Chapter IV identifies and appraises basic patterns of executive selection which emerged from the four formal programs of selection in industry. This chapter presents the appraisal technique that was utilized in the study and gives the results of the appraisal procedure.

Chapter V attempts to point out some significant implications that the programs of selection in industry had for the selection of college presidents. It was the purpose of this chapter to group the tested patterns of the four programs of selection into a positive, unified, and consistent

framework of selection suitable for utilization in the selection of college presidents.

Chapter VI concludes the study with a summary, conclusions, and recommendations based upon an analysis of the findings.



## CHAPTER II

### THE DEVELOPMENT OF CONCEPTS OF TOP EXECUTIVES

#### Introduction

In the introduction of the problem under investigation it was indicated that concepts of top executives would be considered as theoretical guide lines by which the study would be oriented. It was believed that concepts about the nature and job of industrial executives, college presidents, and governing boards were of importance to proper consideration of top leadership selection. The objective of this chapter, therefore, was an attempt to show that significant literature dealing with the governing board, the nature and characteristics of top executives and an analysis of their jobs contained definitive concepts and that the function of selection was related to these concepts and theories.

The nature of the top executive, in conjunction with philosophical and psychological concepts of the office and job, has rendered significant implications for the effective selection of college presidents. For this reason appropriate attention to the development of concepts of top executives was presented in this chapter and will be considered as an initial step in the development of the study.

Data were gathered exclusively from the literature for this chapter. For the most part, it was found that the literature made voluminous contribution to the development of concepts for general leadership but very little research had actually explored specific top jobs and positions. Perhaps this is one explanation why the dynamic characteristics of top leaders seem to be such that they run ahead of research discoveries and explanations. Few people, however, question the need for better methods for the selection of college presidents although some are skeptical of the possibilities for the ultimate success and some are dubious as to the value of present efforts.<sup>1</sup>

### The Top Executive in Industry

#### The Historical Role of the Executive

Speculation about the leader of leaders traces a sparkling trail through recorded history and folklore. Childhood dreams of kings in mighty castles, of galloping chiefs leading their knights into battle were built upon romantic suppositions about top leaders and what they did. Times and customs have changed but for many people the executive still

---

<sup>1</sup>Milton M. Mandell, "The Selection of Executives," quoted in M. Joseph Dooher and Elizabeth Marting, Selection of Management Personnel (Vol. I; New York: American Management Association, Inc., 1957), p. 189.

stands firmly on his pedestal. Even in this enlightened generation, a common concept of the big boss pictures him with a husky voice, barking commands to slavish employees. Many common folk visualize him as driving a long black automobile and dining at the country club. It appears strange that so few people really know what an executive is and what he does. And yet since the very beginning of time, management and the manipulation of men to attain personal or institutional ends have been practiced and studied.

Historically, top management-leadership theory and practice were based primarily upon one of two assumptions. The first assumed that a right to rule existed, as expressed in the doctrine of the divine right of kings or by virtue of birth. The second based the right to rule on strength, might made right. The strongest man became chief; the man with the most powerful army became king. Possession of property and wealth was also a measure of strength. Wealthy men have been assumed to be powerful men; they seem to be able to command others. A person born of blue-blood or born with a silver spoon in his mouth could demand obedience from others on his own terms. His subjects had the choice of accepting his terms, which he could change at any time without notice, or pay the penalty. Penalties ranged from losing a job to losing a head.

Accompanying the power or force approach to top leadership in earlier days, frequently there went the art of bribery. When might made right, when moral sanctions were impotent, the end justified the means. Political scenes in Europe during the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries are revealing when viewed from this point of view.

The concept of executive leadership seems to have moved toward a basic purpose of service to employees, to stockholders, to consumers, and to society at large. Modern top leaders reflect social consciousness in many ways. The new concept is that top leadership is becoming professionalized. Management in the United States has made a definite shift from owner to professional management.<sup>2</sup> This does not mean that owners are never executives, but when they are top managers they are so because of professional capabilities rather than from ownership. The various periods of the economic growth of the United States have required executives of different characters. There were the days of the rugged individualist, who fought according to the rules of the time to build a business, protect his patents, and to survive. There were periods of great financial crises and of rigid government regulation. Today the premium is on management

---

<sup>2</sup>Daniel R. Davies and Robert T. Livingston, You and Management (New York: Harper and Brothers, 1958), p. 36.

competence of a professional democratic group-problem-solving nature.<sup>3</sup>

Since the basis of selection has shifted from the fortunes of birth to demonstrated ability, the study of the top executive, his job, and how to scientifically select the best top leader have grown in importance.

#### Qualifications to be Desired in an Executive

During the last quarter of a century, research has discovered scores of different qualifications required of the effective executive. Another revealing discovery relates to the infrequency with which the desired executive qualities are found inclusively in the same person.<sup>4</sup> It has been established that the good executive must possess different abilities, yet to be effective he must have the know-how of acting in the various roles and know when to assume a particular role. Janney<sup>5</sup> observed that no amount of training could suffice for actual experience gained while serving in a given position.

---

<sup>3</sup>Lawrence A. Appley, "The President's Scratchpad," Management News, 23:2, October 31, 1950.

<sup>4</sup>Chris Argyris, "Top Management Dilemma: Company Needs vs. Individual Development," Personnel, 32:123-128, September 1955.

<sup>5</sup>J. Elliott Janney, "Company Presidents Look at Their Successors," Harvard Business Review, 32:45-53, September-October, 1954.

Many opinions have been expressed, on the basis of relevant research studies, as to the qualifications desired in an executive. The various points of view are briefly presented here. Stogdill<sup>6</sup> summarized the research literature on leadership and reported that capacity, achievement, responsibility, participation, and status were the most important factors. The Gibb's<sup>7</sup> study verified Stogdill's findings. Brown and Raphael<sup>8</sup> pointed out that intensive training will not produce competent executives who lack, in the first place, the necessary native intelligence and psychological virtues. Gardner<sup>9</sup>, basing his remarks on a study of executives in industry, stated that strong desire for achievement, social recognition, and affection for superiors characterized successful executives. Effective executives are decisive,

---

<sup>6</sup>Ralph Stogdill, "Personal Factors Associated with Leadership: A Survey of the Literature," Journal of Psychology, 25:35-71, January 1948.

<sup>7</sup>Cecil A. Gibb, "The Principles and Traits of Leadership," The Journal of Abnormal and Social Psychology, 42:283, July 1947.

<sup>8</sup>Wilfrid Brown and Winfred Raphael, Managers, Men and Morale (London: MacDonald and Evans, 1948), pp. 119-120.

<sup>9</sup>Burleigh B. Gardner, "What Makes Successful and Unsuccessful Executives?" Advanced Management, 13:116-125, December 1948.

assertive, and practical. Page<sup>10</sup> found that potential leaders in the commissioned corps of the military forces rated high in social adeptness, initiative, aggressiveness, military aptitude, emotional stability, dependability, and geniality. Emmons<sup>11</sup> classified undesirable executives as the egocentric, the efficiency expert, the yes man, the frightened executive, and the hard-boiled autocrat. West<sup>12</sup> indicated that reliability, penetration, consistency, aggressiveness, honesty, friendliness, and a social sense were characteristics of top leaders. Buell<sup>13</sup> summarized some of the qualifications of executives as follows: intuitive grasp of figures, emotional feeling for abstractions, and ability to analyze men. Griswold<sup>14</sup> listed judgment, vision, large and concrete thinking, courage, character, and loyalty as distinguishing marks of a top leader. Appleby<sup>15</sup> described the

---

<sup>10</sup>Howard E. Page, "Detecting Potential Leaders," The Journal of Aviation Medicine, 19:435-441, March 1948.

<sup>11</sup>Russel J. Emmons, "Getting Along with Your Top Executive," Personnel Journal, 29:55-58, June 1950.

<sup>12</sup>Sir Harold West, "Professional Qualifications in General Management," British Management Review, 9:51, January 1950.

<sup>13</sup>Raymond L. Buell, "The 30,000 Managers," Fortune, 21:58-62, February 1940.

<sup>14</sup>A. Whitney Griswold, "Citation," The New York Times, June 13, 1950, p. 16.

<sup>15</sup>Paul H. Appleby, Big Democracy (New York: Alfred A. Knoff, 1945), pp. 39-43.



ability to orient one's self in a larger frame of reference and the quality of philosophy to relate various actions in terms of public interest as special qualifications needed for a government executive. J. F. Brown<sup>16</sup> identified fundamental characteristics of effective top leadership as follows: (1) the leader merges with the group; (2) the leader gains respect because he personifies the ideals which motivate the group; (3) the leader considers the desires of the group; (4) the leader employs long-range planning; and, (5) the leader increases his effectiveness by abiding by the group's conceptions. A study in two hundred companies as reported by Waddell<sup>17</sup> indicated that the following intellectual and personal defects were the most frequent reasons for top management failure: (1) inability to delegate; (2) lack of a broad knowledge; (3) inability to analyze and evaluate; (4) poor judgment; (5) inability to cooperate; (6) inability to make decisions; and, (7) lack of skill in organization and administration. A penetrating study of executive qualifications by Argyris<sup>18</sup> listed essential qualifications as

---

<sup>16</sup>J. F. Brown, Psychology and the Social Order: An Introduction to the Dynamic Study of Social Fields (New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company, 1936), p. 342.

<sup>17</sup>Richard L. Waddell, "The Mystery of Executive Talent," Business Week, 1342:43-46, May 21, 1955.

<sup>18</sup>Chris Argyris, "Some Characteristics of Successful Executives," Personnel Journal, 32:50-55, February 1953.



follows: (1) ability to work effectively under pressure; (2) the art of gaining group participation in solving common problems; (3) the ability to question personal judgments and actions objectively; (4) the ability to take hard knocks; (5) the ability to be tactful under all conditions; (6) the ability to accept defeat or victory gracefully; (7) the ability to stand adverse decisions with poise; (8) the ability to identify one's self with the professional group; and (9) the ability to set realistic goals.

It will be observed from the various points of view that the qualifications needed for a top executive are manifold. The analysis of the job of the key executive has led to the formulation of significant characteristics. It is possible and probable that this framework of characteristics may be a useful basis for further research and for a definition of those elements which are of greatest importance in selecting top business executives or college presidents.

#### Significant Characteristics of Business Executives

The various abilities and characteristics for top executive effectiveness may be listed, generally, under the following headings: (1) background and experience; (2) intellectual and mental qualities; (3) physical attributes; and (4) personality traits.

Background and experience. Lieutenant General Raymond S. McLain<sup>19</sup> expressed a commonly accepted opinion when he wrote that novice leaders, who had perhaps never commanded more than battalions and regiments for any length of time, could not suddenly become able to command corps and armies, and groups of armies. All-round qualifications will be found only in a man who has had broad administrative experience. Prior administrative experience, according to Dooher<sup>20</sup>, becomes a requirement for any except the lowest level of executive positions. Dooher<sup>21</sup> stated further that some aspects of a person's experience, however, may support or contradict his suitability for top executive leadership. There is great controversy in the literature relative to the transfer of outstanding executive behavior in one field to success in another top position if the knowledges, skills, abilities, and personal characteristics are highly similar. If this concept were true, one may move from top positions in military life, political service, business and education and expect to enjoy success. It is possible for there may be less correlation

---

<sup>19</sup>Lieutenant General Raymond McLain, Military Review, p. 41, March 1950.

<sup>20</sup>M. Joseph Dooher and Elizabeth Marting, Selection of Management Personnel (Vol. I; New York: American Management Association, Inc., 1957), p. 233.

<sup>21</sup>Ibid., p. 234.

between the needs of two executive positions in the same area of endeavor than there is between two executive positions in different areas. Strong<sup>22</sup>, Bradshaw<sup>23</sup>, and Lewisohn<sup>24</sup> attempted to point up that years of exposure to one type of work may pose a problem rather than a qualification when a person is moved from one top job to another. Buell<sup>25</sup> has noted that work background influenced the performance of executive duties and it is difficult to attach an occupational label on first-class top management. The literature pointed out numerous aspects of experience which seemed relevant to executive success. Mandell<sup>26</sup> argued that it may be desirable to select an executive who does not have a technical background. Barnard<sup>27</sup> and Ungerson<sup>28</sup> supported the viewpoint that real top

---

<sup>22</sup>Edward K. Strong, Vocational Interests of Men and Women (Palo Alto: Stanford University Press, 1943), p. 171.

<sup>23</sup>F. F. Bradshaw, Developing Men for Controllership (Boston: Graduate School of Business Administration, Harvard University Press, 1950), p. 61.

<sup>24</sup>Sam A. Lewisohn, Human Leadership in Industry (New York: Harper and Brothers, 1945), p. 48.

<sup>25</sup>Buell, op. cit., p. 106.

<sup>26</sup>Mandell quoted in Doohar and Marting, op. cit., p. 236.

<sup>27</sup>Chester I. Barnard, Organization and Management: Selected Papers (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1948), p. 87.

<sup>28</sup>B. Ungerson, "Executive Development in Retailing," British Management Review, 13:124, December 1955.

leadership involves technical competence. Drucker<sup>29</sup> insisted that the professional reputation and achievement of the man at the top should be the first criterion for selection.

Intellectual qualities. The literature indicated that views in this general area are full of emotional overtones conditioned by traumatic experiences. Mandell<sup>30</sup> listed verbal ability, reasoning ability, memory, judgment, flexibility, and organization-mindedness as essential mental qualities for top leadership. Barnard<sup>31</sup> proposed that the top executive needed high-level general mental ability, the ability to learn complex materials, to reason from complex verbal, quantitative, and abstract materials and to integrate and analyze. Herbert Simon<sup>32</sup> emphasized that the center of key administration is the decision-making process. The able leader of leaders is one who can channel his advanced level of intelligence within the framework of the organization.

Physical attributes. The literature that dealt with this area of concern may be summarized in Barnard's<sup>33</sup> reasons

---

<sup>29</sup>Peter F. Drucker, "Management and the Professional Employee," Harvard Business Review, 30:86, April 1952.

<sup>30</sup>Mandell, op. cit., pp. 238-245.

<sup>31</sup>Barnard, op. cit., p. 197.

<sup>32</sup>Herbert Simon, Administrative Behavior (New York: Macmillan Company, 1947), p. 197.

<sup>33</sup>Barnard, op. cit., pp. 93-94.

for executive endurance and vitality which were as follows: (1) that physical health permits the acquirement of extraordinary personal capacity for leadership; (2) that personal attractiveness and persuasiveness stem from an element of vitality; and, (3) top leadership often involves protracted periods of strenuous work and emotional tensions.

Personality. Executive personality seemed to be a primary consideration in research pertaining to leadership. All top executive positions seem to require an appealing, pleasing personality saturated with a genuine interest in people. Mandell<sup>34</sup> listed the following considerations as essential for high-level leadership: self-confidence and emotional maturity, aspiration, tempo, social and ethical standards, marital adjustment, work habits, courage, and decisiveness. Selekman<sup>35</sup> indicated that a top leader avoids personalizing developments that are distasteful to him and asserted that impatience is fatal to successful negotiations. Kehoe<sup>36</sup> stated that differences in administration are created by sharp differences in social and ethical standards. Judge

---

<sup>34</sup>Mandell, op. cit., pp. 245-251.

<sup>35</sup>Benjamin M. Selekman, Labor Relations and Human Relations (New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company, 1947), pp. 143-163.

<sup>36</sup>Monika Kehoe, "International Cooperation as a Human Problem," Human Relations, 2:375-380, February 1949.

Medina<sup>37</sup> stated the following: (1) that integrity is an important characteristic of a successful executive; (2) that the leader must possess a passion for truth and zeal; (3) the leader must be free from bias and intolerance; (4) the leader must possess a true sense of moral values; and, (5) a sense of responsibility and obligation to others is an important element. These things affect a person's attitude toward those under him.

#### The Job of the Industrial Executive

There seems to have been few systematic studies of the executive's job. Alvin W. Goulder<sup>38</sup> indicated the importance of advanced inquiry in this specific area because the scientific study of top leadership is as crucial as that of lower levels. The need for scientific analysis of the top executive's job is portrayed by Burling<sup>39</sup> when he iterated that the job into which a man is going is fully as important as the man who is going into the job.

Common elements among executive positions. The duties of top executives often seem to be confused by failure to

---

<sup>37</sup>Harold R. Medina, quoted in Employee Bulletin, United States Civil Service Commission, Washington, 4:7, December 20, 1950.

<sup>38</sup>Alvin W. Goulder, Studies in Leadership (New York: Harper and Brothers, 1950), p. 48.

<sup>39</sup>Temple Burling, "Psychiatry in Industry," Industrial and Labor Relations Review, 8:33, August 1954.

distinguish clearly between executive leadership and supervisory work. Dooh<sup>40</sup>er indicated that the executive needed the ability to see a problem as a whole. The job of the executive seems to require the following: (1) the ability to penetrate problems; (2) the ability to coordinate institutions with policies and outside pressures; and, (3) the ability to act quickly and with grace. Some people seem to believe that most executives would be successful supervisors whereas few good supervisors would be outstanding executives.

It appears that even a superficial study of top executive positions would reveal the multiplicity of problems that confront the top leader. The changeableness of the problems indicate that a pressure is continually upon the executive which requires him to be flexible. The executive may help to provide policies, select subordinates, and furnish methods for performance and evaluation; but he should not be expected to oversee every detail of work that is actually being done. The attempt to check minute actions inevitably lowers the executive to a supervisory role. The ability to delegate responsibility is a requirement of the executive's job. Failure to delegate responsibility hampers the ability to perform essential duties.

The magnitude of the top job becomes more sensitive when it is realized that there are no fixed rules by which

---

<sup>40</sup>Dooh<sup>er</sup>, op. cit., p. 213.



an executive can decide what he should or should not see and do before action is taken. The nature of the organization, personal temperament, physical capacity, and the ability to analyze the problem will have proportional influence on the executive. Different systems of values between the top executive and his board of directors emerge with telling effects upon the job of the key administrator. Buell<sup>41</sup> noted that executives must constantly struggle to square their conceptions of operational policies with the views of owners.

Brown and Raphael<sup>42</sup> described the top executive's position as a lonely position by the very nature of the job. It appears that the implications arising from this statement have an important relationship to selection.

A study<sup>43</sup> conducted among presidents of moderate-sized companies revealed their agreement that the following duties are important: (1) the selection, discharge, motivation, and coordination of top assistants; (2) the determination of the essential nature of the business; (3) the president's responsibility as chief financial officer; and (4) negotiation of crucial matters affecting the organization

---

<sup>41</sup>Buell, op. cit., p. 108.

<sup>42</sup>Brown and Raphael, op. cit., p. 80.

<sup>43</sup>Doohar, op. cit., p. 217.



of the company. Holden<sup>44</sup> described the top executive's function as active planning, direction, coordination, and general control within the scope of the established policies of the company. Another executive function of psychological magnitude is the complex and delicate task of establishing the working climate of the organization. It seems to include the following factors which affect human relations: high standards of hiring, rewards, recognition of the dignity and worth of the individual, respect for the rights of others, involvement of employees in decision-making, willingness to delegate and to communicate, fairness and calmness in times of stress and strain.

It has been maintained that the knowledge of what executives do must be supplemented by the following before effective selection can be expected: (1) knowledge of the content of the particular position; (2) an understanding of the environment and problems of the organization. Research conducted by the Air Force<sup>45</sup> indicated that staff men were probably superior to line men in general intelligence but the

---

<sup>44</sup>Paul Holden, L. Fish, and H. Smith, Top Management Organization and Control (Palo Alto: Stanford University Press, 1941), p. 20.

<sup>45</sup>Air Force Command, Human Resources Research Center, Research Planning Conference on Objective Measurement of Motivation and Temperament (San Antonio, Texas: Lackland Air Force Base, June 1951), p. 128.

important difference was a matter of interest. Staff men desired complex intellectual work. Line men did not want to do the job themselves but wanted to direct others. It seemed that success was measured by the number of people who worked under them. Within the same general type of executive work, differences in assignments may lead to the need for different qualities. Differences in executive positions arise from type and level according to Appleby<sup>46</sup> and important dissimilarities arise from the administrative situation which an organization may face at different stages and intervals.<sup>47</sup> Providing for and nurturing an organization appeared to be an important duty of the key executive. Specialized duties may pivot upon the following sensitive human factors: technical backwardness, severe conflicts, lack of adequate supplies and equipment, loss of confidence, all of which are typical problems and require different emphasis and action.

### The College President

#### Historical Background of the Office and Title

Modern concepts of the college president emerge from a long and diverse historical development. Both the name and

---

<sup>46</sup>Appleby, op. cit., p. 45.

<sup>47</sup>E. P. Learned, "Problems of a New Executive," Harvard Business Review, 27:362-372, May 1949.

the service intimate the inheritance and survival of many academic forces, methods, and conditions.

In America the title, college president, was first conferred on Mr. Henry Dunster, in the year 1640, by the magistrates and elders of Massachusetts for Harvard College. President Dunster set both a positive and a negative precedent in that he was the first president elected and the first one discharged. For more than three centuries "president" has been the title of the top executive officer of colleges in the United States. There have, however, been other titles used in designating the head of institutions of learning; for instance, rector, chancellor, and provost.

Historically, the college president in the United States has been a preacher; among the earlier colleges there was seldom an exception to this policy. This was but natural since the paramount purpose for establishing the early colleges was to provide for an educated ministry. This trend prevailed for more than two centuries in all colleges and is still practiced in most church-related colleges. In state and independent colleges today the college president is seldom a minister.<sup>48</sup> The college dean or prominent professor is likely to be the choice of the board of trustees for president

---

<sup>48</sup> Robert C. Cook, Trustees and Presidents of American Colleges and Universities 1955-56 (Nashville: McQuiddy Printing Company, 1955), pp. 9-227.

when a vacancy occurs in independent institutions of learning. In recent years, however, a few lawyers, physicians, military leaders, and occasionally business executives have been appointed as college presidents.

There seems to exist in the minds of some people today the idea that earlier college presidents were better educated than modern college presidents. According to Donovan<sup>49</sup>, who made a study of two hundred biographies and autobiographies of college presidents, some of whom presided over institutions as far back as the seventeenth century, this concept cannot be substantiated. It is believed that a great deal depends on what estimate one has of an educated man.

Historical job analysis of the college president. The college president of the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries assumed command of the college, displayed his ability and energy as a leader and demanded the respect of the students and the general public. One of the major problems of earlier college presidents was that of enforcing discipline. This may have been the result of rigid and severe rules covering the conduct of students. The internal administration of the college seemed to be only a small part of the president's work. His over-all duties included the instruction of the senior class; his teaching load alone would be regarded today

---

<sup>49</sup>Donovan, op. cit., p. 40.

as the equivalent of a full load carried by a professor in a modern college. Another chore which fell heavily upon the shoulders of the president was the conducting of daily chapel exercises. The president was comptroller, superintendent of buildings and grounds, and the college's public relations man. What a man! Such a person today would most likely be referred to as a dictator especially since his authority was rarely, if ever, challenged and seldom resented. The president, faculty, and students of former years apparently had never heard of democracy in administration.

It is amazing how many things the presidents in former years did and how well they did them. They did not delegate for there was no one to whom to delegate. There may be some question whether earlier presidents would have known how to delegate authority, for that technique had not been developed.

Because the modern president has learned the art of delegation, the office of the president has multiplied its service and efficiency. "The modern college president has employed the techniques of business and industry; he is more of an executive, less of a preacher and teacher."<sup>50</sup> This is the greatest difference the writer has discovered between the college president of earlier periods and the college president of today.

---

<sup>50</sup>Ibid., p. 44.

The traditional college president had a venerable appearance and was much older when appointed than most college presidents are today at the time of their appointment. Earlier presidents were nearly all bearded gentlemen dressed in the cloth of the ministry. They were set apart by their dress and the lay public had no difficulty in identifying them. The college president of today has no particular distinguishing marks or peculiar characteristics.

#### Significant Characteristics of College Presidents

There was a time when the head of an institution of higher education was chosen largely on the basis of scholarship and piety. In more recent decades, it appears that he has been selected according to such criteria as public prominence (not necessarily in scholarship), administrative ability, managerial competence, and fund-raising genius.<sup>51</sup> It is undeniable that there are some good reasons why these qualities are necessary for a college president, but it seems that it is too frequently forgotten that he is the head of a faculty of specialists in various branches of knowledge. According to President Goodrich C. White<sup>52</sup> of Emory University, the fundamental function of the college president is the

---

<sup>51</sup>W. W. Brickman, "The College President's Basic Function," School and Society, 83:65, February 18, 1956.

<sup>52</sup>Goodrich C. White, "The Function of the College President," talk made before the Association of American Colleges at Louisville, Kentucky, January 10, 1956.



raising of the educational level of his institution. Dr. White advised that the college president should spend less time with fund raising and publicity experts, investment counselors, statisticians and business analysts, architects and engineers. It was further intimated that there is no real need for a college president, school superintendent, or any other type of educational executive to attempt to be a factotum. Boards of trustees who expect and demand such service are ill-advised and unrealistic. Once the college president concentrates on educational matters the standards of higher education will no doubt be raised.

Physical attributes: age, health, family. Obviously, the presidency makes many demands of physical endurance. The position calls for vigor and resilience. Coffey<sup>53</sup> set forth the truism that the president should not only be physically strong but disposed to preserve his health for the best interest of his official position.

Maturity of outlook and fruitful experience are very important; therefore, the desirable age range is from thirty-five to fifty years but the ideal age is between thirty-eight to fifty years. Optimism and ability to think and work

---

<sup>53</sup>W. C. Coffey, "Criteria Helpful in Selecting a President for a Church-Related College," Association American Colleges Bulletin, 18:353-356, Summer 1953.

successfully under rapidly changing conditions is important. Hughes<sup>54</sup> expressed an opinion that much would be gained by fixing the age of retirement of presidents definitely at sixty-five. While usually the executive is as intelligent and his judgment is as good at sixty-five as at fifty, his vigor and eagerness to hunt for trouble and straighten it out is always far less. If retirement is definitely fixed at sixty-five the trustees will feel free, a year or two before the time of retirement of the president, to begin a search for his successor.

Since the president's home is usually located on the college campus, his family should be one of his outstanding assets. His wife should be capable, in thorough sympathy with his duties and ever ready to do her share in promoting faculty and student activities.<sup>55</sup> Intellectual flexibility is an important characteristic of a college president.<sup>56</sup> Emerson boldly said, "Why should you keep your head over your shoulder? Suppose you should contradict yourself: what then?

---

<sup>54</sup>Frank L. McVey and Raymond M. Hughes, Problems of College and University Administration (Ames: The Iowa State College Press, 1952), p. 46.

<sup>55</sup>Coffey, op. cit., p. 354.

<sup>56</sup>Daniel L. Marsh, "Imperative in a College President," Association American Colleges Bulletin, 37:7-12, March 1951.



A foolish consistency is the hobgoblin of little minds

. . . ."<sup>57</sup> It is important for the president to get guiding ideals and principles clearly in mind and then to make every word and every act consistent with these ideals and principles.

A board of trustees should never be embarrassed by the limits of the president's education. College presidents have usually represented great scholars and familiarity with accumulated knowledge of the world. Ability to think clearly, to speak forcefully and to write effectively are qualifications which greatly enhance the president's prestige and influence. A president must personalize his college. He cannot fulfill this requirement unless he can use his mother tongue with precision and fluency. Always his greatest eloquence will be his sincerity. A quality which is suggested by resourcefulness, initiative, and practicality is an essential quality for the administration of a college.

It seems that practical memory is a good thing for a president to have. Successful presidents appear to often look backward while traveling forward. With a foresight made sure by a practical memory of the past, he will not be taken unawares by current conditions.

---

<sup>57</sup>Ralph Waldo Emerson, "Self Reliance," Essays (First Series; Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1903), p. 43.

Since the college president must work with academic people, it is vastly helpful if he has the professional training that makes him thoroughly familiar with the traditions and the basic professional attitudes of teachers. The doctoral degree, therefore, is desirable but not wholly essential.<sup>58</sup> It seems that it would help the president if he were a critical student of higher education with keen understanding of modern educational trends.

The college president needs to be a man of charm with an attractive and powerful personality.<sup>59</sup>

Spiritual qualities and virtues. Marsh<sup>60</sup> discussed what he felt to be imperatives in a college president. The discussion was summarized as follows:

1. Patience, the power to hang on perseveringly and uncompromisingly for the fulfillment of a plan or purpose; the power to endure with fortitude the harrowing tribulations of life, is an indispensable qualification of a college president. Eliot<sup>61</sup> listed patience as the first virtue.

2. Singleness of purpose is a requisite for a good college president.

---

<sup>58</sup>Coffey, op. cit., p. 354.

<sup>59</sup>Donovan, op. cit., p. 41.

<sup>60</sup>Marsh, op. cit., p. 7.

<sup>61</sup>Eliot, op. cit., p. 79.

3. Loyalty is the keystone in the arch of a president's influence. It is the bedrock upon which his reputation is built.

4. Physical, intellectual, and moral courage is an essential quality. The real test of courage is not in some occasional exploit; it is to be found in long-continued paralyzing discouragements and defeats.

5. Honesty is a characteristic of the successful college president. Nothing can so dilute and render worthless a president's influence as suspicion concerning the unimpeachableness of his character.

6. Fairness is a quality without which no man can long endure in the college presidency. One necessary rule for the president to follow is the Golden Rule.

7. Sympathy is a necessary quality in the fiber of a president. He must have feelers on his senses in order to be adequately tactful.

8. A sense of humor or a sense of proportion produces perspective, it saves from shame and pretense, and is a shock absorber for many unpleasant places. Its mellowing influence takes the acid out of tense situations.

9. A philosophy of life that gives poise.

#### The Job of the College Presidency

The chief executive officer of an institution of higher learning is its single most important staff member. The

actions of the president extend far beyond the physical environs of the college campus. His deeds are often used as examples and words quoted and re-quoted.

W. H. Cowley,<sup>62</sup> one-time President of Hamilton College, described his concept of the present college president. He dramatically portrayed him as one of the most burdened, harassed, most put-upon people in American life; he is a hewer of wood, a dray horse, a galley slave, a bellhop, a hock, and a nursemaid all wrapped up in one. He may seem to be the top brass of a college, but actually he spends most of his time polishing other people's brass.

The growing complexity of the president's job is noted by Cowley.<sup>63</sup> The average college president must deal with a greater range of problems and a wider variety of kinds of people than perhaps any other executive. He is expected to be an educator, a business man, an impressive speaker, an effective writer, a money-raiser, a politician, a giver-of-dinners, a charmer-at-receptions, a learned commentator on

---

<sup>62</sup>William Harold Cowley, "What Should a College President Be?" Bulletin of the Texas Technological College, 4:9-23, August 1949.

<sup>63</sup>William Harold Cowley, "The Government and Administration of Higher Education: Whence and Whither," Journal of the American Association of Collegiate Registrars, p. 486, July 1947.

public affairs, a compromiser, and popular with students, alumni, and the general public.

The late President Walter Jessup, of the State University of Iowa, once gave this facetious description of the ideal college president:

All things to all men--who will charm the prospective donor, delight students with youthfulness, demonstrate wisdom and experience to lead the faculty to make decisions with unanimity, be religious enough to suit the fundamentalist but sufficiently worldly not to outrage the bibulous alumni.<sup>64</sup>

C. W. Eliot<sup>65</sup> wrote of the college president's assignments and outlined the scope of activities as follows: The president is the chief executive officer of the college, but he should also be an inspiring leader and seer. He should be the presiding officer of the trustees, a member ex-officio of any supervisory board and presiding officer of every faculty within the college. The president's further obligation, according to Eliot, is to name all committees.

Hughes<sup>66</sup> pointed to the complexities surrounding the college presidency and stated that no complete list of his duties can be made. The president is the chief servant of

---

<sup>64</sup>Donovan, op. cit., p. 46.

<sup>65</sup>C. W. Eliot, University Administration (New York: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1908), p. 28.

<sup>66</sup>Raymond M. Hughes, A Manual for Trustees of Colleges and Universities (Ames: The Iowa State College Press, 1951), p. 15.

all and it is his duty to see that the institution is operated in conformity to the policies fixed by the board.

The detail accompanying the president's job may be illustrated by the fact that the head of one institution of higher learning found that during the first several months of one year there was a monthly average of fifteen hundred individual letters, reports, forms, and other written material requiring his personal attention.<sup>67</sup> The fact that he had to devote his personal attention to approximately sixty different written items each working day in addition to his other activities points up the volume of work surrounding the head of the college. This huge physical volume of work could imply that too much detailed material comes to the personal attention of the college president and that this material could hinder him from devoting sufficient time and thought to truly significant issues.

The duties typically assumed by, or assigned to, the college president may be considered in terms of the following areas of operations: (1) the internal administration of the college; (2) public relations and fund-raising activities; and, (3) the internal and external function of leadership.

---

<sup>67</sup>Harold Furst, "An Inquiry into University Organization and Administration" (Unpublished Ph. D. thesis, Stanford University, 1954), p. 214.

The internal administration of the college. As the chief administrative officer of the college the president is charged with the major responsibility of executing the policies which have been approved by the governing board. Dunham<sup>68</sup> indicated that good administration in the execution of policies involves the following: (1) leadership; (2) careful organization; (3) keeping accurate records; (4) carefully timed action; and (5) methods of supervision to assure not only that decisions will be properly, punctually, and efficiently carried out, but also that policies will be constantly reappraised.

Barnard<sup>69</sup> stated the ideas previously listed in different terms and described the essential executive functions as follows: (1) to provide an adequate system of communication; (2) to promote the securing of essential efforts; and (3) to formulate and define purposes.

Perhaps the most useful statement of the executive assignment may be found in Holden's<sup>70</sup> report. He described the general management or administrative function as the active planning, direction, coordination, and control of the

---

<sup>68</sup>W. B. Dunham, "The Theory and Practice of Administration," Harvard Business Review, 14:401, Summer 1936.

<sup>69</sup>C. I. Barnard, Functions of the Executive (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1938), p. 217.

<sup>70</sup>Paul Holden, L. Fish, and H. Smith, Top Management Organization and Control (Palo Alto: Stanford University Press, 1941), p. 20.

business as a whole, within the scope of the basic policies established and authority delegated by the controlling board. Among the functions which appear to fall logically within the concern of general management are as follows: (1) maintenance of a sound and effective plan of company organization, with functions, responsibilities, and limits of authority defined and properly allocated; (2) maintenance of fully qualified personnel in all management positions; (3) farsighted planning and clarification of general objectives; (4) maintenance of effective systems of control over such general activities as capital expenditures, operating expenditures and results, manpower, wages, production, and prices; (5) review and approval of major appropriations, budgets, appointments, and salary changes as provided under these systems above the limits delegated by it to divisional executives; (6) determination of general operating policies; (7) recommendations to the board of matters requiring its action; (8) general coordination of major operating plans; and (9) appraisal of divisional or departmental performance and results.

The functions previously described are those common to senior level executives in all types of organizations where as Barnard puts it, ". . . cooperation among men is conscious, deliberate, purposeful."<sup>71</sup>

---

<sup>71</sup>Barnard, op. cit., p. 14.



In addition to these duties which the college president has in common with all other top executives, he must assume certain responsibilities peculiar to the educational institution itself. Particular note should be made of the special relationship which exists between the college president and the faculty, a relationship quite dissimilar to that which exists between the corporate executive and his employees. Greater democracy in administration is a changing conception of the function of the presidency. The maintenance of good morale is a major problem. In the final analysis the president is the key man in the diplomatic service of the institution.

In an autobiography entitled, An Educational Odyssey, Henry Nelson Snyder,<sup>72</sup> who was for forty years President of Wofford College, said that his outstanding achievement as president was keeping the faculty in good humor with one another.

After his retirement from Yale, President Hadley,<sup>73</sup> reminiscing on his twenty-two years as a college president, was inclined to think that the most exhausting task of the president was that of helping his faculty members pull

---

<sup>72</sup>Henry Nelson Snyder, An Educational Odyssey (Nashville: The Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1947), p. 227.

<sup>73</sup>Donovan, op. cit., p. 49.

together instead of separately.

Henry Noble McCracken,<sup>74</sup> former president of Vassar, in his book entitled, The Hickory Limb, stated that he never succeeded in eliminating faculty tensions; ". . . some folks simply do not like others." In his final considerations, he concluded that tension is inherent in intellectual life when workers live too much to themselves.

Experience confirms the judgments of these educational statesmen. It takes a considerable amount of time to keep a faculty working together as a team, and without teamwork a college cannot make progress.

Lowell<sup>75</sup> stated that the professors in a college are not the subordinates of the president but they are his colleagues. Therefore, any analogy drawn from business and industry bearing upon the relation of the president to the teachers is liable to be grossly misleading and should be avoided. A president, though not in position to command, must be the leader if he has a pattern to carry out.

C. W. Eliot<sup>76</sup> recognized the president's constant duty as supervision. The danger to an all-inclusive supervisory

---

<sup>74</sup>Henry Noble McCracken, The Hickory Limb (New York: Scribner, 1950), p. 22.

<sup>75</sup>A. Lawrence Lowell, What A University President Has Learned (New York: The Macmillan Company, 1938), p. 45.

<sup>76</sup>Eliot, op. cit., pp. 235-238.

function was recognized, however, he wrote that the president of a college should never exercise an autocratic or one-man power; he should be an inventing and animating force, but never a ruler or autocrat.

H. L. Donovan<sup>77</sup>, President Emeritus of the University of Kentucky, stated that after twenty-eight years as a college president he could render his best service on the campus working with the faculty and students. It is not good for a college when its leader is a suit-case president.

W. W. Brickman's<sup>78</sup> inclination was that the desirable administrator is one who, competent in educational questions, recognizes expertness in his faculty and assistants and makes maximum and optimum use of their abilities toward the advancement of the educational program.

Public relations and fund-raising activities. The second area of operations for a college president leads into the broad field of public relations which includes fund-raising. In a large measure it is the president's interpreting the college to the service areas which provides the basis for assessing his total competence by those not directly associated with the college he represents.

Because the college deals with a large number of different publics the task of establishing and maintaining

---

<sup>77</sup>Donovan, op. cit., p. 45.

<sup>78</sup>Brickman, op. cit., p. 65.

cordial relations with the different groups assumes staggering proportions. The time devoted to this activity by the college president is often all out of proportion to the importance of this function in relation to the major purpose of the institution. Yet the need for support by all of the college's different publics is manifest. Perhaps more judicious planning might help to resolve the dilemma encountered at this point.

Of the on-campus groups, the students and faculty make up the major publics. One observes room for improving the relations with these groups. Donovan<sup>79</sup> expressed that the alert executive serves in the capacity of chief publicity man best if he indoctrinates every employee of the college from the janitor to the chairman of the board of trustees with his responsibilities as a medium for good public relations. A crochety campus policeman, a cranky, rude secretary, a disgruntled, cantankerous professor, or a pompous, conceited administrator can destroy more good-will for a college in a day than a public relations man can build up in many days. Throughout history there has been a consciousness of the need of good-will for higher education, but there is evidence that this consciousness is more acute than at any time in the past.

Of the off-campus groups having relations with the college, the alumni typically represent both the most important

---

<sup>79</sup>Donovan, op. cit., p. 48.

and the most vocal. Furst<sup>80</sup> suggested that the president should channel most of his relationships with this group through the organized association of alumni.

The other groups of major importance to the college are parents, and for state-supported colleges, the legislature. In the case of the former, most of the contacts are made on a personal basis and it appears that little can be done to effectively relieve the president of this burden. In the latter case, the relations are commonly handled through the institution's legislative representative with the president's involvement being held to a minimum. This part of the president's public relations program might well be expanded.

It should not be overlooked that any contact made by the president outside of the institution's official family represents a part of his public relations program and on this basis must be approached cautiously. It is particularly important that the president confine his public speaking to matters directly related to higher education or to the institution he represents. The president should not spearhead a movement completely unrelated to the higher education movement and neither should he permit himself to be led into making statements on matters clearly outside of an educator's field of interest and competence. He should participate

---

<sup>80</sup>Furst, op. cit., p. 218.

actively in matters relating to the higher education movement and eschew almost all other movements.

An important aspect of the public relations program relates to the fund-raising activities of the college. The president should appropriately lead the campaign, but this does not mean that he must personally conduct the entire campaign. Whether the fund drive is aimed at a special group, like the alumni or the legislature, the pattern should be the same.

While an institution can never be completely removed from the fund-raising process his role should be kept to a minimum else the job of a college president will develop more and more into that of a fund-raiser with corresponding reduction of time and ability to be devoted to the most important of his three functions, namely, that of providing educational leadership. In 1951, Henry J. Long spent two days on each campus of each of the forty colleges visited while interviewing 350 college administrators. Mr. Long found that the general concept of the college president was that he was a money-raiser.<sup>81</sup>

The internal and external function of leadership. In the final analysis, it seems that the college president is expected to furnish his college and the nation with inspiration

---

<sup>81</sup>Henry J. Long, "Why College Presidents?" Association American Colleges Bulletin, 37:379-382, October 1951.

and educational leadership. This task of the president is performed outside of the area bounded by administrative principles. In the position of inspirer and leader the president creates the conditions so that all who come in contact with him will see the vision of a more civilized world with education winning the race with catastrophe.

The unique position occupied by a president of a college brings to the holder a prestige level which he can attain under no other set of circumstances. The words he utters as a college president take on added importance. It is the president, above all others, who should be leading the community toward a broader understanding of the aims and goals of higher education; he is in the best position to turn aside the barks and scoffs sometimes directed at the college. It is of special importance in the light of today's political climate where academic freedom is constantly under inquiry, that the inspiration for higher achievement be given to the scholars, students, and, in fact, the world. Only the president of the college is fitted for this task. Brickman<sup>82</sup> stated that once the college president concentrates on educational matters, the standards of higher education will be raised.

The weight of the leadership function is so great it is surprising that so little attention is paid to it in the

---

<sup>82</sup>Brickman, op. cit., p. 65.



process of selecting a college president! At a second glance, this situation becomes easier to understand when one realizes that the academic concept of leadership typically relates to pre-eminence. That is, one is often described as being a leader in his field when in reality the speaker refers to the pre-eminent position occupied by the particular person under consideration. The emphasis upon pre-eminence is carried over by the faculty in its relations with the governing board during the process of selecting a president. As a result, the desirable qualities of potential leadership, vision, and administrative ability are often minimized in the selection process.

The literature indicates that a college should not select as its president one who presents only a sound administrative background as his qualification. Some educators feel that recent appointments of military leaders to positions of top leadership in colleges is a manifestation of the idea of trained administrators carried to its ultimate conclusion. Such a series of appointments appears to overlook the significant role played by the followers in any situation of leadership.<sup>83</sup> A president, in order to be an effective leader, must understand fully the context within which he will operate

---

<sup>83</sup>Roger W. Holmes, "Faculty Participation in Selecting a College President," American Association University Professors Bulletin, 43:598-604, December 1957.



and have the support of those whom he is to lead. A president who cannot lead and therefore must direct and drive cannot long be effective in this important academic position.

The indications are clear that an area for more fruitful research would be more inquiries into the backgrounds of college presidents. Such studies would present to future selection committees more bases upon which they might build their own search.

It has been the history of higher education in this country to have pressures exerted on it periodically by individuals or groups who wish to control its unique freedom of thought and the teaching of its professors. These attacks occur more frequently today than in the earlier history. This is probably because propaganda is now recognized as a powerful weapon in influencing public opinion and gaining power. In the case of church-related colleges, attacks frequently come from ecclesiastical bodies, bishops, and religious organizations. Public colleges more frequently suffer these pressures from politicians. Recently, "witch-hunters" have attacked professors in both public and private institutions. The brunt of these attacks falls upon the president, for he is the front man at the entrance of the college. He must, with dignity, squelch perennial attackers and refuse any demand that would jeopardize or compromise his college. If worst comes to worst, he must go to the

public for vindication, and if he is aggressive enough he will win his fight. The president who does not have some fights is usually a poor administrator.<sup>84</sup>

One of the major problems facing a college president is in the allocation of his own time to the different functions assigned to, or assumed by him. Sammartino<sup>85</sup> says that the problem of arranging a time schedule has not yet been solved by many academic administrators. The key to the solution, thus far overlooked, relates to the administrator being available for conversation and consultation as distinct from being available for supervision. It is entirely proper that in a college the staff have access to the president but it is quite inappropriate for the same staff members to look to the president for direct supervision.

Lowell<sup>86</sup> pointed out that the president can divest himself of much of the supervisory responsibility by delegating all but the authority to coordinate to his functional assistants. Just as the governing board delegates operational authority to him, so should he delegate this authority to his subordinates.

---

<sup>84</sup>Donovan, op. cit., p. 47.

<sup>85</sup>Peter Sammartino, The President of a Small College (Rutherford: Fairleigh Dickinson College Press, 1954), p. 28.

<sup>86</sup>Lowell, op. cit., p. 20.

### The College Governing Board

Primarily on the basis of the legal position it occupies, the activities of a college governing board are of utmost importance in the development of an institution of higher learning. Its actions can be for good or evil. Negative contributions by governing boards to American higher education can be reduced and held to a minimum only through the careful selection and appointment of able and conscientious men to the boards.

The character of the governing board is determined by the character of the individuals appointed to the board. From his own experience, C. W. Eliot<sup>87</sup> described the successful type of board member as one highly educated, public-spirited, business or professional man, who takes a strong interest in educational and social problems, and believes in higher education as the source of enlightenment and progress for all stages of education. Good judgment is one of the most important qualities in the make-up of a board member.

The task of finding men who meet these specifications and who would be willing to serve as board members would appear to be formidable. Hughes<sup>88</sup> pointed out, however, that enlisting these men into the service is not too difficult because they also recognize that no public trust today is more

---

<sup>87</sup>Eliot, op. cit., p. 2.

<sup>88</sup>Hughes, op. cit., p. 162.

important than the trusteeship of the American college and no service is more rewarding.

Lowell<sup>89</sup> anticipated some of the pressures which are brought to bear in connection with the make-up of governing boards. He sounded a note of warning by saying that experts should not be members of a non-professional body that supervises experts.

Another factor affecting the quality of the board's activities is the actual size of the board. E. C. Elliott<sup>90</sup> noted extreme differences in the sizes of many college boards. While the ideal size has not yet been determined, the consensus of opinions in the literature seems to favor a board with fewer than ten members.<sup>91</sup> Eliot<sup>92</sup> stated that the best number of members for a college governing board is seven. Hughes<sup>93</sup> suggested that probably the ideal board would have seven to twelve members. Deferrari<sup>94</sup> wrote that a small board from five to nine members is preferable.

---

<sup>89</sup>A. L. Lowell, A War with Academic Traditions in America (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1934), p. 286.

<sup>90</sup>E. C. Elliott, "The Board of Control," in Higher Education in America edited by R. A. Kent (New York: Ginn and Company, 1930), p. 610.

<sup>91</sup>Furst, op. cit., p. 202.

<sup>92</sup>Eliot, op. cit., p. 3.

<sup>93</sup>Hughes, op. cit., p. 8.

<sup>94</sup>Roy J. Deferrari, College Organization and Administration (Washington: Catholic University of America Press, 1947), p. 66.

To the degree American institutions of higher education follow the organizational pattern of American business, the college's governing board will be composed of either seven or nine members.\*

It is interesting to observe that implicit in the establishment of the optimum size of a governing board is the note that disagreement is bound to follow and therefore an odd number must be set. This approach overlooks two important facts. In the first place, there is no substantial basis to assume that if the board is composed of reasonable men they will not come to an agreement on broad issues after studying all the facts. In the second place, if there is to be disagreement, it is short-sighted to have one vote determine the course of action because the issues with which the board should properly concern itself are too important to be decided by a single vote. Were the board composed of an even number of persons, any disagreement would be resolved on the basis of more than a bare majority. Furthermore, the appointment of an even number to the board carries with it an assumption that there will be agreement rather than disagreement, and this positive approach could bring mutual results

---

\*The findings of the National Industrial Conference Board survey of 254 manufacturing companies indicated a bimodal distribution with 19 per cent favoring a seven-man board and 16 per cent favoring a nine-man board. The entire report is contained in The Corporate Directorship, National Industrial Conference Board, Inc., New York, 1953.

in the college. It is felt that the board sets the pattern for the total relationships within the institution. If the board sets an example of harmonious relationships, it may well be expected that this influence will infiltrate, to some degree, through all other levels of the college.

In determining the optimum size of a board one is faced with two conflicting viewpoints. The first asserts that the board's function is mainly administrative, and that the board's organization should aim toward furthering this function. The second acknowledges the importance of the administrative function but at the same time takes the stand that a role of greater importance is that of bringing wider support to the institution. The former encourages the establishment of a small board. The latter view calls for the creation of a large board.

Accompanying the selection of large boards should be the appointment of a small number of its members to an executive committee empowered to act for the general board. In order for the board's decision to be fully effectuated there should be but one administrative officer responsible to the board and that should be the chief officer.<sup>95</sup> As a control device the board should insure that it provides explicitly for the opportunity of appraising all persons who make up the

---

<sup>95</sup>Furst, op. cit., p. 205.

senior administrative officers. The appearance of administrative officers before the board would be at the discretion of either the board or the president. An accepted practice calls for the appearance of these officers at the time matters relating to their own field of specialty are to be discussed.

To be completely effective the board must meet with sufficient frequency to be able to cope successfully with all matters appropriate to its level of operation. Hughes<sup>96</sup> stated that the ideal board should meet from four to ten times a year. E. C. Elliott<sup>97</sup> wrote that the assignment of work to the special care of a committee is provocative of two of the weaknesses of boards of control as they are presently organized. In the first place, the general board ceases to function consistently as a whole with the inevitable result that too great reliance comes to be placed upon a small section of the membership of the board. Secondly, industrious and ambitious committees are often responsible for the failure of many boards of control to observe the all-important difference between those things which belong to the government of the college and those which fall in the province of administration.

---

<sup>96</sup>Hughes, op. cit., p. 8.

<sup>97</sup>Elliott, op. cit., p. 619.



Hughes<sup>98</sup> suggested that the ideal board should maintain committees on finance, buildings, education and faculty. E. C. Elliott<sup>99</sup> wrote that there is rarely a reason for more than four permanent committees, such as finance, physical plant, educational policy, and faculty-student relations.

The duties of the board are clear. The board has the ultimate responsibility for the effective utilization of the resources, human, physical, and financial which are available to the college. The board serves best by participating in the policy-making process, adding the assurance of securing most effective operations and guiding the long-range educational, research, and financial plans of the college. Holden<sup>100</sup> pointed out that in business meetings the board establishes policies, handles major financial matters, selects the officers and sets their salaries, and takes care of other matters of similar character. It receives reports from the management on operations since the last meeting, passes judgment as to whether, in view of the circumstances, the results are satisfactory. This statement of functions need not be confined to a business enterprise as it represents the essence of the governing board's function in a college.

---

<sup>98</sup>Hughes, op. cit., p. 8.

<sup>99</sup>Elliott, op. cit., p. 619.

<sup>100</sup>Holden, op. cit., p. 17.



Hughes<sup>101</sup> spelled out the functions of the board in more detail. In addition to determining the policies of the college, three functions of the trustees which are usually fixed in the laws governing the college are as follows: (1) the trustees hold title to all property and are the custodians of all property; (2) the trustees are responsible for the appointment of the chief executive officer of the college; and (3) the trustees constitute the final court of appeal for complainants.

Hughes<sup>102</sup> said that the board should formulate, record, and from time to time modify policies and hold the president responsible for administering the policies that are set up by the board. Lubbers<sup>103</sup> took issue with Hughes' statement and said that the board of trustees should not initiate any policy but should take legislative action on policies that are proposed by the college community.

#### Chapter Summary

Chapter II reviewed the literature to show what conceptions of the executive were expressed. The chapter

---

<sup>101</sup>Hughes, op. cit., p. 12.

<sup>102</sup>Ibid., p. 43.

<sup>103</sup>I. J. Lubbers, College Organization and Administration (Evanston: Northwestern University School of Education, 1932), p. 54.

contains an overview of three areas, namely; (1) the executive in industry; (2) the college president; and (3) the college governing board.

The executive and the college president were traced through the years and an historical view indicated that ideas surrounding the top leader have always been powerful forces. Ever-changing and broadening concepts of the top leader accelerated the evolution of leadership as a medium of service. As a result, the new concept of the top leader seems to have shifted to a more professionalized leadership. It seemed that the ideas that were held about the nature of the key leader and his method of functioning determined to a great degree the practices of selection. It is believed that the new concept accentuates the need for advanced procedures for identifying and evaluating potential executives and the need for systematic patterns to help insure effective selection.

Attention was given to qualifications to be desired in the executive. Significant characteristics, as portrayed in literature, were also presented. Many opinions were expressed as to specific qualifications and characteristics but there was evidence of disagreement in the area as to the importance of some factors. Good health, outstanding intellectual qualities, pleasing personality traits, and extensive experience seemed to be prerequisites to successful executive leadership. The literature seemed to establish

that the effective executive must possess sharply differing abilities and the know-how to assume many roles.

The importance of the executive's job was recognized but there seemed to be few studies which attempted to analyze top jobs. Perhaps more studies which reveal detailed specifications for top jobs would be profitable.

Chapter II concluded with a look at the college governing board. It was observed that the character of the board of control is determined by the character of the individuals appointed to the board.

## CHAPTER III

### TOP EXECUTIVE SELECTION IN INDUSTRY

#### Introduction

The preceding chapter reviewed the literature and traced the development of concepts of top leaders. It is believed that the various points of view that were revealed in the literature are related to the function of selection.

Chapter III proposes to examine, analyze, and appraise four formal programs of selection which are found in industry in an attempt to present a view of the basic patterns of executive selection. The programs of selection which are included in this chapter are experiments in selection which are now being conducted in the following corporations: General Electric Company, Radio Corporation of America, Union Carbide Nuclear Company, and Sears Roebuck Company. The programs of selection were chosen because of the following reasons:

(1) each of the programs have formalized procedures which focus attention on top-level leadership selection; (2) each of the programs employ a variety of devices to identify and to evaluate potential executives; (3) the programs are being used by foremost companies in their respective fields; and (4) the programs were selected because they represented more than a decade's experience in top-level leadership evaluation

and selection. The four programs of selection were developed by companies which ranked fifth, twenty-third, and twenty-ninth among the five hundred largest industrial corporations, as to sales and profits, in the United States in 1957.

The main purpose of this chapter is to give an abridged account of the four programs of selection and to attempt to point up prominent patterns of executive selection in industry which may enable the writer to indicate basic patterns of selection which appear to be of value in organizing a formal program of selection that may be used when selecting a college president. The programs of selection which are presented in this study do not have identical patterns neither do they fit a pre-arranged plan of the study. No attempt is made to indicate what is believed to be the best selection practices, policies, or over-all programs. This study simply proposes that an insight into the backgrounds, scopes, tools, objectives, methods, and processes of selection contained in the formal programs will be of value in the development of a basic framework of pilot patterns for effective top leadership selection in higher education.

Data on the formal programs of selection were collected through: (1) a review of available literature relative to this area; (2) personal interviews with industrial managers and specialists in personnel; (3) documentary materials; and (4) through correspondence with chief personnel officers of

the four programs of selection who supplied materials about their respective programs.

The planned programs of selection which are supported by experimentation appear to offer the most desirable basis for developing a framework of pilot patterns for the selection of college presidents. The four programs considered in this investigation have been in use for a decade or more. It is felt, therefore, that the patterns of selection rest upon a basis of tested understandings.

An overview of the four programs of leadership selection indicates that the sponsoring industries have taken noticeable interest in executive leadership selection and are now carrying on experimentation in this area. The growth and diversification of the four corporations who are using the formal programs of top leadership selection is self-evident and the corporations concede that the progress is related to the amount and quality of top leadership selection efforts.

An assumption was made in Chapter I that is basic to this phase of the discussion. The assumption stated that findings related to executive selection in industry were valid evidence for determining patterns for the selection of college presidents. The application of this belief would require that a description of organized programs of selection that were cited should emphasize general patterns of selection rather than a mere listing of specific and unrelated

activities. An analysis of the programs of selection and a synthesis of the findings should assist in integrating the patterns into a framework of pilot patterns and should help in relating the basic patterns to essential elements within the over-all selection process. Although it is not a primary purpose of this study, it is believed that the formal programs of selection will focus attention on the fact that delicate human relationships are a major factor in effecting a program of selection. Further, it is believed that formal programs of selection will involve principles that are basic to the democratic way of life.

#### A Guide to Selection Methods

The four programs of selection indicate that the field of selection methods is a complex one. It is the intent of this section to provide guidance over a course where non-professional people may easily lose their way. The methods of selection are included in this treatment because: (1) an analysis of the assumptions underlying the methods seems to indicate a degree of soundness; (2) the methods have been found useful in occupational fields; or (3) the methods have been found to be desirable on the basis of informal evaluation of results or a quantitative determination of the correlation between job performance and ratings on the method used. Unfortunately, very few of the selection methods have

fully conformed to the standards of an adequate validation study. This section, therefore, will attempt to be a guide to a few of the common methods and is not to be understood to be a compendium to be followed.

It is felt that obtaining empirical evidence of the value of a selection method is the surest way to progress. The employment of selection methods based largely on informal opinion, it is believed, broadens the way for the continued recurrence of predominant fads and fashions in selection. The formal programs of selection in industry indicate that many aspects of selection thrive in an atmosphere of experimentation. The use of unvalidated practices, according to the four programs of selection have been perpetuated no longer than more advanced methods and procedures could be discovered.

The programs of selection indicate that certain methods and techniques of selection are useful for assessing knowledge, intellectual abilities, and personality characteristics but that the selection decision should not be based solely upon results acquired in this manner. The specialists in personnel who are connected with the formal programs point up that because of the intermingling of the desirable qualities, the measurement of any one of these areas results in the indirect measurement of the other. For example, it has been contended that a high rating during an intensive interview which



involved the use of the critical incident technique indicates intelligence, training, insights, philosophical theory, and such characteristics as persistence, good work habits, and the motivation to master a complex field.

No attempt will be made here to relate specific methods of selection to particular qualifications which are discussed in Chapter II.

#### A Point of View Regarding Selection Devices

It is not to be understood that the following section represents an exhaustive index of selection devices. The devices for selection are discussed because they appear to be used in the four formal programs of selection which were chosen for this study.

Numerous measuring devices for selection purposes can be found in the programs of selection but their use and value have not been completely validated. The selection devices may be helpful by giving clues but there seems to be little assurance that the conclusions of any single device can have practical value. The structure of the programs of selection indicate that top leadership positions vary in duties and that various patterns of performance emerge. It appears that there are so many variables and uncertain conditions to be considered that a careful exploration of the success of any one device may produce more skepticism than real confidence.

This is not intended to mean, however, that tests and other selection devices should be avoided if they can be applied experimentally and the results of their application followed up.

### A Review and Analysis of Selection Devices

No attempt has been made to relate any of the selection devices to a particular executive selection program. An attempt has been made to define the usefulness of each method so that persons interested in the development of a particular program can themselves determine what methods are relevant and appropriate in the particular environment in which the methods will be used.

#### Biographical Information Blank

The Biographical Information Blank is a written document which asks specific questions about the background of the prospective candidate. It was originally developed for use in industry but it was later adopted by the military forces which found it to be one of the most useful selection devices. The questionnaire seems to be a direct measure of interests and an indirect measure of personality. The items concentrate on those parts of the family, work, school, and social environment which are related to the formation of personality. The Biographical Information Blank has high

value generally because of its intrinsic validity and because it measures in a more simple way characteristics either not measured or which are measured expensively by other devices. Its defect is the considerable research needed to validate it for particular jobs in particular organizations. Guilford and Comprey<sup>1</sup> concluded that biographical data seemed to have limited promise for the selection of school administrators. It has been pointed out that The Biographical Information Blank is a potentially dangerous selection method because it may tend to perpetuate stereotypes by emphasizing what is, rather than what needs to be. Nevertheless, because of its basic value, despite the involvement of much time and expense of preparation, it appears to be a significant part of a thorough executive program of selection.

### Measures of Interest and Personality

In view of the wide variety of qualifications discussed in the previous chapter, measures of interest and personality can play important roles in executive selection.

#### The Agency Organization, Personnel, and Policy Test.

The Agency Organization, Personnel, and Policy Test is a written test in multiple-choice form. It contains simple,

---

<sup>1</sup>J. P. Guilford and Andrew L. Comprey, "Prediction of Proficiency of Administrative Personnel from Personal-History Data," Educational and Psychological Measurement, 8:281-295, Autumn 1948.

factual items dealing with the organizational structure, key personnel and administrative policies of a given organization and is structured in such a way that the questions avoid technicalities which require special training in order to answer them. Because of its deliberate arrangement, the hypothesis proposes that the test measures interest primarily in the components of administration yet its nature prohibits its use as an instrument for recruitment outside the given organization. Uhrbrock<sup>2</sup> discussed the basis for constructing the test and indicated that special forms were needed for each company. The questions should be framed in accordance with the desired level of selection with due caution observed in regard to the preparation of questions on policy so as to avoid delving into areas relating to personal welfare and special interests instigated by the desire to protect petty individual rights and professional development or reputation. Social psychologists have demonstrated that facts are remembered that support attitudes. The hypothesis of this test is correlated with the assumption that information is obtained and retained in direct relationship to interests. Mandell

---

<sup>2</sup>Richard Uhrbrock, "Item Analysis: The Basis for Constructing a Test for Forecasting Supervisory Ability," Personnel Journal, 12:141-154, January 25, 1933.

and Adkins<sup>3</sup> discovered, after studying employees in two Federal agencies, that The Agency Organization, Personnel, and Policy Test was a promising measure for selecting administrators from among technicians. It appears that the assumptions underlying this selection device must be understood in order to obtain the full value of the test.

Allport-Vernon Study of Values. The Allport-Vernon Study of Values provides scores on theoretical, economic, political, social, aesthetic, and religious scales. The relative simplicity of administration and scoring indicate the plausibility of including it in executive selection programs. It should always be remembered that no one pattern of scores is desirable for all top positions. Thurstone's large study of the Allport-Vernon in Federal administrative work obtained significant results with the theoretical, economic, and social scales, the social scale being by far the most significant.

Strong Vocational Interest Blank. The Strong Vocational Interest Blank is the most widely used and best known of all methods for measuring interests. It would seem that Strong's one basic finding, the undesirability of a very high level of interests in a professional or technical field,

---

<sup>3</sup>Milton M. Mandell and Dorothy C. Adkins, "The Validity of Written Tests for the Selection of Administrative Personnel," Educational and Psychological Measurement, 6:293-312, Autumn 1946.

is so important that, despite the length, its use is justified in those cases where quality of results, rather than quickness or cheapness of methods is the primary objective. Knauf<sup>4</sup> found that the Interest Blank showed promise for selection on two groups of managers.

### Personality Inventories

There are meager published data which indicate directly that these inventories are valid for executive selection. There seems to be no doubt that the factors they attempt to measure are related to top leadership success, but conclusive evidence of their ability to measure these factors in a valid way is not available.

Written questionnaires. One method of measuring personality involves the use of a written questionnaire form which asks direct questions concerning the behavior, the problems, the likes and dislikes of the individual. The answers are summarized into scores on several aspects of personality. The Bernreuter Personality Inventory, The Minnesota Multiphasic, The California Psychological Inventory, The Guilford, The Humm-Wadsworth, The Thurstone Temperament Schedule, and The Jurgensen are all well known tests. Critics of these inventories have decried written questionnaires as follows:

---

<sup>4</sup>E. B. Knauf, "Vocational Interests and Managerial Success," Journal of Applied Psychology, 35:160-163, June 1951.

(1) candidates are misled by ambiguous questions; (2) answers given may be incorrect because of conscious or unconscious attempts to present the best possible picture; (3) the categories used for describing the scores are not psychologically meaningful as indicated by the low relationships between different inventories on the same or related categories; and (4) the scoring keys used are not representative of normal individuals because the keys appear to be based on psychotic and highly neurotic individuals.<sup>5</sup> Jensen and Rotter<sup>6</sup> concluded from a value study of thirteen psychological tests that findings indicated that such methods were invalid for selecting officer candidates.

Supervisory Attitudes Test. The Supervisory Attitudes Test is related to personality inventories and to projective techniques. The test is composed of a number of items which attempt to elicit responses to the following code: strongly agree, agree, undecided or uncertain, disagree, or strongly disagree. Mandell<sup>7</sup> described this test in detail and

---

<sup>5</sup>William H. Whyte, "The Fallacies of Personality Testing," Fortune, 50:117-121, 204-208, April 1954.

<sup>6</sup>Milton B. Jensen and Julian B. Rotter, "The Value of Thirteen Psychological Tests in Officer Candidate Screening," Journal of Applied Psychology, 31:315, June 1947.

<sup>7</sup>Milton M. Mandell, "Supervisor's Attitudes and Job Performance," Personnel, 26:182-183, June 1949.



indicated that the supervisory attitudes test can contribute to effective selection.

Projective techniques. The wide development and use of projective techniques is an interesting trend in the field of personality evaluation. The clinical psychologists consider these techniques as indispensable tools in the study of personality. In considering the ink blots of the Rorschach Test, the pictures of The Thematic Apperception Test, or the beginnings of sentences in the incomplete sentences test, the basic technique is to present an unstructured or ambiguous problem to the individual. The Rorschach and The Thematic Apperception Test stimulate oral response to what is seen and to what has occurred. The incomplete sentences test attempts to capture what first comes into the mind. Because the situation that is presented is ambiguous in meaning, it is assumed that what the person sees or says reflects his personal problems, his needs, attitudes, worries, and anxieties. It is believed that these techniques obtain interesting information yet they seem to have been applied to counseling rather than to selecting leaders. Although they have been applied to selection in relatively limited groups, their real value is unproved, and also because of the expense of these methods as compared with other devices, their value would have to be appreciable to compensate for their cost when used in educational selection programs where operational funds are already limited.



### The Oral Interview

A primary assumption underlying this method of selection seems to be that before a candidate is employed the employee should see him and observe his actions. Most employment agencies consider any selection program which does not include a personal interview inadequate on prima facie grounds.

Arguments for and against the personal interview. It is to be noted that basic problems arise from the fact that the interview, when poorly conducted, involves the making of unwarranted inferences from limited data which are obtained in an artificial situation by incompetent observers. Control of each of these four deficiencies is the road to progress in improving the interview. Basing his statement on extensive observation of the interview method as actually conducted in American industry, Bradshaw<sup>8</sup> said that the selecting process in most companies consists of measuring applicants against vague, unformulated standards. As he observed, the interview was largely unplanned and conducted by persons with little knowledge or practice in the interview technique. As a result of a review and keen analysis of available studies of the interview, Wagner<sup>9</sup> concluded: (1) confusion exists as to what

---

<sup>8</sup>F. F. Bradshaw, Developing Men for Controllershship (Boston: Graduate School of Business Administration, Harvard University, 1950), pp. 41-42.

<sup>9</sup>Ralph Wagner, "The Employment Interview: A Critical Summary," Personnel Psychology, 2:42-43, Spring 1949.

can and cannot be accomplished by the interview; (2) research on the interview method is needed; (3) the interview remains popular as a selection procedure despite its questionable reliability; (4) an interview should be conducted according to a standardized form; (5) the validity and reliability of the interview may be highly specific both to the situation and to the interviewer; (6) there seem to be two trends in the prevailing attitude toward the interview: (a) factors which were formerly measured in the interview can be more adequately handled by other means, and (b) the interview can be valid if all information which can be obtained on the candidate is taken into consideration and weighed properly. This pessimistic viewpoint is primarily based on the interview as it is generally conducted. There may be some inherent disadvantages to the personal interview, resulting from its brief duration and artificial character, nevertheless, there are many advantages that can be realized by better planning and organization, improved training of raters, a clear understanding based on careful research of what can and cannot be measured in an interview.<sup>10</sup> The main value of the interview for executive selection at the present time seems to be its usefulness in giving the applicant information about the job and working

---

<sup>10</sup>S. H. Newman, J. M. Bobbit, D. C. Cameron, "The Reliability of the Interview Method in an Officer Candidate Evaluation Program," American Psychologist, 1:103-109, April 1946.

conditions and it affords the employer an opportunity to evaluate the candidate's verbal fluency, his sense of humor, his social acceptability and his reasons for interest in the particular type of work offered. It would appear that some type of oral interview, individual or group, is the most popular selection device. At the same time because the process is essentially subjective, it represents the greatest problem in attempts at improvement. In any case, the interview is an indispensable part of the selection program, providing as it does an opportunity for seeing the whole person in action. How high a validity can be obtained, if every possible improvement is made, still remains to be determined.

#### Evaluation of Actual Behavior

Evaluating personality characteristics is always a difficult task because of an inherent weakness embodied in two basic disadvantages, namely, (1) they are artificial in character in that they judge the person away from his natural habitat, office, home, friends, or colleagues; (2) since the evaluation is of a brief duration, they are subject to momentary changes that may be unrepresentative of the individual. These observations could indicate that it is highly probable that the feat of obtaining correct information on a person's actual behavior in various situations and evaluating this information properly is the most desirable of all methods of personality evaluation.

The qualifications investigation. This procedure involves obtaining from present and former employees, colleagues, and other appropriate people, their description and evaluation of the behavior and performance of the candidate being considered for the executive position. This is accomplished by personal interview. While few validation data are available, the assumptions behind the qualifications investigation seem to justify it as a sound method for the evaluation of the personality characteristics described earlier in this study. Williams and Leavitt<sup>11</sup> indicated that ratings by colleagues were found to be the most valid among all methods surveyed for predicting combat leadership ability. Bingham<sup>12</sup> described the advantages of cumulative records for the purpose of identifying future executive leadership from among employees if specific instances of unusual behavior indicative of abilities sought would be noticed and consistently recorded in a central office. Bryce<sup>13</sup> observed that eminent men make enemies, and give their enemies more assailable points than

---

<sup>11</sup>Stanley B. Williams and Harold J. Leavitt, "Group Opinion as a Prediction of Military Leadership," Journal of Consulting Psychology, 11:283-291, November-December 1947.

<sup>12</sup>Walter Van Dyke Bingham, Administrative Ability, Its Discovery and Development (Washington: Society for Personnel Administration, 1939), p. 72.

<sup>13</sup>James Bryce, The American Commonwealth (New York: Macmillan Company, 1931), p. 78.

obscure men. Perhaps this explains the frequency with which undistinguished people are selected for executive jobs. How to resolve this paradox is a concern of this study.

### Tests of Ability, Knowledge, and Judgment

Tests of mental ability have been discounted by many research studies as a sound basis for the selection of top leaders. Intelligence tests appear to be more objectionable devices for senior executive selection. The administrative judgment test, a multiple-choice instrument, attempts to measure broad understandings of the processes of administration and has been validated in a number of studies.<sup>14</sup> A modified form of this test could be interjected into the individual or group interview.

### An Examination and Analysis of Four Formal Programs of Selection

The formal programs of selection which receive treatment in this section of the study were developed in industry by the following corporations: General Electric, Radio Corporation of America, Union Carbide Nuclear Company, and Sears Roebuck Company. A premise which is fundamental to each program of selection is that the program of selection must be

---

<sup>14</sup>Milton M. Mandell, "The Administrative Judgment Test," Journal of Applied Psychology, 34:145-147, June 1950.

so structured as to implement a basic operational philosophy. The programs reveal definite procedures which are followed in making selections. The objective of each program is to insure that top positions in the companies will be filled effectively and efficiently.

Data dealt with in this section of the study were acquired through: (1) correspondence with personnel officers in the central office of each respective corporation whose program of selection was used in this investigation; (2) from available literature which dealt with the programs of selection; and (3) from documentary materials.

On the evidence presented, it is believed that generalizations may be made about patterns of selection as they are revealed in the selected programs. The four programs of selection were chosen somewhat arbitrarily, therefore, various tenets of the programs overlap. The selection practices reveal definite broad patterns. They also reflect the individuality of problems and approaches that might be expected of a diversified group of big companies.

#### The General Electric Selection Program

The General Electric Company is a large, diversified company operating under a managerial philosophy of decentralization. This point of view places much of the lower-echelon decision making as a responsibility of the managers of the

company's various decentralized components.<sup>15</sup> It has been pointed up that the giant company recognizes the importance of a planned over-all method of selecting key men. It is felt that the concern is clearly illustrated in the program of selection. General Electric has indicated that the company views the top leader as a complex focal point in the management team. It appears that the philosophy of the company's central office has infiltrated throughout each segment of the company. The over-all program of selection and scheme of promotion seem to have been contributing factors to the achievements of the company. It is also contended that the program of selection contributes to job satisfaction and morale.

The attempt to eliminate costly pitfalls in top management selection gave birth to the Comprehensive General Electric Selection Program. Initial aspects of the work on the selection program were conducted by a group-problem-solving team representing the central service staff, personnel managers from operating components and consultants from the Industrial Division of The Psychological Corporation. After intensive investigations, a structured plan was designed to employ validated principles of selection in a systematic, effective manner.

---

<sup>15</sup>Letter from F. E. Baker, Manager, Public and Employee Relations Personnel Development and Administration Service of General Electric Company, New York, to Dr. John W. Gilliland and R. Leonard Carroll, dated July 23, 1958.



The comprehensive General Electric Selection Program consists of four basic steps: (1) accurately determine job specifications; (2) carefully and clearly identify potential candidates; (3) evaluate the candidates; and (4) make the selection decision. A prime objective was to promote a plan that could be understood by anyone selecting an individual for a top position. Another concern was to more nearly insure that the important task of top selection be performed according to a recommended pattern. It was discovered that the preoccupation of the average line manager with immediate operating details hindered the function of effective selection, therefore, the job of top selection was delegated to the personnel group who would have sufficient time to develop necessary details and where chosen individuals could be adequately trained to perform the task of selection efficiently and effectively.

An examination of the dimensions of the General Electric Selection Program reveals a uniform procedure for the selection of key personnel in a series of steps that could be adapted to various selection situations.

Determine job specifications. One of the most frequented pitfalls for committees entrusted with selection is to employ a top leader before an analysis has been made of the job which is to be performed. One of General Electric's basic tools in selection is a simple and abbreviated form



which arranges the basic requirements of a specific job and data which appear essential for selecting the candidate who can best perform the tasks.

Identify potential candidates. General Electric attempts to predict the future needs of the company in order that adequate time may be devoted to the careful screening of potential candidates. Extensive cumulative files on the prospective candidates reduce the complexity of the selection details. Qualifications of prospective executives may be revealed in a relatively brief time. The General Electric Program of Selection employs the following methods of nominating potential candidates for future consideration: (1) managers may make recommendations from the unit at large; (2) the present key person may make nominations; (3) other top members of the management team may make nominations; and (4) candidates may be self-nominated. By centering the process of identifying candidates in the central personnel department a complete list of qualified prospects may be developed and adequate consideration may be given to all candidates. The process also helps in eliminating the hesitancy to cross organizational lines.

Evaluate the candidates. Data regarding each nominee's abilities may be gathered from the following sources:

1. The personnel records. A complete personnel

folder is maintained. The complete records are not to be copied when evaluating a candidate. All that is necessary is a summarization of significant information in the form of a note. If the evaluator discovers revealing data that is pertinent to the case and which is not called for on the form, a notation of such information is made on the report.

2. References. The reference check may reveal important clues even if it is difficult to obtain factual information from former employees.

3. Job performance. Performance on the job may be checked through interviews with former superiors and colleagues.

4. Psychological tests. General Electric employs tests in an attempt to evaluate ability to fulfill job specifications. Data from tests are not substitutes for other measures of evaluation but it is felt that the test results add meaningfully to information that is gained through other sources.

5. The intensive interview. The final phase of evaluation centers around an intensive interview with the candidate. This interview is very impressive and may last for two hours. On some occasions the interviews may be held in a series and are generally felt to be pleasant experiences. The results of the interviews are summarized on appropriate checklists. The evaluator records the data on a profile

comparison chart. Once the information is collected and recorded the screening process is accelerated.

Making the selection decision. From the assembled data the person or group who is to make the selection proceeds to select the most impressive candidate. After the actual selection has been made the evaluation study is reviewed with each of the candidates. Finally constructive suggestions are made in an attempt to avoid losing the good prospect. An effort is also made to strengthen principal areas of weakness in the candidate with the hope that the candidate may develop into a future leader.

#### Top Leadership Selection at Union Carbide Nuclear Company

During recent years, the Union Carbide Nuclear Company of Oak Ridge, Tennessee, a division of Union Carbide and Carbon Corporation of New York, has been particularly concerned with the efficient utilization of manpower. The urgency and scope of the selection problems of the Oak Ridge Plant provided an opportunity to do experimentation on the effectiveness of many of the personnel procedures which had been traditional with the function of selection in industry. A few studies that were conducted under the auspices of Union Carbide Nuclear Company confirmed the effectiveness of some selection devices and raised doubts about others.

The development of accurate job definitions. A significant outcome of the research dealing with leadership

selection was the increased realization that the development of accurate job definitions must precede all other types of personnel inquiries. It appeared necessary to know in precise behavioral terms what an individual was supposed to be doing and in what specific ways he may succeed or fail. Without this understanding, it became obvious that it was impossible to evaluate effectively an individual for a leadership position and thus difficult to make a wise selection.

The underlining of this need led to the development of more advanced techniques for defining job requirements. Abbreviated critical job requirements, those that seemed crucial in the sense that they had frequently been observed to make the difference between success and failure in a given activity, were developed. An efficient method for determining these critical requirements was first developed by John C. Flanagan which was called the critical incident technique.

The critical incident technique. This technique tends to substitute data for impressions and opinions. It provides a relatively precise and comprehensive definition of effectiveness on a job in terms of what people actually do on the job. The critical incidents are things employees do, as reported by qualified reporters, which were especially effective or ineffective in accomplishing important parts of their jobs.

According to a study conducted by W. J. Wilcock, Jr.<sup>16</sup> the critical incident rating technique at Union Carbide Nuclear Company is a modification of the check list method. The method is based on the idea that success or failure in an activity is simply a series of actions leading to observed results and that personal traits essential for appraisal may be observed in job performance. This technique has been employed in the construction of a rating method. The incidents are grouped into job performance categories relating to interest and attitude. The factors provide a basis for an appraisal form. The rater is asked to review the check list of critical incidents and indicate any significant behavior in the performance of the ratee which was observed during the rating period.

A modified critical incident technique. Union Carbide Nuclear modified the critical incident technique by adding one step. Having systematically reviewed a wide range of observed behavior in the past performance, the rater then evaluates the employee on each of the major areas of job performance using a simple classification, such as, very effective, satisfactory, and unsatisfactory scheme. Extremes of performance are used in critical incidents work because their

---

<sup>16</sup>W. J. Wilcock, "Reliability and Relevance of a Modified Critical Incident Evaluation System" (Unpublished Master's thesis, Department of Industrial Management, The University of Tennessee, May 1958).

consequences seem important for rating purposes and because they are more easily recalled by the rater than are average behaviors.

The critical incident method was selected in the development of the selection program at Union Carbide Nuclear Company because it was believed to represent the most promising of all approaches thus far developed in the field of performance and selection evaluation. This approach recognizes that every important desirable and undesirable personal attribute which is necessary as criteria for appraising leadership is exhibited in job performance. The critical incident technique seems to avoid a major difficulty encountered with typical performance appraisal systems. The tendency to base appraisals on overemphasized, isolated occurrences or single desirable or undesirable traits seem to be avoided.

A description of the appraisal form. The check list was employed to review employees job performance. Critical incidents were obtained by interviewing exempt employees. Critical incidents, called job performance statements, make up the first of three parts of the appraisal form. Part one of the appraisal form includes such factors as: (1) initiative and attitude; (2) judgment and planning; (3) accepting responsibility; (4) communication; (5) developing subordinates; and (6) personnel practices. Part two is a traditional rating

scale to summarize the appraiser's judgment for each factor. Part three asks for a written summary of the strengths and weaknesses of the candidate and for recommendations for improving performance.

Union Carbide Nuclear Company considers this technique only as a means to an end, the end being the intensive interview. The pertinent information supplied through the use of this technique is one of the major benefits of the appraisal interviews and for plant-wide development programs.

#### The Selection Program Employed by Radio Corporation of America

Radio Corporation of America is a mammoth company of great diversity in radio, television, and electronics. A report<sup>17</sup> listed this large corporation in twenty-ninth place among America's foremost industrial companies in 1957. Radio Corporation of America is organized into fifteen major operating units and employs more than eighty thousand persons. Of this number, approximately seven thousand occupy executive and managerial positions.<sup>18</sup>

Radio Corporation of America incorporates into its basic philosophy the proposition that most potential leaders

---

<sup>17</sup>Editor, "The Fortune Directory," Fortune, 58:131-150, July 1958.

<sup>18</sup>M. Joseph Doohar and Elizabeth Marting, Selection of Management Personnel (Vol. 1; New York: American Management Association, Inc., 1957), p. 291.



can be stimulated positively to prepare for greater responsibilities; therefore, a fundamental employment policy insists that present employees should receive first consideration for promotional opportunities before outside candidates are sought.

The over-all selection program was inaugurated in 1951 as a Management Development Program with the specific purpose of developing and maintaining an effective leadership team. Since the inception of the selection procedure the company reports that the efforts have been most successful and its effectiveness has increased. The fundamental premise has been substantiated by the fact that in 1956 only 10 per cent of top management was recruited.

The Radio Corporation of America's selection process may be categorized into two broad functions; namely, (1) collection of data; and (2) the interview and final selection decision. Whenever a vacancy develops in a top position the person responsible for selection seeks the services of the Management Development Office. The first endeavor is to establish the qualifications that are desired in the candidate and to consider carefully the job description. Following the initial conference, a specification form is prepared which describes the ideal person for the position. At this point qualified employees are suggested as possible candidates.

Collection of data. Consideration is given to promotability records which are contained in the central files of the

corporation's Management Development Office. The files contain cumulative records of employees who have been evaluated as potential leaders. The next step in the collection of data involves a manpower inventory summary which supplies an appraisal of each candidate. After all necessary data have been collected the personnel representative prepares two summaries: (1) summary of background data; and (2) comparison of candidates to man specifications. This material provides a basis for the discussion of each candidate's weak and strong points. The summaries are not construed to be recommendations but they are thought of as important data in the selection process.

Interviews and the final decision. When the person who is responsible for the selection function indicates the desire for an interview the Management Development Office assists in making the desired candidate available. The order of procedure within the corporation is as follows: (1) availability of the prospect must be established; (2) interviews must be completed; (3) the prospect's transfer must be approved; and (4) the selector makes a job offer. If there are no prospects within the framework of the corporation who are considered to be suitable for the job, the corporation's Personnel Employment Office assists in the task of finding a suitable person as follows: (1) application form; (2) medical examination; (3) investigation of background; (4) when appropriate, a battery of psychological tests are administered

to the prospect; and (5) a number of interviews are conducted. After the selection decision is made one of the company's chief concerns is the continuous appraisal, development, utilization, and professional growth of the individual.

#### The Selection Program of Sears Roebuck Company

Sears Roebuck Company started as a one-man mail-order operation in 1886. In 1955 the company employed one hundred ninety thousand persons of whom eleven thousand were classified as executives. The Sears Roebuck Company is managed with a high degree of decentralization, consequently the program of executive selection and placement at strategic points is very important. The National Personnel Department recruits properly qualified leadership using as a guide-line a systematic promotion plan from within the organization. Outstanding among its contributions in the selection area are research findings on qualities which are important to executive success and the development of an appropriate battery of psychological tests.

The selection program is based upon psychological testing. The management of the Sears Company believes that executive jobs require a high degree of human flexibility. L. L. Thurstone was employed to build and evaluate test instruments that would sharpen Sears' ability in the selection function. Extensive experimentation resulted in a battery of six tests that would attempt to measure the following factors

in prospective top leaders: mental ability, personality, personal values, and vocational interests. The battery of tests requires approximately four hours to complete; nevertheless, the tests have been administered to twenty thousand candidates who were being considered for upgrading in 1955.

Sears maintains that psychological tests are a source of confusion in industry only when they are misunderstood. The chief personnel officers of Sears Roebuck maintain that Sears' improved ability to select top management can be attributed directly to the use of the battery of tests. The success of this unique method of executive selection may be due to the highly comparable units throughout the organization whose key jobs are much the same.

General administrative executive characteristics determined through the Sears testing program include: mental ability, sociability, administrative skill, stability and predictability, drive and sense of personal competitiveness, and breadth of interests and leadership traits. It is to be noted that after work experience these characteristics are very apparent but a prized art is to be able to determine them early and accurately in order to avoid costly selections.

Executive selection and placement. To meet the needs of the company, special emphasis has been placed on a systematic plan of promotion from within. The National Reserve Group Program identifies promising employees and trains them to

assume more responsible positions. This procedure has proven to be a business stimulant and a morale builder among employees. Generally, the Reserve Group Program may be outlined briefly as follows: (1) estimate executive needs; (2) determine sources from which the talent is to be recruited; (3) select potential executives; (4) educate prospective candidates; and (5) control the executive inventory.

An attempt is made to project estimates of executive needs for many months in advance. Every effort is made to locate the desired leadership within the framework of the organization. The selection of candidates requires the judgment of managers, appraisal of general ability, and findings revealed by the Executive Battery of Psychological Tests. The National Personnel Department cooperates with territorial offices in making decisions regarding senior, top-level positions. Advanced leadership training usually includes an organized program of on-the-job training. An effective organized control system maintains an adequate balance between the number of people moving up and the possible number of top vacancies to be filled. Working in accord with the structured program of selection, Sears Roebuck Company feels that it fulfills the responsibility of meeting the serious function of executive selection.

### A Critique of the Four Programs of Selection

The data which was presented previously in this chapter indicate that it is possible to make certain generalizations about the formal programs of selection. A common thread runs throughout each program of selection in that all programs support formalized procedures and focus attention on top-level leadership selection. To this degree, the programs of selection are consistent in a general manner. It is to be noted that each program is unique and demonstrates different approaches to selection. The data indicate that the programs are highly structured and follow formal steps in their development. To this extent, the programs are consistent as individual programs. Two of the programs of selection illustrate practically the same form almost throughout. One of the programs of selection is built directly upon a testing program. Much of the literature disagrees with this technique as a valid method of selecting leadership, however, the company praises the battery of tests and uses them as an in-service training program. One of the companies uses a modified critical incident technique. It appears that the latest findings in literature favor this approach, however, the personnel specialists in the field indicate that they question the practicability and value of the critical incident technique for selection purposes. It seems that all of the programs rely heavily upon the intensive interview as a

selection technique. It is felt that one of the strong features of one of the particular programs of selection is the use of the interview. It is reported that this company arranges interviews in such a way that the prospect is actually sold on the position long before the process of selection is completed.

The programs use a variety of methods to screen the candidates after the prospective executives have been identified. In this specific area the programs of selection are not consistent as a group. Each company uses different devices which are felt to serve their purposes better. One of the companies employed a specialist in the area of testing to develop a battery of tests for the company's specific purposes. This particular company announced that the tests could be used successfully throughout its various branches because of the similarity of positions throughout the organization. Two of the companies use tests to supplement the other sources of information. The two companies make it clear that decisions are not made from test results. It was stated previously that as a group the companies were not consistent in using the same selection devices as a group. It is to be noted that as individual companies the programs are consistent to the extent that the programs employ the same devices in each situation and in all localities.



Three of the programs of selection agree thoroughly in that top leadership selection is achieved by promotion from within the organization. This position is strengthened by the fact that each program sponsors a training program. Many of the specialists in the field stated that actual experience on the job is essential. One program of selection seemed to make selections on the basis of securing the best possible person for the job regardless of the source of recruitment. The writer detected resentment of this practice from one lower-level leader in this company. The person indicated that the employees became dissatisfied when a new top-man was brought into the system when some felt that one from the inside should have been chosen. None of the programs indicated that the companies favored pirating leaders or advancement by nepotism.

All of the programs of selection were similar in the area of collecting data on potential candidates. Each program indicated the possibility of using the services of the company's central personnel offices whenever they were needed.

Because of diversification the corporations center the function of decision making in the area where the opening occurs. All of the programs indicate group participation in the function of evaluation but the decision making is the responsibility of the person who is in charge of operations. It is interesting to note that three of the programs of

selection review the results of the evaluation with the candidates after the decision is made.

It is evident that the patterns of selection overlap in the four programs that were reported in this study. The practices that were described, while falling into definite broad patterns, reflect the individuality of problems and approaches that might be expected of a diversified group of companies. It is felt that the programs of selection involve systematic procedures and an intelligent approach to the problem of top leadership selection. The formal programs are based on the idea that the better known the exact requirements of the job to be filled are, and the more that is known about the qualifications of each candidate for the job, the better equipped the selectors will be to make a wise selection decision.

#### Strengths Observed in the Formal Programs of Selection

1. The four formal programs of selection are positive approaches to leadership selection.

2. The formal programs of selection provide a systematic procedure for surveying human resources for selection purposes.

3. The formal programs stress advance planning which enables top leadership needs to be estimated more accurately. This factor holds more advantages: (a) potential candidates may be screened and evaluated in advance of vacancies;

(b) advance planning promotes morale of the candidates. The advance planning technique avoids the direct association between the evaluation process and the candidate's success or failure in their quest for advancement; and (c) advance planning permits a wider field of selection. Careful observation may reveal the presence of capable people who might otherwise be overlooked.

4. The four programs of selection embrace a thorough program of evaluation for each candidate. Pressure for an immediate decision may be detrimental to the selection process.

5. The formal programs of selection make it possible to consider more objectively the qualifications of each candidate in relation to all possible types of job opportunities.

6. The elements in the programs of selection help potential executives fit themselves for future advancement. Shortcomings that would possibly handicap a candidate in a top-level job are discovered. The process provides the opportunity for assistance to be given to help correct the shortcomings before they contribute to the candidate's failure.

7. The four programs of selection seem to lay a foundation for a sound selection. The organized steps of procedure seem to eliminate many of the initial mistakes which may lead to later errors in the function of selection.

8. The programs of selection promote participation of different groups in the process of selecting a leader.

9. The formal programs of selection save time.

#### Weaknesses Observed in the Formal Programs of Selection

1. The methods of selection which are employed in the programs of selection have not fully conformed to the standards of adequate validation studies.

2. There is some evidence that the programs of selection overlook the contribution of lower-level employees in the selection of top-level leaders.

3. A well formulated program of selection may be poorly administered. It seems that there could be a tendency to give preference to candidates who are best known to the group doing the selecting.

4. The costs of the selection program could get out of hand.

5. The formal programs of selection do not rule out the possibility of evaluators and selectors using hunches and relying on opinions. The programs do not eliminate the full force of outside pressures.

6. Even with a careful formulation of procedures the problems involved in evaluating human behavior are great, therefore, results must usually be reported in terms of probabilities which may be far from certainties.

7. The programs of selection appear to stress technical ability above other leadership traits.

8. The formal programs of selection appear to favor seniority regardless of the candidate's leadership abilities.

9. A disadvantage seems to be the infrequency with which organizational lines are crossed in the search for a top leader.

### Chapter Summary

Chapter III presented an overview of four formal programs of selection and an abridged account of each program. The formal programs of selection that were treated in this chapter are as follows: The General Electric Selection Program, The Union Carbide Nuclear Company's Program for Selecting Leaders, Sears Roebuck Selection Program, and the Program of Selection of Radio Corporation of America. A critique of the four programs of selection was presented and indicated that there may be areas which may need further careful study. It is to be noted that each program of selection was unique yet there seemed to be a similar element running throughout each program of selection. The uniqueness of each program indicated the necessity for organizations to structure individualized programs which are designed to assist in meeting specific goals.

Inasmuch as the four programs of selection employed various selection devices, some of the most common devices were analyzed with documented criticisms which related to particular factors.

From the four programs of selection an effort was made to identify certain basic patterns for executive selection. The identification and appraisal of the basic patterns of selection are presented in Chapter IV of this study.

CHAPTER IV  
IDENTIFICATION AND APPRAISAL OF SIGNIFICANT  
PATTERNS OF TOP EXECUTIVE SELECTION

Introduction

Chapter IV attempts to identify and appraise basic patterns of executive selection which appear to emerge from the four formal programs of selection. The four programs of selection were examined and analyzed in Chapter III.

In order to identify the basic patterns of selection, the writer took the following steps: (1) reviewed available literature relating to the four programs of selection; (2) interviewed specialists who are presently concerned with the function of selection. The interviews were conducted in order to discover the patterns which were thought to be basic by people now in personnel and to find clues for identifying patterns of selection; (3) examined documentary materials and up-to-date materials which were secured from the corporations who sponsor the formal programs of selection; (4) held conferences with members of the writer's Advisory Committee; (5) held conferences with members of the staff in the Department of Industrial Management in the College of Business Administration, University of Tennessee. Conferences were held with members of the staff in the Department of Industrial



Education, College of Education, University of Tennessee; (6) the writer corresponded with personnel officers who are connected with the corporations which sponsor the programs of selection; and (7) made visits to personnel offices in industry to confer with management and to observe at first hand some programs of selection. An important source of information was found in the materials which were supplied by the companies. Some of the materials contained data which revealed latest developments in the programs of selection. The interviews with industrial managers and personnel officers were also stimulating and revealing experiences.

#### Identification of Significant Patterns of Executive Selection in Industry

It is felt that the people who are entrusted with the function of selection are seeking additional information about procedures of selection. The broad patterns which are revealed in the four programs of selection should be interesting and informative to these people.

Five general areas and twenty-four basic patterns of selection seemed to emerge from the four formal programs of selection. It is believed that the patterns contain elements which are basic to the framework of an inclusive and effective program of top executive selection.

The twenty-four basic patterns of selection which were identified from the formal programs are arranged under five general headings as follows:

I. Policy in Regard to Executive Selection

Pattern 1. Those entrusted with the selection function should review and analyze regularly and critically their personal beliefs about selection practices.

Pattern 2. Executive selection should be promotion from within the organization.

Pattern 3. The best person for executive leadership should be selected regardless of the source of recruitment.

Pattern 4. Future executive needs should be anticipated and plans to fill such posts should be made by considering executive potential when appointing lower-level employees.

II. Determine Comprehensive Specifications for the Job which is to be Filled

Pattern 5. A simple yet exact set of specifications for the job to be filled should be prepared.

Pattern 6. The qualifications desired in the candidate should be agreed on and described in detail.

III. Identifying Possible Candidates

Pattern 7. Applications which are filed voluntarily by an aspiring candidate for an executive position may be a way

of identifying top leadership.

Pattern 8. The recommendation of the incumbent executive may identify potential executives.

Pattern 9. Key personnel within the organization should participate in identifying potential executives.

Pattern 10. Business contacts with key personnel in related operations may assist in identifying prospective executives.

Pattern 11. Utilizing the services of professional consultants may be a means of identifying potential executives.

Pattern 12. Advertising vacancies in journals may disclose potential executives.

#### IV. Evaluating the Candidates

Pattern 13. A review of personal records may be a source of information for evaluating the candidates.

Pattern 14. Work-performance reports may reveal clues for evaluating candidates.

Pattern 15. The personal reference check may be a method for evaluating prospective executives.

Pattern 16. The intensive interview, which is a method of probing orally into specific areas with the candidate, may reveal information useful for evaluation.

Pattern 17. Especially designed written tests may be useful devices for evaluating executive leadership.

Pattern 18. The attempt to determine what people do in a stress problematic situation, based on the idea that if the candidate is placed in theoretical critical incidents during an interview that his responses will indicate to observers his potential executive capacity, may be a technique for evaluating executive candidates.

Pattern 19. Work experience in another executive position may be a determining factor in evaluating a prospective executive.

Pattern 20. Education and/or formal training may be a determining factor in evaluating executive candidates.

Pattern 21. Physical health, mannerisms, appearance, and social adjustment may be determining factors in evaluating candidates.

## V. Making the Selection Decision

Pattern 22. The selection decision should be made with group participation.

Pattern 23. The selection decision should be made by those performing the evaluation.

Pattern 24. The evaluation function should be reviewed with each candidate considered.

It is not the intent of this study to propose that the five general areas and the twenty-four basic patterns of selection are either exhaustive or conclusive. It is maintained, however, that after more than a quarter of a century

of serious industrial research, experimentation, and actual practice the general design of patterns should be important. The basic patterns have been arranged into a framework and it is believed that the patterns enhance the possibility of intelligent top leadership selection. It is to be observed that the framework of basic patterns of selection were identified in formal programs of selection which have been tested in industry and which are now in vogue in industry. To this degree and in this manner the patterns of selection have established recognition and acceptance. No attempt was made to relate the literature in the general area of leadership selection to the framework of basic patterns.

It is submitted that the framework of basic selection patterns, as indicated in this study, would help to bring the performance of the selection function in higher education nearer an intelligent and orderly process than do many of the practices which appear to be often employed.

#### Significance of Suggested Patterns of Selection

The importance of appointing the right type of individual to every executive position should be a matter of deep concern to all who are concerned with the function of selection. The four programs of executive selection in industry indicate that the top leader is the key man in any organization. Production and morale of the staff stand in

proportion to his leadership. The importance of selecting the right man to an executive position cannot be over-emphasized. This study indicates that when a mistake is made in top leadership selection that the effects of the error cannot be confined to one person. The mistake affects the entire group of employees or a college community. The selection mistake even affects other jobs and creates personnel problems because the error throws other relationships out of balance. Furthermore, an unwise or wrong selection is an error which is difficult to correct.

Large blocks of time and concerted efforts are required to safeguard the likelihood that the man selected is the best person available; nevertheless, there seems to be no real excuse for not expending the required amount of money, time, and effort. The directors of the corporations which use a formal program of selection have stated that a corporation would not indulge in the expenditure of thousands of dollars for equipment simply upon the opinion and recommendation of the first salesman. By the same token the selection of a key executive must not be haphazardly performed. A single wrong executive selection may cost the organization thousands of dollars and retard the progress of the group for years. The selection of a top executive must therefore be a carefully considered decision made with the full knowledge of all relevant facts.

This study does not imply that a formal program of selection would automatically constitute a fool-proof system. It is maintained that without a carefully worked out basis for selection, few boards of trustees would risk turning over to a subordinate group any major portion of such a delicate job as selecting an executive. In developing this study effort has been made to provide a set of yardsticks that will make it possible to delegate certain of the more time-consuming aspects of the problem to competent staff people. By providing a standard procedure, the program of selection assures that the staff work once assigned can be carried out more intelligently.

It has been said that one of the greatest sources of executive failures is the Friday afternoon appointment. Choosing top leadership out of desperation appears to be all too general in colleges. It may be a natural inclination to leave a selection problem until it becomes critical, yet to wait until the last minute before considering possible candidates only increases the chances of error in selection. In order to insure that the best available candidate is identified and a thorough evaluation of each candidate is obtained, it is necessary to do advance planning. The framework of basic patterns indicate time for screening candidates as a means of eliminating many initial mistakes which may lead to later errors in selection.



### A Description of Each Selection Pattern

The following section of the study presents a brief description of the basic selection patterns which were identified from the four formal programs of selection. It is hoped that the suggested patterns of selection in this chapter will present some clues to the problem of determining the unmet needs in the executive selection program for college presidents. A closer view of each of the basic patterns is therefore afforded.

1. Those entrusted with the selection function should review and analyze regularly and critically their beliefs about selection practices. The proposal for an honest examination of personal beliefs suggests that selectors may sometimes view a potential top leader from a biased standpoint. It is contended that bias and prejudice prevent intelligent recognition of top leadership qualities and is conducive to haphazard and inconsistent selection practices. Emotional attitudes towards races or religious faiths may limit the dimensions of effective selection. Various indications in theory and practice support the idea inherent in the previous statement. An effective program of selection must operate within a framework of values and beliefs that are subject to review and revision at all times.

2. Executive selection should be promotion from within the organization. This principle of selection is based on the

premise that potential leaders who are already in the organization can be encouraged to develop their talents for the more efficient performance of service assignments, thus qualifying them for positions of greater responsibility. Incorporated into this philosophy is a fundamental employment policy that employees should receive first consideration for promotional opportunities before outside candidates are sought. This technique seems to involve an assurance that qualified persons are continually developed for future manpower requirements.

3. The best person for executive leadership should be selected regardless of the source of recruitment. One of the important reasons for an executive selection program is the attempt to obtain more extensive competition both in terms of organizational breadth and in terms of considering those who might otherwise be overlooked. During an interview with one of the representatives of the companies included in this study it was pointed out that outside competition produced significantly superior applicants. Another interview revealed that the state of morale in the unit is a general factor to be considered. In some cases there seemed to be such bitter rivalry among employees that the selection of any present employee would likely lead to bad morale, turnover, and possible administrative sabotage. In such instances, outside recruitment seemed necessary. This principle indicates that if an

outsider is selected, he must be definitely better than one who is already employed.

4. Future executive needs should be anticipated and plans to fill such posts should be made by considering executive potential when appointing lower-level employees. This principle intimates that the surveying of human resources in anticipation of future needs can be of great value in a selection program. Problems should not be avoided until they become critical because waiting until the last minute before considering possible candidates only increases the chances of error in selection. Advance planning enhances the possibility of identifying the best available candidate and assures a thorough evaluation of each candidate. Personnel men in industry seem to be giving more attention to determining future executive needs. This practice offers several advantages: (1) this procedure promotes better morale; (2) more capable candidates may be considered which indicates wider selection; (3) pressure for an immediate decision is often detrimental to the evaluation process; therefore, this principle allows a much more thorough evaluation of each potential candidate; and (4) an evaluation conducted in advance of the opening makes it possible to consider more objectively the qualifications of each man in relation to all possible types of job opportunities.

By evaluating candidates before openings occur it is possible to help promising candidates fit themselves for future openings. Thus if a man has certain shortcomings which might be a handicap to performance in a high level job, help may be given to correct the shortcomings.

5. A simple yet exact set of specifications for the job to be filled should be prepared. It is necessary that those entrusted with the selection function develop a set of specifications covering the requirements of the job to be filled. A simple yet exact statement of the dimensions and details of the job to be filled establishes the basis on which all candidates for this position will be evaluated. If we accept the proposition that adequate selection is dependent on job definition, it must be recognized that it is intrepid to venture into the area of intelligent selection when the executive position cannot be described with sufficient precision. Both the variability and the common elements of the job should be emphasized.

6. The qualifications desired in the candidate should be agreed on and described in detail. The various abilities and characteristics that are felt to be required for a given position should be agreed on and classified. It appears that a warning should be given to those who would rush quickly into a firm and rigid description of required qualifications. The variable factors constitute real differences with infinite

permutations and indicate a need for subtlety in analysis far beyond the usual superficial methods used for determining the qualifications needed for a particular executive position. Differences in jobs are important and can affect significantly the desired qualifications.

7. Applications which are filed voluntarily by an aspiring candidate for an executive position may be a way of identifying top leadership. The system of self-nomination has been particularly effective in industry which has expanded rapidly. One advantage of this technique is that it indicates a strong motivation on the part of those who nominate themselves. Those who volunteer will at least have indicated the desire and the initiative necessary in a good executive. If a system of self-nomination is used precautions must be taken to avoid starting a precedent of job posting.

8. The recommendation of the incumbent executive may identify potential executives. This is probably one of the best sources of candidates since the present executive is not only the one most familiar with the requirements of the position but also best able to judge the qualifications of his workers.

9. Key personnel within the organization should participate in identifying potential executives. An important source of candidates is from key groups within the

organization. This may even be a more telling source, if a man is promoted from within the group. It seems that personal difficulties with former associates who would resent the fact of appointment may be avoided thusly and the tenets of a democratic community may be fostered.

10. Business contracts with key personnel in related operations may assist in identifying prospective executives.

In some cases other industries may have some good prospects for whom they have no immediate opportunities and the proper executives at other related operations may be contacted for suggestions.

11. Utilizing the services of professional consultants may be a means of identifying potential executives.

Specialists who search for executives seem to be a new phenomenon on the industrial scene. The specialists may solicit men who otherwise could not be reached and make more thorough and confident investigations but a chief disadvantage may be the high cost of such specialists.

12. Advertising vacancies in journals may disclose potential executives. Advertisements seem to be considered a less productive source in executive recruitment. Some of the managers interviewed indicated that advertising vacancies in technical journals had some potential for good.

Having compiled the list of potential candidates to be considered, the task is then to evaluate each one. The



procedure as outlined in this chapter is designed to tap possible sources of information which may have some bearing on a candidate's potential success as an executive.

13. A review of personnel records may be a source of information for evaluating the candidates. A first source of information to be consulted is the candidate's personnel record. A personnel folder is usually available for each prospect in the general office and additional information may be recorded in other units. It is possible that the evaluator may come across information which is considered significant and will need to make notation of such findings, in order to determine if it is a clue worth pursuing. Significant information should be summarized briefly.

14. Work-performance reports may reveal clues for evaluating candidates. For a candidate who has been with the organization for some time, the reputation that has been made during the tenure of work is perhaps the most significant indication of ability. Such information can be obtained by talking to the present supervisor and to other managers for whom the candidate may have previously worked. It seems that this data could be obtained by interview rather than by written questionnaires.

15. The personal reference check may be a method for evaluating prospective executives. Another step in the evaluation process is the reference check. This procedure



will be most useful whenever the candidate is from without the organization and when the candidate indicates previous leadership experience in other organizations. Whenever possible a verbal verification is better but letters may secure the desired data.

16. The intensive interview, which is a method of probing orally into specific areas with the candidate, may reveal information useful for evaluation. The intensive interview is important because it is designed to be penetrating in nature. It is an attempt to obtain a more thorough evaluation of the candidate's background, motivation, attitude, and personality characteristics.

17. Especially designed written tests may be useful devices for evaluating executive leadership. Some industries indicate that a few standard tests may determine the level of certain abilities which are difficult to estimate from on-the-job performance. There seems to be considerable misunderstanding regarding the use of tests for selection purposes; however, some businesses have used this technique as an in-service training program to great advantage.

18. The attempt to determine what people do in a stress problematic situation, based on the idea that if the candidate is placed in theoretical critical incidents during an interview that his responses will indicate to observers his potential executive capacity, may be a technique for

evaluating executive candidates. The critical incident technique is a method of measuring an individual's effectiveness or ineffectiveness, on the job, through reports by qualified observers describing behavior in significant situations.

Pilot studies highlight the value of this technique in determining which traits or abilities actually make the difference between success and failure in a given activity, and in deciding which are to be considered essential in screening candidates for executive positions.

19. Work experience in another executive position may be a determining factor in evaluating a prospective executive.

The evaluation of work experience is important when technical competence is paramount. Major problems in this area arise in distinguishing between length and quality of experience and the need for determining the relative value of the experience. The details of the candidate's previous work is of less interest while experiences might reveal fitness for executive work. It has been indicated that previous administrative experience is almost indispensable in acquiring all the characteristics needed for executive success.

20. Education and/or formal training may be a determining factor in evaluating executive candidates. The formal education and/or training of the individual is a highly important part of the executive selection program. The actual amount of education may be a matter of record but evidences of

ability to handle more responsible work is a matter of prime concern.

21. Physical health, mannerisms, appearance, and social adjustment may be determining factors in evaluating candidates. These factors are important since a major part of the candidate's activity involves dealing with others, physical stamina for enduring stress and strain, and speedy adjustment to new situations.

As is indicated in this study, the evaluator will not make the ultimate selection decision for this responsibility rests with the board of control. The evaluator will have available all relevant material for each candidate. In most cases all the materials should not be shown unless more detailed information is requested by the board. To show all of the detailed data would perhaps be more confusing than helpful. It is important that the evaluator be present when the board reviews the summary of the evaluation so that explanations may be given in detail.

Measuring the man against the requirements of the job may make final selection easier. Even where a profile may seem to show that one candidate far exceeds the others, it may be well to carefully re-check requirements for the particular situation to insure that no element has been overlooked.

22. The selection decision should be made with group participation. The board must take ultimate responsibility but the closely associated personnel must be satisfied and happy about the selection. The opinions and viewpoints of people who would be affected by the selection should be taken into account for the common good of the organization. This suggests that the assessments are based on adequate information and are complete and objective.

23. The selection decision should be made by those performing the evaluation. The evaluator brings out a clear picture of the candidates in relation to the job requirements. Caution should be used not to inject personal opinions unless requested to do so. The evaluator presents the findings but the final selection is made by the board.

24. The evaluation function should be reviewed with each candidate considered. The results of the evaluation should be discussed with every candidate who is aware of the evaluation. The approach should be constructive and end on a positive note. It appears more profitable to talk about a suggested program for improvement than to discuss the candidate's short-comings as such.

### Analysis and Appraisal of Significant Patterns of Top Executive Selection

Five general areas and twenty-four basic patterns of

leadership selection were identified from the four formal programs of selection. The basic patterns of selection were arranged into a framework and submitted to a jury which consisted of industrial managers and specialists in personnel. Three members of the jury are prominent leaders in the field of industrial management, six members of the jury are leaders in the area of personnel management, and one member is a leader in the area of supervisory training and education.

Each member of the jury was requested to appraise the identified basic patterns of selection as to importance and practicability. Each member of the jury was asked to assign a numerical value to each of the twenty-four basic patterns of selection according to the following scale:

Highly desirable	- 3	Highly practical	- 3
Of some value	- 2	Of some practicability	- 2
Of no value	- 0	Of no practicability	- 0

Importance of the Basic Patterns of Selection According to the Ratings Assigned to Each Pattern by the Jurors

Table I, pages 132-135, lists each of the basic patterns in full and reveals a tabulation of the spread of jury ratings and a mean rating for each pattern. Each basic pattern could achieve a maximum mean score of 3.0. The table reveals that there was close agreement in jury ratings on most of the basic patterns of selection while there was a considerable difference, relatively, on a few. It seems to be

TABLE I

JURY APPRAISAL OF TWENTY-FOUR BASIC  
PATTERNS OF SELECTION

<u>Importance</u>	Highly Desirable	Of Some Value	Of No Value	Mean Rating
Statement of Basic Patterns				
1. Those entrusted with the selection function should review and analyze regularly and critically their beliefs about selection practices.	7	3		2.7
2. Executive selection should be promotion from within the organization.	9	1		2.9
3. The best person for executive leadership should be selected regardless of the source of recruitment.	8	1	1	2.6
4. Future executive needs should be anticipated and plans to fill such posts should be made by considering executive potential when appointing lower-level employees.	9	1		2.9
5. A simple yet exact set of specifications for the job to be filled should be prepared.	7	3		2.7
6. The qualifications desired in the candidate should be agreed on and described in detail.	10			3.0
7. Applications which are filed voluntarily by an aspiring candidate may be a way of identifying top leadership.	2	7	1	2.0

TABLE I (continued)

JURY APPRAISAL OF TWENTY-FOUR BASIC  
PATTERNS OF SELECTION

<u>Importance</u>	Highly Desirable	Of Some Value	Of No Value	Mean Rating
Statement of Basic Patterns				
8. The recommendation of the incumbent executive may identify potential executives.	3	7		2.7
9. Key personnel within the organization should participate in identifying potential candidates.	7	3		2.7
10. Business contacts with key personnel in related operations may assist in identifying prospective executives.	2	8		2.2
11. Utilizing the services of professional consultants may be a means of identifying potential executives.		9	1	1.8
12. Advertising vacancies in journals may disclose potential executives.		7	3	1.4
13. A review of personnel records may be a source of information for evaluating the candidates.	5	5		2.5
14. Work-performance reports may reveal clues for evaluating candidates.	6	4		2.6
15. The personal reference check may be a method for evaluating prospective executives.	3	7		2.3



TABLE I (continued)

JURY APPRAISAL OF TWENTY-FOUR BASIC  
PATTERNS OF SELECTION

<u>Importance</u>	Highly Desirable	Of Some Value	Of No Value	Mean Rating
Statement of Basic Patterns				
16. The intensive interview, which is a method of probing orally into specific areas with the candidate, may reveal information useful for evaluation.	9	1		2.9
17. Especially written tests may be useful devices for evaluating executive leadership.	1	6	3	1.5
18. The attempt to determine what people do in a stress problematic situation, based on the idea that if the candidate is placed in theoretical critical incidents during an interview that his responses will indicate to observers his potential executive capacity, may be a technique for evaluating executive candidates.	1	6	3	1.5
19. Work experience in another executive position may be a determining factor in evaluating executive candidates.	7	3		2.7
20. Education and/or formal training may be a determining factor in evaluating executive candidates.	5	5		2.5

TABLE I (continued)

JURY APPRAISAL OF TWENTY-FOUR BASIC  
PATTERNS OF SELECTION

<u>Importance</u>	Highly Desirable	Of Some Value	Of No Value	Mean Rating
Statement of Basic Patterns				
21. Physical health, mannerisms, appearance, and social adjustment may be determining factors in evaluating candidates.	10			3.0
22. The selection decision should be made with group participation.	8	1	1	2.6
23. The selection decision should be made by those performing the evaluation.	5	4	1	2.3
24. The evaluation function should be reviewed with each candidate considered.	5	2	3	1.9

significant that only five basic patterns received a mean score that was less than 2.0.

Explanations of jury ratings as to importance of patterns. Patterns 1, 5, 9, and 19 received identical ratings. Seven of the jurors rated these patterns as highly desirable. The remaining three jurors rated the patterns of some value. The mean rating earned by these patterns was 2.7.

Patterns 2, 4, and 16 received identical ratings. Nine of the jurors rated these patterns as highly desirable while one juror rated them of some value. The mean score earned by these basic patterns of selection was 2.9.

Patterns 3 and 22 received identical ratings. Eight of the jurors assigned these patterns a rating as highly desirable. One juror rated the patterns as of some value while one juror rated the patterns of no value. The mean score earned by the patterns was 2.6.

Patterns 6 and 21 received identical ratings. Each of the ten jurors rated these patterns as highly desirable. The maximum score indicated a mean rating of 3.0.

Pattern 7 was rated highly desirable by two jurors, seven jurors rated the pattern of some value, and one juror rated the pattern of no value. Pattern seven earned a mean rating of 2.7.

Patterns 8 and 15 were rated highly desirable by three jurors and of some value by seven jurors. The mean ratings

were 2.3.

Pattern 10 was rated highly desirable by two jurors and of some value by eight jurors. The pattern earned a mean score of 2.2.

Pattern 11 was rated of some value by nine jurors and of no value by one juror. The mean rating was 1.8. This pattern was one of the five patterns which received less than a mean rating of 2.0 in importance.

Pattern 12 was rated lowest in importance of the entire twenty-four patterns. Seven jurors gave a rating of some value and three jurors gave a rating of no value. Pattern 12 earned a mean rating of 1.4.

Patterns 13 and 20 received identical ratings by the jury. Five jurors assigned the patterns a maximum rating of highly desirable and five jurors assigned a rating of some value. The patterns earned a mean rating of 2.5.

Pattern 14 was rated highly desirable by six jurors and of some value by the remaining four jurors. The mean rating was 2.6.

Patterns 17 and 18 received identical ratings by the jurors. One juror gave a rating of highly desirable. Six jurors gave the patterns a rating of some value. Three jurors rated the patterns of no value. These two patterns received the second lowest ratings of the entire group of patterns. The mean rating earned by these patterns was 1.5.

Patterns 17 and 18 are two of the five patterns among the entire group which received a mean rating of less than 2.0.

Pattern 22 was rated highly desirable by eight jurors, of some value by one juror, and of no value by one juror. The mean rating was 2.6.

Pattern 23 was rated highly desirable by five jurors, of some value by four jurors, and of no value by one juror. The pattern earned a mean rating of 2.3.

Pattern 24 was one of the five patterns which received less than a mean score of 2.0 in importance. Six jurors rated this pattern as highly desirable, two jurors rated it of some value, and three jurors rated the pattern of no value. The mean rating was 1.9.

Feasibility of the Basic Patterns of Selection According to the Ratings Assigned to Each Pattern by the Jurors

Table II, pages 139-142, illustrates the spread of jury ratings as to practicability of the patterns of selection. The mean ratings as to feasibility are also indicated. An analysis of the table also reveals general agreement in ratings by the jurors. It appears significant that only six of the twenty-four basic patterns of selection received a mean rating of less than 2.0 in feasibility. The total average rating as to practicability was slightly lower than the average rating as to importance.

TABLE II

JURY APPRAISAL OF TWENTY-FOUR BASIC  
PATTERNS OF SELECTION

<u>Feasibility</u>	Highly Practical	Of Some Practica- bility	Of No Practica- bility	Mean Rating
Statement of Basic Patterns				
1. Those entrusted with the se- lection function should review and analyze regularly and critically their beliefs about selection practices.	5	5		2.5
2. Executive selection should be pro- motion from within the organi- zation.	7	3		2.7
3. The best person for executive leadership should be selected regardless of the source of recruitment.	2	6	2	1.8
4. Future executive needs should be anticipated and plans to fill such posts should be made by considering executive potential when appointing lower-level em- ployees.	6	4		2.6
5. A simple yet exact set of specifications for the job to be filled should be prepared.	8	2		2.8
6. The qualifications desired in the candidate should be agreed on and described in detail.	6	4		2.6

TABLE II (continued)

JURY APPRAISAL OF TWENTY-FOUR BASIC  
PATTERNS OF SELECTION

<u>Feasibility</u>	Highly Practical	Of Some Practica- bility	Of No Practica- bility	Mean Rating
Statement of Basic Patterns				
7. Applications which are filed voluntarily by an aspiring candidate may be a way of identifying top leadership.	2	7	1	2.0
8. The recommendation of the incumbent executive may identify potential executives.	4	6		2.4
9. Key personnel within the organization should participate in identifying potential candidates.	8	2		2.8
10. Business contacts with key personnel in related operations may assist in identifying prospective executives.	4	5	1	2.2
11. Utilizing the services of professional consultants may be a means of identifying potential executives.	2	5	3	1.6
12. Advertising vacancies in journals may disclose potential executives.	1	6	3	1.5
13. A review of personnel records may be a source of information for evaluating the candidates.	3	6	1	2.1



TABLE II (continued)

JURY APPRAISAL OF TWENTY-FOUR BASIC  
PATTERNS OF SELECTION

<u>Feasibility</u>	Highly Practical	Of Some Practica- bility	Of No Practica- bility	Mean Rating
Statement of Basic Patterns				
14. Work-performance reports may reveal clues for evaluating candidates.	4	6		2.4
15. The personal reference check may be a method for evaluating prospective executives.	4	6		2.4
16. The intensive interview, which is a method of probing orally into specific areas with the candidate, may reveal information useful for evaluation.	9	1		2.9
17. Especially written tests may be useful devices for evaluating executive leadership.	2	4	4	1.4
18. The attempt to determine what people do in a stress problem-atic situation, based on the idea that if the candidate is placed in theoretical critical incidents during an interview that his responses will indicate to observers his potential executive capacity, may be a technique for evaluating executive candidates.	1	4	5	1.1

TABLE II (continued)

JURY APPRAISAL OF TWENTY-FOUR BASIC  
PATTERNS OF SELECTION

<u>Feasibility</u>	Highly Practical	Of Some Practica- bility	Of No Practica- bility	Mean Rating
Statement of Basic Patterns				
19. Work experience in another execu- tive position may be a deter- mining factor in evaluating execu- tive candidates.	8	2		2.8
20. Education and/or formal training may be a determining factor in evaluating executive candidates.	5	5		2.5
21. Physical health, mannerisms, appearance, and social adjust- ment may be determining factors in evaluating candidates.	10			3.0
22. The selection decision should be made with group participation.	7	2	1	2.5
23. The selection decision should be made by those performing the evaluation.	5	4	1	2.3
24. The evaluation function should be reviewed with each candidate considered.	5	2	4	1.7

Explanations of jury ratings as to feasibility of patterns. Patterns 1 and 20 received identical ratings by the jury. Five jurors rated the patterns as highly practical and the remaining five jurors rated the patterns of some practicability. The patterns earned a mean rating of 2.5.

Pattern 2 was rated highly practical by seven jurors and of some practicability by three jurors. The mean rating was 2.7.

Pattern 3 is the only pattern which dropped under a rating of 2.0 which was rated above 2.0 in importance. Two jurors rated the pattern as highly practical, six jurors rated the pattern of some practicability, and two jurors rated the pattern of no practicability. The pattern earned a mean score of 1.8.

Patterns 4 and 6 received identical ratings by the jurors. Six jurors rated these patterns as highly practical and four jurors rated the patterns of some practicability. The mean score was 2.6.

Patterns 5, 9, and 19 received identical ratings by the jurors. Eight jurors rated the patterns as highly practical and two rated the patterns of some practicability. The mean score was 2.8 for each pattern.

Pattern 7 was rated highly practical by two jurors, of some practicability by seven jurors, and of no practicability by one juror. The mean rating for this pattern was 2.0.

Patterns 8, 14, and 15 received identical ratings by the jurors. Four jurors rated the patterns as highly practical and six jurors rated the patterns of some practicability. The mean rating was 2.4 for each pattern.

Pattern 10 was rated highly practical by four jurors, of some practicability by five jurors, and of no practicability by one juror. The mean score was 2.2.

Pattern 11 is one of the patterns that received a mean rating of less than 2.0 in feasibility. Two jurors rated the pattern as highly practical, five jurors rated the pattern of some practicability, and three jurors rated the pattern of no practicability. The juror rating indicated a mean rating of 1.6.

Pattern 12 was rated highly practical by one juror, six jurors rated the pattern as of some practicability, and three jurors rated the pattern of no practicability. The mean score was 1.5.

Pattern 13 was rated highly practical by three jurors, of some practicability by six jurors, and of no practicability by one juror. The mean rating earned by the pattern was 2.1.

Pattern 16 was rated highly practical by nine jurors and of some practicability by one juror. The mean rating was 2.9.

Pattern 17 is one of the six patterns which fell below a mean rating of 2.0. Two jurors rated the pattern as highly

practical, four jurors rated the pattern as of some practicability, and four jurors rated the pattern of no practicability. The mean score was 1.4.

Pattern 18 was rated highly practical by one juror, of some practicability by four jurors, and of no practicability by five jurors. The mean rating was 1.1 which was the lowest mean rating of the twenty-four patterns of selection with regard to jury ratings for importance and feasibility.

Pattern 21 was the only pattern to receive a maximum rating as to feasibility. All ten jurors rated the pattern as highly practical. The mean rating was 3.0.

Pattern 22 was rated as highly practical by seven jurors, and of some practicability by two jurors, and of no practicability by one juror. The mean rating was 2.5.

Pattern 23 was rated highly practical by five jurors, of some practicability by four jurors, and of no practicability by one juror. The mean rating was 2.3.

Pattern 24 was one of the six patterns in this group to receive less than a mean rating of 2.0 in feasibility. Five jurors rated the pattern as highly practical, one rated the pattern of some practicability, and four jurors rated the pattern of no practicability. The mean rating was 1.7.

Table III, pages 146-149, presents a comparison of the jury ratings as to importance and as to feasibility of the twenty-four basic patterns of selection. The table

TABLE III

COMPARISON OF RATINGS BY JURY AS TO IMPORTANCE AND FEASIBILITY  
OF TWENTY-FOUR BASIC PATTERNS OF SELECTION

Patterns	Importance	Feasibility	Difference
1. Those entrusted with the selection function should review and analyze regularly and critically their beliefs about selection practices.	2.7	2.5	.2
2. Executive selection should be promotion from within the organization.	2.9	2.7	.2
3. The best person for executive leadership should be selected regardless of the source of recruitment.	2.6	1.8	.8
4. Future executive needs should be anticipated and plans to fill such posts should be made by considering executive potential when appointing lower-level employees.	2.9	2.6	.3
5. A simple yet exact set of specifications for the job to be filled should be prepared.	2.7	2.8	.1
6. The qualifications desired in the candidate should be agreed on and described in detail.	3.0	2.6	.4
7. Applications which are filed voluntarily by an aspiring candidate may be a way of identifying top leadership.	2.0	2.0	0

TABLE III (continued)

COMPARISON OF RATINGS BY JURY AS TO IMPORTANCE AND FEASIBILITY  
OF TWENTY-FOUR BASIC PATTERNS OF SELECTION

Patterns	Importance	Feasibility	Difference
8. The recommendation of the incumbent executive may identify potential executives.	2.3	2.4	.1
9. Key personnel within the organization should participate in identifying potential candidates.	2.7	2.8	.1
10. Business contacts with key personnel in related operations may assist in identifying prospective executives.	2.2	2.2	0
11. Utilizing the services of professional consultants may be a means of identifying potential executives.	1.8	1.6	.2
12. Advertising vacancies in journals may disclose potential executives.	1.4	1.5	.1
13. A review of personnel records may be a source of information for evaluating the candidates.	2.5	2.1	.4
14. Work-performance reports may reveal clues for evaluating candidates.	2.6	2.4	.2
15. The personal reference check may be a method for evaluating prospective executives.	2.3	2.4	.1



TABLE III (continued)

COMPARISON OF RATINGS BY JURY AS TO IMPORTANCE AND FEASIBILITY  
OF TWENTY-FOUR BASIC PATTERNS OF SELECTION

Patterns	Importance	Feasibility	Difference
16. The intensive interview, which is a method of probing orally into specific areas with the candidate, may reveal information useful for evaluation.	2.9	2.9	0
17. Especially written tests may be useful devices for evaluating executive leadership.	1.5	1.4	.1
18. The attempt to determine what people do in stress problematic situations, based on the idea that if the candidate is placed in theoretical critical incidents during an interview that his responses will indicate to observers his potential executive capacity, may be a technique for evaluating executive candidates.	1.5	1.1	.4
19. Work experience in another executive position may be a determining factor in evaluating executive candidates.	2.7	2.8	.1
20. Education and/or formal training may be a determining factor in evaluating executive candidates.	2.5	2.5	0
21. Physical health, mannerisms, appearance, and social adjustment may be determining factors in evaluating candidates.	3.0	3.0	0

TABLE III (continued)

COMPARISON OF RATINGS BY JURY AS TO IMPORTANCE AND FEASIBILITY  
OF TWENTY-FOUR BASIC PATTERNS OF SELECTION

Patterns	Importance	Feasibility	Difference
22. The selection decision should be made with group participation.	2.6	2.5	.1
23. The selection decision should be made by those performing the evaluation.	2.3	2.3	0
24. The evaluation function should be reviewed with each candidate considered.	1.9	1.7	.2

reveals that patterns 7, 10, 16, 20, 21, and 23 received the same rating by the jurors as to importance and as to feasibility. Twelve of the patterns received higher ratings in importance than in feasibility. Six patterns received higher feasibility ratings than ratings in importance. Pattern 3 had the largest difference in ratings between importance and feasibility. This difference could be due to jurors not understanding the statement or that they actually feel that it would be better to go outside the organization to get qualified leaders.

It seems to be significant that the average rating as to importance for all patterns was 0.120 plus more than the over-all feasibility ratings. The jurors did not indicate any reasons for the slightly lower practicability rating. It is possible that the jurors were influenced to some degree by the personnel policies and selection patterns of their respective companies. Personal insights and convictions probably affected the ratings. It does not appear that the margin between the ratings as to importance and as to feasibility is great enough to indicate that the basic patterns are contrary to what is being practiced in the field. On the contrary the ratings may indicate an agreement between industry's theory of selection and what is actually practiced.

Table IV, page 151, indicates the general range of ratings when they are based on averages. It appears that

TABLE IV  
RANGE OF JURY RATINGS

Score	Feasibility	Importance
Lowest	1.1	1.4
Average	2.3	2.4
Highest	3.0	3.0

the table indicates that there was close agreement in most of the patterns. The low rating received in both categories may be due to the fact that the jurors did not fully understand the statements; however, the close agreement on the majority of the ratings, which is equally true of the low ratings, seems to indicate that ratings reveal exactly what the jurors intended the ratings to point up.

### Chapter Summary

Chapter IV identified five general areas and twenty-four basic patterns of selection from the four formal programs of selection which were chosen from industry. The significance of each of the basic patterns was pointed up. The ratings of the jury were presented and analyzed.

It is felt that this chapter reveals a framework of important basic patterns of selection. It was interesting to observe the close agreement of the ratings of the jurors.

It is believed that the findings in Chapter IV hold significant implications which may be helpful in organizing and developing a program of selection.

Important implications which emerge from the findings of this chapter receive treatment in Chapter V of this study.

CHAPTER V

IMPLICATIONS FOR THE SELECTION  
OF COLLEGE PRESIDENTS

Introduction

The purpose of this study was to investigate four formal programs of selection which are being used currently in industry in an attempt to discover a basic framework of patterns of selection which may help to insure more effective selection of college presidents. Therefore, the primary purpose of this study was to investigate the general problem area suggested by the following questions: What have been the research findings in industry concerning the selection of executives?; What implications may findings in programs of executive selection employed by industry have for the selection of college presidents?

The burden of this chapter is to meaningfully relate findings from the four formal programs of selection, as indicated previously in this study, to the second problem area. The achievement of this endeavor shall be attempted by presenting what is believed to be important implications for the selection of college presidents.

## A Theory of Top Leadership Selection

It is believed that the selection of a college president, however simple and direct its procedures, can be a mere manipulation whenever it lacks a clear concept of the institution's purposes. In judging the worth of patterns of top leadership selection for American colleges, it is first necessary to ask, "What is the organization attempting to achieve through the function of selection?" It appears that the patterns of selection will be precisely what the people who are concerned with selection sincerely want them to be. It is believed that concepts of the top leader are fundamental to the theoretical framework around which a program of executive selection is developed.

### Point of View Important

The point of view taken is a major factor in determining specific implications which may emerge from the findings from programs of selection in industry. The point of view also determines what kind of selection program will be structured in given situations. Data from the literature which deals with the selected programs indicate that basic beliefs affect selection behavior. It is felt that basic policy inevitably predicts general directions for the function of selection. Thus the framework of patterns upon which a selection program is based will indicate what elements appear to be important, the degree of significance, and



particular implications. It appears that the implications gained from the findings of the four programs of selection which are discussed in this study would mean one thing to a board of control whose concept of control pivots an authoritative rule and an altogether different thing to trustee leadership which is based on the concept of group-voluntary-cooperative activity.

#### Beliefs and Practices Need to be Consistent

Consistency of beliefs and practices is a glaring need in all areas relating to the function of selection. Inconsistencies in the function of selection are often demonstrated in the general management of organizations and institutions. The ability to harmonize beliefs and actions is highly significant and should be understood to be an essential prerequisite for a positive and unified program of selection. It is to be observed that the four programs of selection are uniquely different, yet, the steps in the selection procedure are surprisingly constant. The principles underlying the development of consistent beliefs and practices appear to be the logical starting point in the process of organizing and establishing an orderly program for selecting college presidents.

### Need for Flexibility

The need for flexibility in a formal program of selection is a prime consideration which seems to be clear. The programs of selection which were discussed in Chapter III indicate that a planned selection program is not a rigid system which overlooks special situations. The details of the selection process may change as the institutional patterns under the hand of the educational trustees achieve new and richer forms.

It is believed that the suggested selection patterns which are proposed in Chapter IV represent basic positions for the function of top leadership selection. It is felt that the framework of patterns contains desirable elements for the development of an over-all program of selection. The patterns seem to project a consistent and orderly plan of selection which indicates the dimensions of a functional program. If the findings from the four formal programs of selection are valid positions, then, they have certain implications for boards of control when they anticipate making a selection. The implications are pointed up throughout the various sections of this chapter.

### The Importance of the College President and Type of Appointment

No task that confronts a board of control is more difficult than the selection of a new college president.

Because of this belief, this study attempted to draw out of four formal programs of selection in industry a framework of selection patterns which may remove some of the uncertainty with which members of the board approach the task of selection and to make the undertaking a systematic one which can be approached with some degree of confidence.

The growth and prosperity of the corporations whose programs of selection were analyzed in this study seem to demonstrate that when boards choose a top executive they are forthwith determining the level of excellency at which the company will operate. The implication may seem to be a simple and exaggerated one, yet it has been verified by experience many times. It is believed that a college cannot rise above the level of its president in maintaining standards, in enthusiasm for service, or in vision of opportunity. The information that was gleaned from the formal programs of selection indicated that the executive is either a leader and a stimulus to the organization or he is a check to ambition, a damper to enthusiasm, and spreads indifference or hopelessness through the ranks. One of the jurors for this study remarked:

On several occasions, I have seen very competent men who could do wonders as an individual, however, as a member of a team and as a human being could not produce in a satisfactory manner. I am here indicating that the top man of the group could not

satisfactorily inspire his subordinates to necessary efforts and results.<sup>1</sup>

It is believed that if it were possible to insure unequivocal leadership in the president's office in each of America's 1,850 institutions of higher learning, this would do more than any other one thing to improve American education.

#### Maintaining High-level Efficiency

The programs of selection indicated that there may be a tendency to fail in advance planning to meet future top leadership needs. Industry is giving a great deal of attention to organizational planning which is designed to determine future executive needs. One juror<sup>2</sup> stated that due to the nature of the company's business that it was imperative to have an effective management development program. Through the process of advance planning the job requirements may be established fairly accurately. Advance planning in selection promotes better morale which produces higher efficiency.

---

<sup>1</sup>Letter from Harold Rhodes Turner, Vice-President and General Manager of Manufacturing of the Synthetics Division of J. P. Stevens Company, State of New York, to R. Leonard Carroll, dated September 10, 1958.

<sup>2</sup>Letter from C. R. Krause, Supervisor of Training and Education in the Atlanta Plant of General Motors Corporation, Doraville, Georgia, to R. Leonard Carroll, dated August 21, 1958.

Wider selection, more thorough evaluation of each candidate, and a more objective consideration of the qualifications of each candidate are by-products of advance planning for leadership selection. It appears that high-level efficiency of the college could be maintained if the board of control could know in advance exactly when the selection problem was to be faced. Also this practice would provide ample time for an effective quest for a successor to the college president.

#### Need for Analysis of President's Job

The corporations whose formal programs of selection were described in Chapter III have pioneered in the area of job analysis. All of the programs of selection that were included in this study indicated that the careful analysis of the job to be filled and the determination of specific abilities needed by the individual to fill the job satisfactorily are concerns of great significance. The four programs of selection clearly imply that an initial step in an orderly program of selection is to determine as accurately as possible the dimensions and details of the job and to clearly state the kind of person that is desired to fill the position.

The formal programs indicate that a simple and exact set of specifications for the job to be filled are prepared by the manager and the evaluator. The specifications become a yardstick which establishes the basis on which all candidates for the position will be evaluated. Definite

specifications for the college presidency could be prepared jointly by the board of control and the faculty. It is possible that no person could qualify under all of the specifications but if essential qualifications could be agreed upon, the quest for the college president would be simplified and accelerated.

Implications from the Four Formal Programs of Selection as to What Kind of Person the Executive Needs To Be

The demands imposed upon top leadership require that the executive possess special qualifications. The four formal programs of selection indicate that if the requirements of the top job are translated in terms of the qualifications that are needed in order to fill the job, the following list of implied requirements may emerge:

Essentials for success in the human relations area.

The executive must be:

1. Favorable in appearance and friendly
2. Persuasive and enthusiastic
3. Interested in people; able to deal effectively with others
4. Mature, emotionally stable, even tempered, and patient
5. Conscientious, honest, sincere, and discreet
6. Courageous and self-confident

7. Fair, impartial, and objective
8. Socially sensitive and tactful
9. Versatile
10. Without unfavorable mannerisms

Essentials for success in the administrative area. The executive must be:

1. Well educated
2. Intelligent, verbal, and able to deal with numbers
3. Able to remember details
4. Able to plan, organize, delegate, and administer
5. Able to make good and prompt decisions
6. Industrious
7. Initiative and resourceful
8. Cost conscious
9. Able to see the big picture

Essentials for success in the job knowledge area. The executive must have:

1. Work experience in the operation to be performed
2. A good understanding of the processes and principles involved in the work to be executed
3. Technical training in relevant fields

Other desirable characteristics for over-all effectiveness. It is desirable for the executive to have:

1. Previous executive experience
2. Physical vigor, energy, stamina, and absence of



disabilities

3. Ambition
4. Interest in the executive job
5. Interest in the company

#### Implications for Finding a College President

Three of the programs of selection that were included in this study supported a systematic promotion plan from within the organization provided such individuals were properly qualified for top leadership responsibilities. It appears obvious that this scheme would indicate that one of the first places for a selection committee to look when they are on a quest for a college president is among the members of the college staff. The formal programs point up that an able person within the organization should not be passed over in favor of a person outside the organization who is distinctly inferior to the former person simply because the disqualifying faults of the person within the system are compared with the strong points of the person without the organization.

The tremendous growth of the four corporations which were considered in this study caused the corporations to be forced to look outside their ranks for top leadership. It is to be noted, however, that where the company cannot produce a person that can be agreed upon for a key position, the search becomes far more difficult. Interviews with

several specialists in personnel indicated that where nepotism or pirating top leaders is practiced that the natural resentment among potential executives from the ranks of the company negate a great deal of the value the selection may have had.

#### Faculty Participation in the Selection of the College President

The four programs of selection indicated that much of the details involved in evaluating candidates are delegated to qualified personnel officers. It is to be noted that only the evaluation work is delegated and not the final selection decision. The programs of selection point out that the practice of delegating detailed evaluation has the following advantages: (1) the evaluators may be trained in the techniques of evaluation; (2) the evaluator gains valuable experience and insights into company problems; and (3) the evaluator may develop valuable contacts. The programs of selection make it clear that the selection decision is the responsibility of the board of control. This procedure which involves staff participation is intended to aid the board of control and not to remove any authority in making the final decision.

It seems that happy selection results may be obtained by having a joint committee of the board of control and the faculty to nominate candidates for the presidency to the board of control. The implications of such a procedure

appear highly amiable. Unfortunately, few boards of control are able to devote the necessary time to the important details which are foundational to wise selections. It is interesting to note that until now there has been no knowledge of a formal program of selection by which the board of control could delegate the more time-consuming aspects of the task of evaluation to capable people on the college faculty. The pilot plan suggested in this study would make it possible for the board to delegate the task of gathering the necessary information regarding the qualifications of each candidate to a few competent members of the board and college faculty, without either sacrificing the board's right to set the standards of the office or undermining the board's responsibility for final decision.

The most obvious advantage of faculty participation in the selection function is increased morale as was indicated in the companies where this technique was practiced. Managers, supervisors, and foremen by working together accomplished ends and developed understandings and insights which none could have achieved alone. The searching powers of a joint-committee could enhance the possibility that presidential prospects would be thoroughly and earnestly investigated. The college should benefit not only in the outcome of the quest and the choice of the candidate but also in the confidence with which the selection is received, particularly

by the faculty with whom the new president must work. It seems that the probability of a successful administration would be greatly increased.

The General Electric Selection Plan and The Radio Corporation of America Program of Selection pointed up one of the most important, yet least obvious of the advantages of the procedure was the involvement of the staff in the selection function. The increase in mutual understanding of participating members and the growth of mutual respect was noticeable.

Faculty participation in selecting the chief executive may have some disadvantages due to unfavorable attitudes of non-participating faculty members. Various areas in industry have indicated that jealousy and envy are human conditions which can become sensitive especially when a few people are singled out and given powers over the professional lives of their colleagues. It is believed that if faculty members function as representatives in a democratic society the elements of participation and cooperation can add a desirable dimension to the procedure of investigation for selection purposes upon which colleges can thrive, even as the diversified corporations have thrived.

## Implications in Regard to the Nature and Function of Selection

The four formal selection programs are an indication within themselves that the task of keeping industrial enterprises on a high-level of effectiveness is not easily performed. It is believed that the previous indication is equally applicable to the educational enterprise. The selfishness or stupidity of a single selector can jeopardize the most carefully prepared selection program. A member of the jury<sup>3</sup> stated that a selector may be exceptional in every category yet because he practices appointing friends, seemingly regardless of their ability or character, to jobs which they did not deserve and could not run is destined to experience failure. It appears that those who are entrusted with the function of selection have to be sufficiently the leaders to deal successfully with the forces related to the maintenance of organizational health and well-being and yet be able to retain integrity both as representatives of the enterprise and as individuals.

### The Function of Selection Affects Human Relations

The four programs of selection indicate that relationships of human beings are affected by all selection decisions.

---

<sup>3</sup>Turner, op. cit., p. 1.

It appears that the corporations feel that this simple fact should never be overlooked or forgotten. The programs of selection which are sponsored by General Electric, Radio Corporation of America, and Sears Roebuck Company have as a distinct part of their programs a review of the evaluation with each candidate. The review of the evaluation results deal with the candidate's strong points, a skillful tempering of weak points, and with making constructive suggestions. Indifference in the human relations area can make shambles of the selection program. The college community is affected none the less by the conditions of the field within which the members of the group grow and wherein they perform their services.

#### The Function of Selection Gains Character Through Participation and Cooperation

Each of the four programs of selection indicates the importance of teamwork and group effort in the process of selection. This idea is not represented in the emergence of simple sentimentality in the college. The implication involves the recognition that the language of democracy is as empty as is the language of any other way of life when it has no meaningful rooting in the relationships of the men who attempt to use it. The creation of participation and cooperation in a college is a conjoint task, but the board of control

is in a strategic position to foster democratic insights by the simple fact of designation.

Principles that Emerge from the Nature and Function of the Four Programs of Executive Selection

The structure of the formal programs of selection indicate that essential principles are gained from insights into the nature and function of top leadership selection. The principles are critical to the extent that to neglect them is to neglect an opportunity to foster what is understood to be the democratic way of life. These principles are:

The principle of intelligence. The essence of a program of selection is to make it possible for intelligence to do its maximum work in a systematic manner. Many enterprises have fallen short of greatness because someone failed to honor this principle. The function of selection is enriched in relationship to the knowledge on the part of those who are entrusted with the function of selection that intelligence counts and will be respected. The function of selection is also enriched to the degree that each selector becomes disciplined in bringing his intelligence to bear significantly upon the group enterprise.

The principle of participation. The programs of selection appear to provide appropriate ways in which concerned individuals may express their interests and capacities in relation to the function of selection. Information gained



through personal interviews with personnel specialists and industrial managers indicated that leadership below the top-level seems to get thwarted and frustrated when participation in top leadership is completely denied. The programs which were considered in this study indicate the importance of providing responsible participants the opportunity to assist in bringing a selection effort into existence. Sensitivity to this element led some corporations to deliberate experimentation in selection practices in order that ways might be found to use varied abilities and at the same time build better morale. It must be recognized that each institution has its unique characteristics and it must be admitted that no single pattern of practice will be suitable for all groups. Participation leads away from the mechanization of human relationships and gains the advantage of pooled intelligence. It is felt that genuine participation occurs only when intelligence is given the opportunity to shape decisions. Human beings prize what they create and are loyal to that which is representative of common values and goals.

The principle of cooperation. The four programs of selection point up that the constituency of a corporation need not be made up of opposing forces. Each group may have specific assignments which may be appropriate to a given role yet the task of selection can be approached effectively only at the level of cooperative effort. The programs of selection

in this study do not rest upon chance. The idea of working together is a calculated effort on the part of the corporation because they must take seriously the repercussion from the human field.

The arrangement of each of the four programs of selection indicate that the observance of the principles that were previously discussed is more than an act of benevolence. The programs of selection appear to foster positive and unified activities that attempt to achieve a means to an end.

#### Patterns of Selection Indicate That Differing Ideas Can Be Pooled

The organization of the four programs of selection encourages the pooling of differing ideas for the purpose of seeking better ones. Nowhere more than in colleges should we look forward to advance than when ideas are in conflict. The early experiences of the programs of selection illustrate that if colleges start where they are and not operate as if the sudden insight of a moment will settle the selection matter, the college can build from the considerable experience of the past and profit from gains made in other areas.

#### Implications for Those Entrusted with the Function of Executive Selection

The four corporations whose selection programs are included in this study spend millions of dollars a year in their

efforts to establish and maintain a desirable program of selection which results in good relations with employees. Yet all the efforts involved in organizing a formal program of selection, essential as they are, will gain little if the program of selection is not effectively administered. If those who are entrusted with the function of selection fail as leaders of the people, then efforts along other lines cannot compensate for the deficiency. The careful administration of a program of selection is one of the prime responsibilities of those who are entrusted with selection.

#### Leadership in the Function of Selection

The programs of selection indicate that able leadership throughout the planned process of selection is essential. It is felt that this fact points up the kind of leadership the boards of control must give when they are involved in the function of selection. Eventually the educational philosophy of the college is created by the board of control by the appointments that are made. The college philosophy is empty until filled with a set of ideals and values to be achieved.

#### Those Entrusted with Selection Should Know the Aims and Purposes of the Organization

The materials that dealt with the development of the programs of selection indicated that General Electric, Radio Corporation of America, and Sears Roebuck structured programs

of selection that would assist in achieving company goals. Findings in Chapter III imply the appreciation on the part of selectors for the unique viewpoint of the corporation. It appears that the selectors view each selection in relation to the big picture of the company. It is necessary, therefore, for selectors to know the aims and purposes of the organization. It is felt that a pattern of selection is significant to the extent that members who are entrusted with the function of selection accept the objectives of the institution and dedicate themselves to the expansion and modification of these aims and purposes in terms of greater social usefulness of the institution.

#### Formal Programs of Selection Indicate the Need for Continuous Examination of Beliefs and Methods of Selection

Colleges are among America's most important institutions. The control of these institutions resides in the board of trustees. Findings in industry point up that the quality of service rendered by an organization depends to a great extent on the character of the members of the team of selectors and for their active concern for the organization under their general direction.

It is believed that no public trust today is more important than the trusteeship of American colleges. To be an active, useful, and stimulating factor in the life of an institution and to operate effectively in an ever changing

social scene, the board of control must operate within the framework of consistent beliefs and tested methods of selection. Findings of Chapter IV indicate that a finer and more valuable framework of patterns of selection evolve from reviews and revisions of existing beliefs and methods of selection. The findings of selection practices in industry indicate that a selection program can be a small, useless, and perfunctory performance unless the people entrusted with selection critically examine the ideas of other people and allow personal ideas and beliefs to be subjected to critical examination by others. Each of the four companies referred to in this study indicated that they embraced selection patterns only until more validated patterns emerged from the experiments.

#### Programs of Selection Employ the Method of Intelligence

The four programs of selection point up that a system of selection is a device used only by people and that the system is only as strong as the people who employ it. The plan of selection is developed by experimentation, the program is defined by the board, data are gathered and interpreted by the board, and the findings are evaluated by the board. It is felt that the programs of selection in industry indicate that as selectors expand their understanding of personal beliefs and methods of selecting that the prospect

of controlling attitudes, biases, and prejudices in the function increases. It seems that this element should be of great concern to those entrusted with selection in the college.

#### Implications in Regard to Basic Policy Formulation in Area of Executive Selection

The four programs of selection which were presented in Chapter III are evidence that industry is indicating a concern for the special area of executive selection. It is to be noted that the increasing concern in this field is encouraging experimentation to improve current selection practices.

The programs of selection imply that specific programs of selection must be adapted to the particular and peculiar needs of the organization. Strict adherence to any standardized set of procedures for selecting executive leadership could contribute to the undoing of the institution. It is evident that industry points up that there is no one right technique of selection that can be applied to all organizations and institutions.

#### Pilot Principles to Guide Policy Formulation in the Area of Executive Selection

Basic principles relating to policy formulation as implied from the programs of selection conducted in industry

may be summarized briefly as follows:

1. The quest for top leadership should have dimensions as wide as practical.

2. The complexity of the qualifications essential to executive success must be recognized. Once this recognition is achieved, additional requirements become apparent. A complete description of the job in order to determine particular qualities that the incumbent should possess and the need for meaningful evaluation methods become evident.

3. The administration of the selection program is important. The programs indicate that employee morale improved because of increased confidence in the company when the employees were permitted to apply for vacant positions.

4. It is recognized that a diversity of characteristics can add up to successful top leadership performance.

#### Implications for the Organization and Administration of a Program of Executive Selection

The programs of selection herein described point up that no one program of selection could meet the needs of all institutions. It is necessary that the details of a program of selection be designed for and arranged to meet the specific needs of each respective system. The political, religious, and economic framework under which colleges operate is not



the same in all localities, therefore, these boundaries may influence the scope and the size of the programs of selection.

Chapter I indicated that living with selection mistakes can be costly. Unfortunately, to err in selecting the right college president is not particularly difficult. This may be due to the natural tendency of selectors to generalize and to judge a situation largely in terms of its obvious and outstanding characteristics.

Chapter IV established that certain common patterns of selection seem to exist in the organized programs of leadership selection in industry. These basic patterns were set forth as a pilot framework for an orderly program of selection. The framework of patterns is intended to serve the purpose of suggesting a broad basis upon which individualized programs of selection may be erected. It should be noted that there are many important areas and significant details in the total program of selection that were not within the scope of this study. It is suggested that the pilot framework of patterns as presented in this section may be helpful as guide lines when a program of selection is being organized.

The importance of the program of selection is heightened when it is realized that the function of selection has a bearing on any situation in which people live and work together. Regardless of the optimal development of the program of selection, the program represents the highest good

only as the patterns are skillfully adapted to the needs of the local situation and to the degree to which the patterns are sensitive to effects produced.

The effective administration of a program of selection is as important for the success of the program as the choice of selection methods. A program of selection is of little value without the full support of those people who make it a practical reality. It is essential that those who set up the necessary machinery of the program give evidence of their wholehearted approval and support.

Poor administration of a program of selection may lead to delays which could arouse antagonism and suspicion within the circle of the institution. Failure to keep costs to a minimum leads to attacks on the program. Failure to communicate methods and results to concerned parties can lead to sabotage of the program on the part of those people who were not consulted and informed. The selection of a college president is always an important and sensitive action. For this reason the administration of an executive selection program cannot be treated as secondary to its technical phases. The four programs of selection indicated that both technical and administrative specialists need to participate in formulating the selection program.

#### A Practical Solution

The programs of selection indicate that the effort to

insure the best possible selection is not an easy task. There is no magic formula which can guarantee a fool-proof decision. The selection procedure contained in the four formal programs appear to be a systematic application of the practical and common-sense approach to the problem of selection. The programs of selection are based on the simple fact that the better the exact requirements of the job to be filled are known and the more that is known about the qualifications of each candidate for the job, the better equipped will be the selectors to make a wise selection decision.

#### What an Executive Selection Program Will Do

Each of the four programs of selection enlarge the fact that a program of leadership selection is not a panacea. An orderly program of selection alone cannot produce qualified leadership if there are none among the candidates. The program cannot correct deficiencies arising from poorly defined responsibilities, ineffectively organized structures, or correct deficiencies from lack of internship opportunities. Formal programs of selection cannot provide college presidents who will be able to perform feats of magic if there is an inadequate number of employees, if pay is low, if recognition is rare, and equipment is poor. The program cannot guarantee the full use of the president if his talents have to be spent on enormous amounts of clerical work.

The formal programs of selection indicate that an orderly program of top leadership selection can aid in the following: (1) assist the board of control in defining the type of individual the college needs to fill the presidency; (2) give the board a detailed evaluation of each candidate; and (3) identify the candidate whose qualifications come closest to meeting the requirements of the position.

It should be borne in mind that the purpose of the selection process is not to simply eliminate candidates. The major aim is to give the board of control a clear picture of the potentialities of each person evaluated. Thus, a by-product of the program becomes evident. Candidates who are not exactly right for the presidency may fill the requirements for a subsequent executive position. The accumulated information which the program develops could be found useful in counseling and in making future placements.

#### Pitfalls to be Avoided as Reflected in Errors of Selection Practices in Industry

1. Irresponsibility flourishes in situations where there is a hesitancy to establish systematic programs aimed at identifying candidates with top leadership ability.

2. The impact of the selector's own characteristics on the qualities he desires in others, even though they bear no real relationship to the job needs.

3. The lack of humility on the part of the evaluators

who rely on discursive and superficial interviews or appraisals.

4. The concomitant of the lack of humility is an overwhelming pride in one's judgment of others, with a tendency to make spot decisions without first getting all the facts.

5. Emphasis on experience in a special type of work or in a particular segment of an organization becomes acute the higher in management one goes.

#### A Five-Step Program of Selection

It is to be noted that a program of selection, no matter how well substantiated, can work to the best advantage in a given situation if it has not been validated for that situation. This study has attempted to present logical assumptions, supporting data, and a simplified framework of selection patterns. The intensive effort needed to prepare and to manage a program of selection cannot be expected when the project is handled as a part-time duty. As long as executive selection is stymied by a feeling of pessimism, as long as it is handled as another lower-level problem, as long as it is based on unproven opinions, it is believed that the mistakes which have been so costly in many situations will continue. It is contended that even with the existing state of knowledge, a systematically organized program will be substantially better than unorganized efforts.

The following five-step approach may serve as a guide or as a check list for the organization and administration of the selection program. It should be noted that the basic patterns as identified in Chapter IV which received less than an average jury rating of 2.0 were deleted from the framework of suggested patterns.

- I. Develop policy in regard to executive selection
  - A. Review selection beliefs and practices constantly
  - B. Promote leaders from within the organization if possible
  - C. Anticipate future executive needs
- II. Determine specifications for the presidency
  - A. Prepare a description of the job of the president
  - B. Develop qualifications that are desired in the president
- III. Identify possible candidates
  - A. Applications which are filed voluntarily
  - B. Recommendations of the incumbent
  - C. Nomination by the group
  - D. Nominations from outside contacts
- IV. Evaluate the candidates
  - A. Review personnel records
  - B. Investigate on-the-job performance

- C. Conduct a reference check-up which includes biographical data, education and/or training, and information about physical conditions
- D. Conduct intensive interview
- V. Make the selection decision
  - A. With group participation
  - B. Involve the evaluators in the decision making

### Chapter Summary

Chapter V presented what was believed to be some of the implications which the four formal programs of leadership selection, which were analyzed in Chapter III, have for selecting the college president. It was indicated that the point of view taken is a major factor in determining implications and the supposed degree of importance and feasibility. The principles underlying the development of consistent beliefs and practices were proposed as the logical starting point for establishing an orderly program for selecting college presidents.

An important implication for developing a formal program of selection was believed to be flexibility of design. Continuous review of methods and beliefs upon which the selection program is structured were stressed.



The importance of the college president and the type of selection was presented in this chapter with pertinent implications.

The four programs of selection indicated the importance of the human element as it relates to the nature and function of selection. The basic principles of intelligence, participation, and cooperation were pointed out as being essential.

It was pointed out in this chapter that those entrusted with the function of selection hold significant status in organizing and developing a formal program of selection. The selectors need to have an understanding of the purposes and needs of the organization.

It was indicated that the organization and administration of a program of selection is of little value if it does not have the support of the people who make it a practical reality. The administration of the program of selection is equally as important as the organization of the program.

Finally, attention is called to pitfalls in selection. The chapter concludes by presenting a simplified five-step program of selection which is believed to be useful to the people who are concerned with the selection of a college president.

## CHAPTER VI

### SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS

This study proposed to investigate the problem area suggested by the following questions: "What have been the research findings in industry concerning the selection of top executives?" and "What implications may research findings in industry, concerning top executive selection, have for the selection of college presidents?" The dimensions of the investigation were: (1) to survey literature in order to develop concepts of the top industrial executive and the college president; (2) to examine and analyze selected programs of leadership selection in industry; (3) to identify and appraise significant patterns of executive selection emerging from the findings of four industrial programs of selection; and (4) to identify implications which the four programs of selection in industry have for the selection of the college president.

Whereas validated research in the major problem area was very limited, it was felt that in order to achieve the primary purpose of this study and to obtain the necessary information that data should be collected through an intensive examination of the literature relative to leadership selection; reports of personnel specialists and commissions; documentary materials and latest findings secured directly from

the four companies that are currently experimenting with formal programs of leadership selection; and through personal interviews with industrial managers and personnel specialists.

The research procedure of the study was survey, synthesis, and analysis. The literature dealing with leadership selection was surveyed to discover the nature of the executive. The synthesis reduced the mass of data to the common properties of executive leadership which were then stated as concepts of the industrial executive and the college president. An investigation of additional literature and an analysis of the four programs of leadership selection in industry yielded the approaches, procedures, and basic patterns of leadership selection in the four programs of selection. An analysis of the patterns was made with the theoretical concepts of the executive as guide lines. Implications for selecting college presidents were formulated from the patterns of selection found in industry.

The investigation utilized the literature on the subject of top leadership selection and drew on the other sources of data as restricted in the limitations of the study. In addition to the material surveyed in the library of The University of Tennessee, other materials, especially that concerning the four programs of selection were secured by correspondence with personnel officers in industry and through personal interviews with industrial managers and personnel specialists.

Patterns of leadership selection were identified and then submitted to a jury of ten specialists (for a list of the jury see Appendix pages 204-206), who appraised each pattern of selection as to importance and feasibility.

The present chapter will be devoted to a summary of the study along with conclusions and recommendations as indicated by the findings of the study.

### Summary

#### Development of Concepts of Top Executives

A premise underlining the general problem area asserted that theoretical concepts about the nature of the executive and his job were of importance to a proper consideration of top leadership selection. The first endeavor was to trace definitive concepts of the top leader through the literature and to show that the function of selection was related to these concepts and theories. It is felt that the literature rendered significant indications that top leadership selection is directly related to philosophical points of view and psychological concepts of the executive and his job which are held by those entrusted with the function of selection.

An overview of the literature revealed that ideas surrounding both the industrial executive and the college president evolved through a long and dramatic background. The

basis of top leadership has shifted from the right to rule or rule by might to top leadership because of demonstrated ability. Ever-changing and broadening concepts of the leader of leaders indicate the need for an orderly framework of patterns for identifying and evaluating potential leaders.

Research findings have revealed scores of different qualifications and characteristics for top leadership. The findings seem to have established that the successful executive must possess sharply differing abilities and the know-how to effectively assume different roles at the right time. It is to be noted that research has not yet pointed up specific qualifications that are most important for many of the top leadership positions and very few studies have actually explored and analyzed specific top job requirements.

#### Top Executive Selection Research

A review of the four formal programs of leadership selection reveals that industry has taken a lead in selection efforts and is presently engaging in a large portion of the experimentation being conducted in this strategic area. The function of selection seems to be influenced by several factors and selection patterns appear to have emerged in several ways. The four well-planned orderly programs of selection which are supported by scientific research and experience seem to offer the best results and thus contain elements that pose as the most desirable basis for developing a positive,

unified, and consistent foundational plan for the effective selection of college presidents.

Selection methods. The programs of selection indicate that many aspects of leadership selection thrive in an atmosphere of scientific research. Perhaps this accounts for the indication that in progressive companies the use of unvalidated selection methods have been perpetuated no longer than scientific methods and procedures could be discovered. It seems to be clear that obtaining empirical evidence of the value of any selection method is the surest way to progress. Research efforts related to the four selection programs have produced a number of indications:

1. Each formal program of selection implements a basic operational philosophy.
2. The respective programs of selection indicate broad patterns which contain common elements yet each reflects individuality of approaches.
3. Each method represents a definite procedure to be followed in making important selections.
4. The methods reveal a uniform procedure yet allow for many time-consuming details to be delegated.
5. Each formal program of selection indicated a structured plan that was designed to employ a set of validated principles of selection in a systematic manner.

Selection devices. A number of studies based on selection devices can be found in the literature; it is to be noted, however, that their ultimate use and exact value have not been completely validated. Many of the devices and tests are still in the experimental stage, therefore, it is felt that the following observation should be made.

1. The conclusions of any single device do not give complete assurance that the findings have practical use.

2. There are many variables and indefinite conditions to be considered that may affect real confidence in selection devices.

#### Patterns of Executive Selection

The identification and appraisal of patterns of leadership selection were an important part of this study. An analysis and synthesis of four selected experiments conducted by industry established the suggested pilot framework of selection patterns. It is believed that the general framework of patterns which were identified hold some important clues to the solution of many problems encountered by a board of trustees when they are on a quest for a college president. The pilot patterns reflect an orderly procedure of selection consisting of elements and generalizations which appear to be basic components in the development of an inclusive program of selection. Running throughout the framework of patterns is a broad concept of the cooperative group problem-



solving concept. It is believed that the pilot framework of patterns allows flexibility for adaptation to individual situations in a society of changing values. It is not the intent of this study to suggest that the patterns are either exhaustive or conclusive nor do they constitute a fool-proof system of selection. It does visualize that the employment of the pilot framework may bring the performance of the selection function in higher education nearer an intelligent, orderly procedure. It is interesting to note that no startling innovations were developed in the study but rather a core plan designed to effectuate in an effective manner common patterns which appeared to be employed in the four industrial experiments in selection. To this degree and in this manner the patterns have established recognition and acceptance.

Five general areas and twenty-four basic patterns of leadership selection were identified from the sources of inquiry and were then submitted to a jury of ten industrial managers and personnel specialists for appraisal purposes.

An analysis of the jury ratings indicated a fairly close agreement of ratings on most of the basic patterns while a slight difference in ratings was indicated on others. It seems to be significant that there was a general average of .120 plus difference in importance and feasibility ratings by jurors.

### Implications for the Selection of College Presidents

1. A theory of top leadership selection. (a) point of view important; (b) belief and practices need to be consistent; and (c) need for flexibility.

2. The importance of the college president and type of appointment. (a) maintaining high-level efficiency; (b) need for analysis of president's job; (c) implications from the four programs of selection as to what kind of person the executive needs to be; (d) finding a college president; and (e) faculty participation in the selection of the college president.

3. The nature and function of selection. (a) the function of selection affects human relations; (b) the function of selection gains character through participation and cooperation; (c) principles that emerge from the nature and function of the four programs of selection; and (d) patterns of selection indicate that differing ideas can be pooled.

4. Those entrusted with selection. (a) leadership in the function of selection; (b) those entrusted with selection should know the aims and purposes of the organization; (c) formal programs of selection indicate the need for continuous examination of beliefs; and (d) formal programs of selection employ the method of intelligence.

5. Basic policy formulation. (a) pilot principles to guide policy formulation.

6. The organization and administration of a program of selection. (a) a practical solution; (b) what a selection program will do; (c) pitfalls to be avoided in selection; and (d) a five-step program of selection.

### Conclusions

The assumptions underlying this study asserted that executive selection in industry would reveal basic patterns for the effective selection of the college president. Thus a primary objective of this study was to contribute to the development of a simplified order of procedure of selection. It was thought that a basic framework of selection patterns could be developed by examining, analyzing, and appraising four formal programs of selection now in vogue in industry. It is believed that the findings of the study are significant from the point of view that the patterns of selection have been tested by experiments in leadership selection by foremost industrial enterprises. A recapitulation, in the light of the analysis made, seems to reveal and justify the following conclusions:

1. The presence of formal selection programs in industry indicates that a problem in selection is recognized.

2. The four formal programs of selection are positive approaches to top leadership selection and indicate the application of intelligence.

3. Formal programs of top leadership selection have been conducted largely in industry.

4. The systematic procedures for surveying human resources indicate that attempts have been made to analyze many of the variables which determine effective and intelligent selection.

5. A common thread runs throughout each selection program which indicates basic patterns of selection.

6. Formal selection programs are highly structured to meet specific needs.

7. Jury ratings on the basic patterns of selection indicate that the framework of basic patterns may be a sound basis for selection. To this extent, it appears that the proposition asserted in the underlying assumptions has been affirmatively demonstrated.

#### Recommendations

An attempt to achieve the purposes of the study was indicated through the organization of research procedure which drew data from four of industry's efforts to improve its programs of top leadership selection. It is believed that the results of such research in industry afford many significant implications for those entrusted with top leadership selection in colleges.

From the evidence gathered and from the conclusions outlined previously, the following recommendations are made:

1. It appears feasible that extended studies in the area of top leadership selection could utilize the findings of this study and might reveal current trends in patterns of selection when boards of control appoint the college president.
2. It is hoped that the pilot framework of patterns of selection can be tested by boards of control in order to determine workability. Such a study could deal with adapting patterns of selection into specific situations.
3. Application of the suggested framework of selection patterns to the role of the educational board of control in improving selection is an implied necessity. Additional research in the area of analyzing and defining the job of the board and the college president may provide the implementation needed to bring about the improvement suggested in the pilot framework of selection patterns.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Appleby, Paul H. Big Democracy. New York: Alfred A. Knoff, 1945.
- Appley, Lawrence A. "The President's Scratchpad," Management News, 23 (October 1950), 1-2.
- Argyris, Chris. "Some Characteristics of Successful Executives," Personnel Journal, 32 (February 1953), 50-55.
- \_\_\_\_\_, "Top Management Dilemma: Company Needs vs. Individual Development," Personnel, 32 (September 1955), 123-138.
- Barnard, C. I. Functions of the Executive. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1938.
- \_\_\_\_\_, Organization and Management: Selected Papers. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1948.
- Bingham, Walter Van Dyke. Administrative Ability--Discovery and Development. Washington: Society for Personnel Administration, 1939.
- Bradshaw, F. F. Developing Men for Controllershship. Boston: Harvard University Press, 1950.
- Brickman, W. W. "The College President's Basic Function," School and Society, 83 (February 18, 1956), 65.
- Brown, J. F. Psychology and the Social Order: An Introduction to the Dynamic Study of Social Fields. New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company, 1936.
- Brown, Wilfrid and Raphael, Winfred. Managers, Men and Morale. London: MacDonald and Evans, 1948.
- Bryce, James. The American Commonwealth. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1931.
- Buell, Raymond L. "The 30,000 Managers," Fortune, 21 (February 1940), 58-62.
- Burling, Temple. "Psychiatry in Industry," Industrial and Labor Relations Review, 8 (August 1954), 33.



- Coffey, W. C. "Criteria Helpful in Selecting a President for a Church-Related College," Association American Colleges Bulletin, 18 (Summer 1953), 353-356.
- Coffin, T. E. "A Three-Component Theory of Leadership," Journal of Abnormal and Social Psychology, 39 (January 1951), 63-68.
- Cook, Robert C. Trustees and Presidents of American Colleges and Universities 1955-56. Nashville: McQuiddy Printing Company, 1955.
- Cooke, M. L. Academic and Industrial Efficiency. Boston: The Merrymount Press, 1940.
- Cowley, William Harold. "What Should a College President Be?" Bulletin of the Texas Technological College, 4 (August 1949), 9-23.
- \_\_\_\_\_, "The Government and Administration of Higher Education: Whence and Whither," Journal of the American Association of Collegiate Registrars, 29 (July 1947),
- Davies, Daniel R. and Livingston, Robert T. You and Management. New York: Harper and Brothers, 1958.
- Deferrari, Roy J. College Organization and Administration. Washington: The Catholic University of America Press, 1947.
- Dimock, Marshall Edward. The Executive in Action. New York: Harper and Brothers, 1945.
- Dooher, M. Joseph and Marting, Elizabeth. Selection of Management Personnel. New York: American Management Association, Inc., 1957.
- Dunham, W. B. "The Theory and Practice of Administration," Harvard Business Review, 14 (Summer 1936), 401.
- Drucker, Peter F. "Management and the Professional Employee," Harvard Business Review, 30 (April 1952), 86.
- Editor, "The Fortune Directory," Fortune, 58 (July 1958), 131-150.
- Eliot, C. W. University Administration. New York: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1908.

- Elliott, E. C. "The Board of Control," Higher Education in America, edited by R. A. Kent. New York: Ginn and Company, 1930.
- Emerson, Ralph Waldo. "Self Reliance," Essays. New York: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1903.
- Emmons, Russel J. "Getting Along with Your Top Executive," Personnel Journal, 29 (June 1950), 55-67.
- Ford, William C. "Scientific Selection of Potential Executives," Proceedings of the Fourth Annual Management Engineering Conference, College Station, Texas, March 1-2, 1951.
- Flanagan, John C. "A Research Approach to the Definition of Job Requirements for the Research Executive," 1950. (Mimeographed)
- Furst, Harold. "An Inquiry into University Organization and Administration." Unpublished Ph. D. thesis, Stanford University, 1954.
- Gardner, Burleigh B. "What Makes Successful and Unsuccessful Executives?" Advanced Management, 13 (December 1948), 116-125.
- General Electric Selection Program for Supervisors Manual. New York: General Electric Employee and Plant Relations Services, January 1952.
- Gibb, Cecil A. "The Principles and Traits of Leadership," The Journal of Abnormal and Social Psychology, 42 (July 1947), 283.
- Gordon, Robert A. Business Leadership in the Large Corporation. Washington: The Brookings Institution, 1945.
- Goulder, Alvin W. Studies in Leadership. New York: Harper and Brothers, 1950.
- Griswold, A. Whitney, "Citation," The New York Times, June 13, 1958, p. 16.
- Guilford, J. P. and Comprey, Andrew L. "Prediction of Proficiency of Administrative Personnel From Personal History Data," Educational and Psychological Measurement, 8 (Autumn 1948), 281-295.

- Hariton, Theodore. "Executive Selection," Advanced Management, April 1955.
- Harvey, W. W. "Search for the Right Executive," Journal of Educational Sociology, 30 (September 1956), 31-34.
- Hemphill, John K. Situational Factors in Leadership. Columbus: Ohio State University, 1949.
- Hobson, Robert L. "Some Psychological Dimensions of Academic Administration," Studies in Higher Education, 73 (1949), 38.
- Holden, Paul, Fish, L. and Smith, H. Top Management Organization and Control. Palo Alto: Stanford University Press, 1941.
- Holmes, Roger W. "Faculty Participation in Selecting a College President," American Association University Professors Bulletin, 43 (December 1957), 598-604.
- Hughes, Raymond M. A Manual for Trustees of Colleges and Universities. Ames: Iowa State College Press, 1951.
- James, Herman G. "How To Be A University President," The American Mercury, 43 (January 1938), 46-50.
- Janney, J. Elliott. "Company Presidents Look at Their Successors," Harvard Business Review, 32 (September-October 1954), 45-53.
- Jensen, Milton B. and Rotter, Julian B. "The Value of Thirteen Psychological Tests in Officer Candidate Screening," Journal of Applied Psychology, 31 (June 1947), 315.
- Judson, Arnold S. "New Approach to Executive Selection," Harvard Business Review, 32 (March-April, 1954), 58-61.
- Katz, Robert L. "Skills of an Effective Administrator," Harvard Business Review, 33 (January-February 1955), 33-42.
- Kehoe, Monika. "International Cooperation as a Human Problem," Human Relations, 2 (February 1949), 375-380.
- Knauft, E. B. "Vocational Interests and Managerial Success," Journal of Applied Psychology, 35 (June 1951), 160-163.
- Learned, E. P. "Problems of a New Executive," Harvard Business Review, 27 (May-June 1949), 362-372.

Lewisohn, Sam A. Human Leadership in Industry. New York: Harper and Brothers, 1945.

Lippitt, Gordon L. "What Do We Know About Leadership?" National Education Association Journal, 44 (December 1955), 555-556.

Long, Henry J. "Why College Presidents?" Association American Colleges Bulletin, 37 (October 1951), 379-382.

Lowell, A. L. A War with Academic Traditions in America. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1934.

\_\_\_\_\_, What A University President Has Learned. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1938.

Lubbers, I. J. College Organization and Administration. Evanston: Northwestern University Press, 1932.

Maer, Norman. "Supervision for Effective Leadership." Unpublished Ed. D. thesis, The University of Michigan, March 1955.

Mandell, Milton M. "The Selection of Executives," Selection of Management Personnel, edited by M. Joseph Dooher and Elizabeth Marting. New York: American Management Association, 1957.

\_\_\_\_\_, "Supervisors Attitudes and Job Performance," Personnel, 26 (June 1949), 182-183.

\_\_\_\_\_, "The Administrative Judgment Test," Journal of Applied Psychology, 34 (June 1950), 145-147.

Mandell, Milton M. and Adkins, Dorothy C. "The Validity of Written Tests for the Selection of Administrative Personnel," Educational and Psychological Measurement, 6 (Autumn 1946), 293-312.

Marsh, Daniel L. "Imperative in a College President," Association American Colleges Bulletin, 37 (March 1951), 7-12.

McCracken, Henry Noble. The Hickory Limb. New York: Scribner, 1950.

McLain, Raymond, "Editorial," Military Review (March 1950), 41.

- McVey, Frank L. and Hughes, Raymond M. Problems of College and University Administration. Ames: The Iowa State College Press, 1952.
- Medina, Harold R. "Quotation," Employee Bulletin, United States Civil Service Commission, Washington, 4 (December 20, 1950), 7.
- Newman, S. H., Bobbitt, J. M. and Cameron, D. C. "The Reliability of the Interview Method in an Officer Candidate Evaluation Program," American Psychologist, 1 (April 1946), 103-109.
- Page, Howard E. "Detecting Potential Leaders," The Journal of Aviation Medicine, 19 (March 1948), 435-441.
- Portis, Sidney A. "Exhaustion in the Young Business Executive," Journal of the American Medical Association, 144 (January 1950), 1162-1166.
- Sammartino, Peter. The President of a Small College. Rutherford: Fairleigh-Dickinson College Press, 1954.
- Sears National Personnel Department: Its Organization and Function Manual. Chicago: The National Personnel Department, 1958.
- Selekman, Benjamin M. Labor Relations and Human Relations. New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company, 1947.
- Shartle, Carroll L. Executive Performance and Leadership. New Jersey: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1956.
- Simon, Herbert. Administrative Behavior. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1947.
- Snyder, Henry Nelson. An Educational Odyssey. Nashville: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1947.
- Spears, Edward L. Assignment to Catastrophe. New York: A. A. Wynn, Inc., 1954.
- Spencer, Lyle M. Presidential Portrait for 1955. Chicago: Science Research Associates, 1955.
- Stogdill, Ralph. "Personal Factors Associated with Leadership: A Survey of the Literature," Journal of Psychology, 25 (January 1948), 35-71.



- Stone, Donald C. "Notes on the Governmental Executive: His Role and His Methods," New Horizons in Public Administration. Tuscaloosa: University of Alabama Press, 1945.
- Strong, Edward K. Vocational Interests of Men and Women. Palo Alto: Stanford University Press, 1943.
- The New York Times, June 13, 1958, p. 16.
- Thwing, Charles Franklin. The College President. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1926.
- Uhrbrock, Richard. "Item Analysis: The Basis for Constructing a Test for Forecasting Supervisory Ability," Personnel Journal, 12 (January 25, 1933), 141-154.
- Ungerson, B. "Executive Development in Retailing," British Management Review, 13 (December 1955), 124.
- United States Department of Health, Education, and Welfare. Statistics of Higher Education: Receipts, Expenditures, and Property 1953-54, Chapter IV, Section II. Washington: Government Printing Office, 1957.
- Waddell, Richard L. "The Mystery of Executive Talent," Business Week, 1342 (May 21, 1955), 43-46.
- Wagner, Ralph. "The Employment Interview: A Critical Summary," Personnel Psychology, 2 (Spring 1949), 42-43.
- West, Harold. "Professional Qualifications in General Management," British Management Review, 9 (January 1950), 51.
- Whyte, William H. "The Fallacies of Personality Testing," Fortune, 50 (April 1954), 117-121; 204-208.
- Wilcock, W. J. "Reliability and Relevance of a Modified Critical Incident Evaluation System." Unpublished M. S. thesis, The University of Tennessee, May 1958.
- Williams, Stanley B. and Leavitt, Harold J. "Group Opinion as a Prediction of Military Leadership," Journal of Consulting Psychology, 11 (November-December 1947), 283-291.

## APPENDIX



## List of Members of the Jury

### Mr. Harold Rhoades Turner

Mr. Harold Rhoades Turner is Vice-President and General Manager of Manufacturing for the Synthetic Division of J. P. Stevens Company, Incorporated (twelve plants). Mr. Turner has been associated with the heads of manufacturing in the forty-five plants of J. P. Stevens Company for the past thirty-six years and has acquired a wealth of experience and knowledge in regard to leadership selection.

### Mr. C. R. Krause

For the past three years, Mr. C. R. Krause has been Supervisor of Management Training and Leadership Education for General Motors Corporation at Doraville, Georgia. Prior to his present assignment, Mr. Krause was in the Management Training Section of General Motors Institute for ten years. During that period he was assigned to a number of plants and divisions of the Corporation to carry on Management Training and Leadership Development Programs.

### Mr. W. C. Close

Mr. W. C. Close is Personnel Director for Visking Company which is a division of Union Carbide Corporation at Loudon, Tennessee. Mr. Close has occupied his present position since the company began operations in East Tennessee.

Mr. John T. Skipper

Mr. John T. Skipper is Industrial Relations Manager for Bowaters Southern Paper Corporation at Calhoun, Tennessee. Mr. Skipper has held this position since the company began operations at Calhoun. Prior to his present affiliation he spent several years in Personnel and Industrial Relations with other plants in the paper industry.

Mr. H. F. Littleton

Mr. H. F. Littleton is Personnel Director for the Charles H. Bacon Company at Lenoir City, Tennessee. Mr. Littleton has been successful in this assignment for many years.

Mr. Jack Anderson

Mr. Jack Anderson is presently the General Manager for the Peerless Woolen Mills which is a Division of Burlington Industries, Incorporated at Cleveland, Tennessee. Mr. Anderson has a rich experience in selecting textile personnel having spent more than a quarter of a century in evaluating and choosing men for leadership positions.

Mr. Fred M. Gragg

Mr. Fred M. Gragg is Personnel Manager for International Resistance Company, Boone Plant, Boone, North Carolina. Mr. Gragg has been active in personnel work for many years and has had wide experience with the program of testing.

Mr. John G. Truitt

Mr. John G. Truitt, after graduating from Purdue University, became affiliated with North American Aviation. Mr. Truitt's following assignment, which he presently holds, was Personnel Manager for Electro-Mechanical Research, Incorporated at Sarasota, Florida.

Mr. J. H. Canby

Mr. J. H. Canby is Personnel Supervisor for E. I. duPont deNemours Company, Incorporated, Chattanooga Plant, Chattanooga, Tennessee. Mr. Canby has occupied his present position for approximately one year. Prior to his present assignment, he held several supervisory positions in production work which covers a period of approximately eighteen years.

Mr. John E. Charleston

Mr. John E. Charleston became Plant Manager for the Yale and Towne Manufacturing Company at Lenoir City, Tennessee, in 1953. Since 1933, Mr. Charleston has had a wide and varied background relating to the function of leadership selection. His experience has emerged through the assignments of methods engineer, General Plant Foreman, General Plant Superintendent and General Plant Manager.

INSTRUMENT FOR APPRAISAL OF IMPORTANCE AND FEASIBILITY  
OF EXECUTIVE SELECTION PRACTICES

Basic Patterns of Selection as Indicated in Literature and Practice  (Each statement indicates a pattern of selection, there- fore, please rate each item. Add and rate any basic se- lection pattern which is not included but in your opinion should be.)	Idealistic Importance			Practical Feasibility		
	Highly Desirable	Of Some Value	Of No Value	Highly Practical	Of Some Practica- bility	Of No Practica- bility
<p><u>I. Policy in Regard to Executive Selection</u></p> <p>e.g.</p> <p>1. Those entrusted with the selection function should review and analyze regularly and critically their personal beliefs about selection practices.</p> <p>2. Executive selection should be promotion from within the organization.</p> <p>3. The best person for executive leadership should be selected regardless of the source of recruitment</p> <p>4. Future executive needs should be anticipated and plans to fill such posts should be made by consider- ing executive potential when appointing lower-level em- ployees.</p> <p>Others:</p> <p>Comments:</p>						

INSTRUMENT FOR APPRAISAL OF IMPORTANCE AND FEASIBILITY  
OF EXECUTIVE SELECTION PRACTICES

Basic Patterns of Selection as Indicated in Literature and Practice  (Each statement indicates a pattern of selection, there- fore, please rate each item. Add and rate any basic se- lection pattern which is not included but in your opinion should be.)	Idealistic Importance			Practical Feasibility		
	Highly Desirable	Of Some Value	Of No Value	Highly Practical	Of Some Practica- bility	Of No Practica- bility
<p>II. <u>Determine Comprehensive Specifications for the Job To Be Filled</u></p> <p>e.g.</p> <p>5. A simple yet exact set of specifications for the job to be filled should be prepared.</p> <p>6. The qualifications desired in the candidate should be agreed on and described in detail.</p> <p>Others:</p> <p>Comments:</p>						
<p>III. <u>Identifying Possible Candidates</u></p> <p>e.g.</p> <p>7. Applications which are filed voluntarily by an aspiring candidate for an executive position may be a way of identifying top leadership.</p> <p>8. The recommendation of the incumbent executive may identify potential executives.</p>						

INSTRUMENT FOR APPRAISAL OF IMPORTANCE AND FEASIBILITY  
OF EXECUTIVE SELECTION PRACTICES

Basic Patterns of Selection as Indicated in Literature and Practice  (Each statement indicates a pattern of selection, there- fore, please rate each item. Add and rate any basic se- lection pattern which is not included but in your opinion should be.)	Idealistic Importance			Practical Feasibility		
	Highly Desirable	Of Some Value	Of No Value	Highly Practical	Of Some Practica- bility	Of No Practica- bility
9. Key personnel within the organization should par- ticipate in identifying potential executives.						
10. Business contacts with key personnel in related operations may assist in identifying prospective executives.						
11. Utilizing the services of professional consultants may be a means of identi- fying potential candidates.						
12. Advertising vacancies in journals may disclose potential executives.						
Others:						
Comments:						
IV. <u>Evaluating the Candidates</u>						
e.g.						
13. A review of personnel records may be a source of information for evaluating the candidates.						

INSTRUMENT FOR APPRAISAL OF IMPORTANCE AND FEASIBILITY  
OF EXECUTIVE SELECTION PRACTICES

<u>Basic Patterns of Selection as Indicated in Literature and Practice</u> (Each statement indicates a pattern of selection, there- fore, please rate each item. Add and rate any basic se- lection pattern which is not included but in your opinion should be.)	Idealistic Importance			Practical Feasibility		
	Highly Desirable	Of Some Value	Of No Value	Highly Practical	Of Some Practica- bility	Of No Practica- bility
14. Work-performance re- ports may reveal clues for evaluating candidates.						
15. The personal refer- ence check may be a method for evaluating prospective executives.						
16. The intensive inter- view, which is a method of probing orally into spe- cific areas with the candi- date, may reveal information useful for evaluation.						
17. Especially designed written tests may be useful devices for evaluating execu- tive leadership.						
18. The attempt to deter- mine what people do in a stress problematic situ- ation, based on the idea that if the candidate is placed in theoretical criti- cal incidents during an interview that his responses will indicate to observers his potential executive cap- acity, may be a technique for evaluating executive candi- dates.						



INSTRUMENT FOR APPRAISAL OF IMPORTANCE AND FEASIBILITY  
OF EXECUTIVE SELECTION PRACTICES

<u>Basic Patterns of Selection as Indicated in Literature and Practice</u> (Each statement indicates a pattern of selection, there- fore, please rate each item. Add and rate any basic se- lection pattern which is not included but in your opinion should be.)	Idealistic Importance			Practical Feasibility		
	Highly Desirable	Of Some Value	Of No Value	Highly Practical	Of Some Practica- bility	Of No Practica- bility
19. Work experience in another executive position may be a determining factor in evaluating a prospective executive.						
20. Education and/or formal training may be a determining factor in evaluating executive candidates.						
21. Physical health, mannerisms, appearance, and social adjustment may be determining factors in evaluating candidates.						
Others:						
Comments:						
V. <u>Making the Selection Decision</u>						
e.g.						
22. The selection decision should be made with group participation.						
23. The selection decision should be made by those performing the evaluation.						

INSTRUMENT FOR APPRAISAL OF IMPORTANCE AND FEASIBILITY  
OF EXECUTIVE SELECTION PRACTICES

<u>Basic Patterns of Selection as Indicated in Literature and Practice</u> (Each statement indicates a pattern of selection, there- fore, please rate each item. Add and rate any basic se- lection pattern which is not included but in your opinion should be.)	Idealistic Importance			Practical Feasibility		
	Highly Desirable	Of Some Value	Of No Value	Highly Practical	Of Some Practica- bility	Of No Practica- bility
24. The evaluation func- tion should be reviewed with each candidate considered.						
Others:						
Comments:						