



University of Tennessee, Knoxville
**TRACE: Tennessee Research and Creative
Exchange**

Chancellor's Honors Program Projects

Supervised Undergraduate Student Research
and Creative Work

Spring 5-2008

Human Sex Trade in Eastern Europe: Causes, Perpetrators, and Solutions

Holly Elizabeth Bullard
University of Tennessee - Knoxville

Follow this and additional works at: https://trace.tennessee.edu/utk_chanhonoproj

Recommended Citation

Bullard, Holly Elizabeth, "Human Sex Trade in Eastern Europe: Causes, Perpetrators, and Solutions" (2008).
Chancellor's Honors Program Projects.
https://trace.tennessee.edu/utk_chanhonoproj/1156

This is brought to you for free and open access by the Supervised Undergraduate Student Research and Creative Work at TRACE: Tennessee Research and Creative Exchange. It has been accepted for inclusion in Chancellor's Honors Program Projects by an authorized administrator of TRACE: Tennessee Research and Creative Exchange. For more information, please contact trace@utk.edu.

Holly Bullard

Human Sex Trade in Eastern Europe: Causes, Perpetrators, and Solutions

Holly Bullard

Senior Honors Thesis

UH 499

9 August 2007

Before any serious discussion on human trafficking and the human sex trade can be entered we must define what these terms mean. This is perhaps one of the greatest challenges facing those who combat the human sex trade in the modern world—what is human trafficking to begin with? In her prefatory letter to the June 2007 United States Department of State “Trafficking in Persons Report” Condoleezza Rice says, “Trafficking in persons is a modern-day form of slavery, a new type of global slave trade. Perpetrators prey on the most weak among us, primarily women and children, for profit and gain. They lure victims into involuntary servitude and sexual slavery” (3). The U.S. Federal Bureau of Investigation estimates that the human trafficking industry is approximately a \$9.5 billion illegal industry and according to the U.S. government about 800,000 people are trafficked each year across national borders from 127 countries (Slavery 4). Equally concerning, “about 80 percent of modern-day slaves are female and an estimated 50 percent are children” (Slavery 4). The Trafficking Victims Protection Act of 2000 (TVPA) defines trafficking as:

- a. Sex trafficking in which a commercial sex act is induced by force, fraud, or coercion, or in which the person induced to perform such an act has not attained 18 years of age; or
- b. The recruitment, harboring, transportation, provision or obtaining of a person for labor or services, through the use of force, fraud, or coercion for the purpose of subjection to involuntary servitude, peonage, debt bondage, or slavery (Billings, et. al. 7).

It is very important to note that this definition does not require that a person be physically transported in order for a crime of human trafficking to have occurred—the common

factor is instead the use of force, fraud or coercion to make a profit off the labor of another person; these victims may be used for labor exploitation, sexual exploitation, or both (Billings 8).

While sexual exploitation often takes place within the commercial sex industry it can also include exploitation within person homes where perpetrators demand sex as well as work (Billings 8). Force and coercion do not have to be physical—they can be psychological in nature as well. It is nearly impossible to tell how many victims are a part of forced labor and human trafficking because it is an illegal business, the perpetrators do not report what they are doing, making estimates on victims vary widely from 4 million to 27 million people in forced labor at any given time, the International Labor Organization (ILO), a part of the UN, places its estimate at approximately 12.3 million people in forced labor or sexual slavery at any given time (Billings 8). It is even more difficult to track the men, women, and children trafficked within their own countries for purposes of forced labor—and these people make up the majority of forced and bonded labor (Billings 8).

As should be clear from the difficulty in establishing a set definition of what human trafficking is, the forms such human exploitation can take are numerous. The perpetrators of these crimes can be devious and ruthless in their ways of tricking victims into the system. Some victims are attempting to leave developing countries in the hope of improving their lives through low wage jobs in more prosperous countries (Billings 8-10). Traffickers are aware of these desires and seek victims who are vulnerable to their scams. It is not uncommon for women eager to better their lives to be lured into inescapable prostitution through promises of jobs abroad as waitresses, models,

babysitters, and housekeepers (Billings 10). Sometimes especially poor families will end up selling their younger or female children in an attempt to just get by, often with promises that the child will be given education and better care—unfortunately these children are often sold again and again into forced labor.

One particularly difficult to track and prosecute form of human trafficking is forced domestic servitude. In these situations women and children particularly are forced to work as domestic servants in the households of the wealthy. Often the victims were lured in with promises of a higher salary and better living than they experienced in their home countries. The U.S. Department of State’s “Trafficking in Persons Report” gives a strong example of this in the story of Marlana. Marlana was a domestic servant in a wealthy household in the Persian Gulf—her recruitment agent had promised her a salary of \$200 a week, but instead she was forced to sleep on the floor of the kitchen, work 20 hours a day, and was never paid (Billings 13). Marlana’s passport was confiscated by the wife of her employer as soon as she arrived; she was forbidden from leaving the house and was locked inside whenever the family left the house. When Marlana did finally manage to escape she was arrested for running away from her employer and held in a deportation center (Billings 13). This story is sadly not unique, similar situations exist all over the world—including within the United States. Forced domestic servants are frequently threatened, abused, confined, and sexually assaulted all over the world every year—these servants can be children as young as eight years old (Billings 13). The problem can be even greater because labor laws frequently do not protect domestic servants and many countries do not view this as a trafficking issue, instead encouraging victims to return to the situation and seek civil penalties against abusive employers

(Billings 13). The keeping of a victim's passport and other travel documents is a tool frequently employed in many forms of human trafficking, not just within involuntary servitude. Without these documents migrants become subject to arrest and deportation (Billings 22). Luckily, some countries—such as the United States—have recognized this form of coercion and made it illegal for an employer to seize the documents of his/her workers; however, not all countries have these laws and in fact some have enacted laws that allow this practice, consider for example the memorandum of understanding between the Indonesian and Malaysian governments, this document was written in 2006 and states:

The employer shall be responsible for the safe keeping of the Domestic Worker's passport and to surrender such passport to the Indonesian Mission in the event of abscondment or death of the Domestic Worker (Billings 22).

This policy is clearly bad policy as it allows employers to legally confiscate travel documents, facilitating this kind of forced labor.

Another frequently forgotten form of human trafficking is child soldiering. This form is more commonly seen within developing countries where militias, national and rebel armies illegally recruit children for a variety of positions within the military—these range from actual soldiers and spies to porters and sex slaves (Billings 21). Of course, due to the chaos within a country that creates such armies many of these crimes are committed outside legal and governmental control—countries must determine after the fact if and how they will prosecute the offenders. This is made more complex by the fact that frequently the very person who has come to power is a perpetrator of child soldiering; it is unlikely that any leader finding himself newly in power in a country is

going to prosecute himself for abduction or forced enslavement of children and frequently the peace agreements in these new governments include amnesty from persecution for war crimes for members of the armies (Billings 21). Frequently the child victims of child soldiering recruitment were either abducted or forced into soldiering with threats against their families—when the war ends, even if persecution of those who created the child soldiers is possible, there is often little relief for the physical and psychological damage caused by the children’s experience in the army. These children are frequently required to commit atrocities, sometimes against their own families and communities—frequently when a child soldier manages to survive and return home he or she is rejected by the community because of what he/she has been forced to do (Billings 24). Despite so much discouraging news with regard to the legal punishment of perpetrators of child soldiering, progress has been seen in several African countries. “In early 2006, Kanyanga Biyoyo, commander of the rebel army *Mundundu-40*, was sentenced by a Congolese court to five years in prison for war crimes, including the illegal recruitment and use of child soldiers” (Billings 21). While five years in prison hardly seems a fitting punishment for war crimes this is progress compared with no punishment at all. Also in early 2006 (March) the Congolese Government arrested and turned over to the International Criminal Court (ICC) for sentencing the leader of a rebel movement—Thomas Lubanga—he was charged with recruitment and using children under age 15 in armed combat (Billings 21). Finally, in the fall of 2005 the Ugandan government requested that the ICC put out warrants for the arrest of the top five leaders of the Lord’s Resistance Army for crimes against humanity—including enslaving child soldiers; this request was granted and those warrants are in effect (Billings 21).

Unfortunately, despite these steps forward many perpetrators remain unpunished, especially those who might be considered lower profile by the international community. UNICEF estimates that more than 300,000 children under age 18 are being exploited in armed conflicts in over 30 countries worldwide—while most child soldiers are between 15 and 18 there are some as young as 7 or 8 years old (Billings 24).

Finally we arrive at Human Sex Trafficking. This form of human trafficking is incredibly varied within itself, ranging from child sex tourism to forced prostitution. In fact, “sex trafficking is considered the largest specific subcategory of transnational modern-day slavery” (Billings 27). “Child sex tourism (TSC) is the dark side of globalization, with some two million children exploited in the global commercial sex trade” (Billings 23). CST involves a person, generally fairly wealthy, traveling from his/her home country to another country to engage in sex acts with children. Frequently the destination country is a developing country and poor policing, poverty, and corruption play a large role in allowing this to continue (Billings 23). One of the downsides of the current world system is that many of the perpetrators of CST are able to escape prosecution because they travel to other countries to commit their crimes—for more than 6 years ECPAT-USA (End Child Prostitution, Child Pornography, and Trafficking of Children for Sexual Purposes) has been campaigning to get airlines and tourist industries to inform travelers that if they have sex with a minor while traveling they are committing a crime; this has had limited success, however, recently President Bush spoke to the UN and in his speech encouraged this as well, hopefully change is coming (Hughes 1). The Internet and other advances in technology have unfortunately given quite a bit of help to the perpetrators of CST—those who participate in the industry can view child

pornography online and plan their international visits from the privacy of their own home. The child pornography and CST show strong links—not only can people relive their experiences and view more images, but also often the sites are used to “groom” and blackmail victims into further service (Billings 23).

Debt bondage is a frequent tool of sex traffickers—women are promised a better job and/or life in another country and are transported there, upon arrival these women have their travel documents taken and are told they must first work as prostitutes to pay off the “debt” they have created for the people who brought them there (Ballard). Women in forced prostitution report a never-ending cycle of debt—first they are charged huge fees for transportation, and then daily living expenses are added (Billings 26). Frequently these victims do not know how much they owe and never see any of the money they are earning. Often other charges are added to the debt as well, keeping it continually high—these charges include charges for refusing a “client,” charges for condoms, and charges for food or clothing (Billings 26).

Sex trafficking could not continue if not for the constant demand for commercial sex that is flourishing around the world (Billings 27). This is perhaps part of the problem. The current national trend is to normalize prostitution, making it a business rather than a crime—with women described as ‘sex workers’ and their abusers become ‘customers’ (Hughes 1). While human sex trafficking is passionately denounced it seems that few denouncers are willing to acknowledge the demand created by prostitution as the driving force behind it. Frequently there is argument made for the legalization of prostitution, claiming that this is done in favor of the right of women and children—but this is simply a façade for the true agenda: this argument serves to protect a violent

industry, allowing women and children to be beaten, raped, abused, and used for the profit of a few (Hughes 2). “Where prostitution is tolerated, there is a greater demand for human trafficking victims and nearly always and increase in the number of women and children trafficked into commercial sex slavery” (Billings 27). Despite the claims of some supporters, very few women choose prostitution as a career and the vast majority are desperate to escape it—in 2003 a study by the *Journal of Trauma Practice* found that 89 percent of women in the prostitution business want to escape but have no other means for survival (Billings 27). “The transnational flow of women and children for the sex trade occurs among sending, transit, and receiving countries” (Hughes 1). Victims are recruited in sending countries; here traffickers prey on people’s desires to leave the countries due to poverty, unemployment, or political instability (Hughes 1). Once victims have been tricked into the system they are moved through transit countries and brought to receiving countries—in the receiving countries the women and children are met by the pimps who “ordered” them for their prostitution rings (Hughes 1).

In the aftermath of the fall of the Soviet Union, Eastern Europe has become a vast source of sending countries. In 2001 and 2002 Russia received a failing grade from the U.S. State Department with regard to efforts to combat human trafficking, this is in no small part because each year thousands of women and children are trafficked for prostitution in Russia—with an estimated over half a million women being trafficked there in the past decade (Hughes 1). This trafficking is in large part facilitated by organized crime, trafficking Russian women and girls to over 50 countries worldwide, including the United States—the other major contributing factor to this problem is that Russia did not at the time of this report have any laws against human trafficking (Hughes

1). Traditionally the most major sending countries were Asian countries, such as Thailand and the Philippines—but in recent years the most valuable and sought after women in international sex trafficking have been from the Ukraine and Russia, with other former Soviet republics such as Latvia and Belarus contributing as well (Hughes 9). Ukraine is now the second largest country in Europe and one of the largest suppliers of women for prostitution in the world (Hughes 9). “Ukrainian women are trafficked to Russia, Poland, Turkey, the United Arab Emirates, Lebanon, the Czech Republic, Italy, Portugal, Germany, Austria, Cyprus, Greece, Serbia, Montenegro, Spain, Hungary, and Israel for commercial sexual exploitation” (Billings 201). As of the 2007 Trafficking in Persons Report by the U.S. State Department Ukraine is on the Tier 2 Watch List because it has failed to provide evidence of increased efforts to combat human trafficking in the past year (Billings 202). There are locations where women trafficked from Russia and Eastern European countries are so prevalent that prostitutes are called “Natashas” (Hughes 11).

Transnational trafficking in the former Soviet Union is a relatively new business—it began with perestroika, when international travel restrictions were loosened and the disintegration of the Soviet Union only helped to facilitate travel and trade, making illegal business easier (Hughes 12). Frequently women are trapped into the sex industry as they attempt to find better paying, or at least paying, jobs outside their country where the economy is frequently in shambles as a result of rapid commercialization. The crime networks were very hard to take advantage of existing migration patterns to hide their illegal trafficking of women—for example, with increased migration of Jewish women to Israel transnational criminals used the cover to transport

about 10,000 women illegally into Israel for the sex industry; the sex industry in Israel has since grown into a huge business, dependant upon women trafficked from Eastern Europe (Hughes 13).

Clearly the sex industry uses up women and it requires a fresh supply of women and girls to keep it operating—how then are these women recruited? One common means of recruitment in Eastern Europe is newspaper advertisements offering good salaries in other countries to young, attractive women who will work as dancers, hostesses, maids, and baby-sitters—an inspection of newspapers in the Ukraine showed that each contained five to twenty suspicious advertisements (Hughes 15). These women are also recruited through social events and photo-shoots, often with a great deal of time, effort, and description placed on reassuring them that the employment is genuine—an estimated 20 percent of trafficked women are recruited through advertisements of this type (Hughes 15). Another large contributor to human sex trafficking out of Eastern Europe are mail order bride agencies, or marriage agencies. “According to the International Organization for Migration, all mail-order-bride agencies with women from the republics of the former Soviet Union are under the control of organized crime networks” (Hughes 15). Women recruited by the so-called “marriage agencies” are brought into the sex trade in a number of ways—either they are directly sold to brothels or one man who promises marriage at a later date will use them himself for a time before coercing them into making pornography or selling them. These companies are often run over the Internet and the recruiters can be either traffickers themselves or simply work for traffickers (Hughes 15). Unfortunately the most prevalent form of recruiting in most of Eastern Europe is an increasing phenomenon called the “second wave.” In this

phenomenon women who have been brought into sex trade are returned to their home countries to recruit more women (Hughes 15). This functions because once a woman has been trapped into the illegal sex industry she has few options, she is not allowed to keep much of the money she earns as a prostitute and often return home would be met with rejection due to the stigma of prostitution. In these cases the only means of escape from brutal and unwanted sex with unknown men on a daily basis is becoming a pimp herself (Hughes 15). A recruiter generally receives between US\$200 and \$5000 for each women recruited, according to one study about 70 percent of the pimps in the Ukraine are female (Hughes 15).

Women who are trafficked rarely go expecting to become prostitutes, regardless of the means of recruitment used to get them into the system. Frequently these women have been offered any of a number of more agreeable positions—ranging from waitressing to being a nanny to modeling. Usually it is after a woman has reached her destination that the pimp will announce to her that she is going to be a prostitute instead of whatever position she thought she was getting (Hughes 16). Frequently these women are controlled through debt bondage, threats against their families, confiscation of travel documents, and violence (Hughes 16). While some women do realize they are going to be prostitutes they frequently do not understand the level of brutality of and cruelty as well as the lack of control over their own lives they will face. Women are lied to with regard to how much money they will be making and what choices they will be given (Hughes 16). Frequently women are submitted to extreme violence as examples to other women and as punishment for resistance—in many ways the modern-day slave trade is reminiscent of 18th and 19th century African slave trades; in Italy an auction was

discovered where women were partially stripped and sold to the highest bidder (Hughes 17).

Frequently women receive little aid or sympathy from law enforcement personnel; instead they are treated as criminals—either as illegal immigrants or as prostitutes. When a raid is conducted on a brothel the women are arrested and placed in jail pending deportation rather than having their numerous physical and emotional traumas treated—they are treated as more criminals, rather than as the victims they actually are (Hughes 17). Unfortunately society in general still holds rather antiquated views on prostitution—blaming the women for the crimes committed against them. Often officials wishing to make themselves look better minimize the scope of the human sex trade, and it has only been in recent years that major public officials have begun truly recognizing the dangers of forced prostitution and undergoing training to treat these women as victims rather than criminals.

So what conditions are specific to Russia and Eastern Europe that allow these victims to be so easily taken advantage of by organized crime? There are a variety of factors that are unique to Eastern Europe as well as some factors that would apply to any supply country. The collapse of the Soviet Union and the economic problems that came with it can shoulder a large portion of the blame, especially since the suddenly freed market became prey to various members of organized crime and what are called “shadow markets” (Hughes 2). Vast unemployment is another factor pushing women in Eastern Europe to be easily recruited for the purposes of sex slavery—this, of course ties into the problems of the economy. Accepted and institutionalized violence against women is another factor—the sex industry is high gendered and without acceptance of violence

against women it could not continue (Hughes 2). A final factor contributing to the victimization of these women is the glamour placed around western lifestyles—films like “Pretty Woman” make prostitution seem glamorous and attractive rather than frightening, violent, and dangerous (Hughes 2).

Due to a variety of circumstances surrounding the change from a state-controlled economy to a market economy the Russian economy is not largely controlled by organized crime. Very little of the money made off of the “resource grab” that took place shortly after the fall of Communism was reinvested in Russia, instead it was placed in offshore bank accounts (Hughes 3). This leads to a problem not so much of increasing criminal activity but rather of the entire state economy being criminal and run by organized crime—organized crime has in many ways replaced the state (Hughes 3). Unfortunately this criminalized state has left Russia very unwilling to acknowledge that there is even a problem in the trafficking of women, much less cope with this problem—this attitude has led to most of the laws aimed at controlling human sex trafficking being defeated in the Duma (Hughes 3). With so little recognition and no laws to prevent it organized crime and human trafficking have flourished in Eastern Europe—it is because of this that Eastern Europe is rapidly passing Asia as a primary source for women being trafficked into prostitution. “Many people have suffered since the collapse of the Soviet Union, but women and children have suffered disproportionately” (Hughes 4). Some women interviewed have mentioned corruption and threats from organized crime as one of the reasons they are willing to take the risk of answering advertisements or using “marriage agencies” to find jobs outside of Russia or to marry western men (Hughes 5).

During the time of Communist rule women in Russia enjoyed a great deal more equality with men than women in other countries—and even then women were not completely equal to men, with certain jobs being termed “women’s work” and high concentrations of women being found in these jobs (Hughes 7). After the collapse of the Soviet Union there was a shift in jobs and salaries and many men took over the “women’s work” of previous times—this left a great many highly educated and unemployed women and was a major hit against families and women both (Hughes 6). This unemployment creates a pool of women who are ripe for victimization by trafficking schemes—they are often quite desperate for work and money to take care of their families and can easily be recruited through any number of the schemes discussed previously (Hughes 7). Women are easily victimized when they are desperate for employment—in Moscow alone there are over 400 employment agencies offering employment abroad, as well as any number of unregistered, illegal agencies as well (Hughes 9). Often these agencies put a great deal of effort into looking legitimate, and while some of them are legitimate employment agencies it can be impossible to tell the legitimate agencies from the traffickers (Hughes 9).

Women were supposedly equal to men in the Soviet Union—as a consequence violence against women was often ignored, now in the Russian Federation women are not at all equal to men and because of their lower status they are more often the victims of violence and blames for many of society’s problems (Hughes 11). The desire to escape this societal situation can drive women to take risks they might not otherwise take with regard to work abroad and other offers utilized by traffickers. Domestic violence is also a common reason for children to run away from home—these runaways become prime

targets for traffickers because they have no other way to make the money they need to survive; girls in these situations are especially vulnerable, having seen their mothers beaten they come to see women as inferior and have very little self-respect (Hughes 11). Very little research was done on sexual violence during Soviet control, and due to this there are very few resources for recovery from sexual assault available to women now. This has also contributed to sexual assault being highly stigmatized in Russia—women do not seek help because they may be ridiculed or mistreated more because they have been sexually abused (Hughes 12). “Victims of these types of violence are more vulnerable to recruitment by traffickers as they seek to escape violence and may be more prone to say to themselves, ‘Nothing can be worse than this’” (Hughes 13).

Perestroika and the fall of the Soviet Union brought a flood of Western media into Russia, included in this flood were vast images of western “glamour.” These images were embraced by Russian women as an alternative to the enforced drabness of the Soviet system (Hughes 13). The decline in living standards in Russia, combined with an in-rush of images of the supposed glamorous Western lifestyle have made many women keen to immigrate to these countries—often the countries depicted are also receiving locations for women trafficked for prostitution (Hughes 13). The media has glamorized and romanticized prostitution, and the increasing focus on appearance and body has created a situation in which many women feel that they will not get anywhere without having sex with any number of men (Hughes 14). The sudden influx of sexualization has made it difficult for many women to differentiate between liberalization and exploitation (Hughes 14). Some of the first women trafficked in Russia were models—women were

offered a chance to “model abroad” but instead found themselves trapped in the sex industry (Hughes 15).

Given the obviously serious problem worldwide and particularly with in Eastern Europe of human trafficking for prostitution—what is being done to stop these crimes? As was previously mentioned, it was very difficult for a long time to get laws passed in the Russian Duma that would make trafficking illegal and protect women because the government wouldn’t acknowledge that trafficking was an issue. Even today Russia is on the U.S. State Department’s Tier 2 Watch List for the fourth consecutive year due to insufficient efforts to reduce human trafficking in the country. Legislation pending before the Duma was neither passed nor enacted in 2006 (Billings 174). Russia has show modest progress in law enforcement efforts, but this is not enough by itself (Billings 174). “Overall, victim protection and assistance remains the weakest component of Russia’s anti-trafficking efforts” (Billings 174). Similar problems are seen in the Ukraine—which is also on the Tier 2 Watch List for failing to demonstrate sufficient progress in combating trafficking (Billings 204). The Ukrainian government prohibits all forms of trafficking, yet last year the vast majority of those prosecuted for trafficking received probation rather than jail sentences—a situation that is unacceptable at best (Billings 204).

“As a result of the federal Trafficking Victims Protection Act of 2000, bringing foreign victims into the United States and coercing them into performing sex acts in a felony” (Hughes 1). In 2002 the investigation and prosecution of trafficking cases was made a priority for U.S. Attorneys by Attorney General John Ashcroft (Hughes 1). While the progresses made in the United States are only dealing with the tip of the

iceberg in regards to human trafficking they are progresses being made nonetheless. Frequently law enforcement officials don't know about human trafficking until they encounter a case where they must deal with it—often these investigators found that once their awareness grew they felt the urge to review past cases and see what they may have missed (Hughes 1). Unfortunately citizens of the United States of in many ways moved away from the notion that prostitution in slavery—instead we see it as a sort of victimless crime; this kind of thinking leads to many missed victims (Hughes 2). Views on victims play an immense role in investigating any sort of prostitution in the United States. These views were somewhat hampered by the Clinton administration's policies, which differentiated between free working prostitutes and forced prostitution. This policy also dismissed any connection between human trafficking and flourishing prostitution—leading to the faulty conclusion that a flourishing sex industry did not lead to increased human sex trafficking (Hughes 2). “The Bush administration took a different approach, one that valued the dignity of each person and her right to be free from abuse and exploitation” (Hughes 2). This policy states that prostitution is inherently harmful and connected to human trafficking—this necessarily sets the bar high for the eradication of human trafficking and exploitation, the only way to prevent abuse (Hughes 2).

One of the major problems facing law enforcement officials and lawmakers with regards to human trafficking is a lack of cohesive laws that can be applied across national boundaries. While there are some international codes that are useful in defining human trafficking in general international agencies lack the law enforcement ability to make these laws stick. While there have been step in the right direction—such as President Bush's call to the United Nations for “clear standards” with regard to human

trafficking—these steps simply aren't enough (Hughes 1). We have already discussed the provisions of the Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA), which does serve to define trafficking, but is again difficult to enforce in an standard and global manner. According to the "Trafficking in Persons Report" the goal of international law enforcement with regard to human trafficking needs to be two fold—first to arrest and punish the perpetrators of these crimes and second to provide care for the victims of these human rights abuses (37). While the UN TIP Protocol, a supplement to the UN Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime, clearly supports both of these goals simple support is not enough—it must be the jobs of the individual nations to make and enforce laws that put an end to human trafficking and modern-slavery. One of the reason's victim care must be so primary is because if victims see that they do not need to fear law enforcement they may be more willing to come forward—this alone would make the job of investigators, police, and prosecutors much more possible simply because victim cooperation cannot be bought or forced, often it is a trust that must be earned (Billings 37). These goals are the primary reasons for the U.S. State Departments Tier rating system and for the Trafficking Victims Protection Reauthorization Act (TVPRA) which adds to the original law the requirement that foreign governments provide to the Department of State data on trafficking conviction, law enforcement, prosecution, and sentencing is order to be considered for compliance levels—this is the basis of the rating system (Billings 36). One place that has made notable strides towards these goals is the Czech Republic—the national organized crime unit of the police created a specialized investigative department to combat labor trafficking; this allows a great deal of time and manpower to be focused upon the fight against human trafficking (Billings 38).

Faced with these complex issues and problems globally and locally we must consider where human trafficking is going and where international and national law enforcement and laws need to go in order to end modern-day slavery. A great many activist groups exist, often calling themselves modern day abolitionists, this should show the world and our leaders that people are ready for this to end now—but how should this be done?

There are a great many factors and options which must be considered with regard to human trafficking—not the least of which is victim safety. Strides are being made in the correct direction as far as international law—what is needed there is a cohesive and enforceable international code as well as an international body capable of enforcing that code. Given the levels of autonomy amongst national governments what is a more realistic option is that each nation must be held accountable for the actions that take place within and across its borders—the Department of State’s Tier System and Watch List are both steps in the right direction on this matter, holding individual nations accountable for the activities in their country. Another thing that must change before effective worldwide change can be achieved is the undermining within the anti-trafficking movement—there are many within the movement who attempt to stop efforts to end the sex trade, citing that legalized prostitution will stop the abuse (Hughes 1). This attitude is only serving to harm any potential progress because it denies a connection between prostitution and human trafficking for sex slavery; some of these supporters of prostitution go so far as to suggest that the TVPA should not be used at all but instead all cases of sex slavery should be treated as forced labor cases (Hughes 1). This attitude is undermining to the goals of the anti-trafficking movement and must be rejected in order for significant

international progress to be made—otherwise we will simply continue to hide our heads in the sand and pretend that nothing is wrong.

The solution to the human sex trade in Eastern Europe may actually lie in part in the hands of receiving and transport countries, rather than only in the hands of sending countries. One factor that Donna Hughes, the number one expert in the United States, frequently cites as under considered in most cases is the demand factor. Human trafficking can only exist if there is a constant demand for prostitution, if we end the demand the trafficking for sex slavery must also end. Many efforts to combat trafficking are focused on the sending countries—warning women against suspicious advertisements and making clear the consequences of trafficking, and while reducing the supply of victims is a worthy goal, it is incredibly one sided (Hughes 2). A more comprehensive plan would focus also on the demand side of the equation, making those who patronize illegal sex businesses accountable for their actions—holding them personally accountable for the fact that their actions contribute to an illegal sex trade (Hughes 2). Steps are being taken in this direction—in his 2003 address to the United Nations, previously mentioned here, President Bush stated his views on the role of demand in the sex trade: “Those who patronize this industry debase themselves and deepen the misery of others” (Hughes 2). A strong stance of this nature is required from every lawmaker and enforcer in every receiving country in the world if we have any hope of even beginning to combat trafficking for sex slavery.

Several factors must be considered with regard to demand—the first is that there are adults in the world who seek to purchase sex acts from women and children; without these people and the demand they place upon the system the human sex trade could not

exist (Hughes 2). Another factor to be considered are the profiteers, those who are making money by keeping women in forced sex slavery—these are pimps, brothel owners, traffickers, and even corrupt officials who are bribed to turn a blind eye; all of these men and women contribute to the demand by making a profit from it and supplying women for the people who seek to purchase sex acts (Hughes 2). A final factor in creating demand is our culture. Our culture normalizes prostitution, makes it an acceptable and even romantic or glamorous trade—the depiction of prostitution in the media and those who claim that legalized prostitution is good for women’s rights all contribute to the demand for human sex slaves (Hughes 2). Suggestions that prostitution is a victimless crime are disturbingly naïve and completely overlook the violence and victimization often involved (Hughes 3). All three of these factors are supported and made possible by a culture that views females as second class—without the cultural stigma of simply being a woman many of these factors would not be possible; as was discussed with regard to Eastern Europe—as long as women are treated as second class citizens they will be subject to victimization and violence (Hughes 3).

In part the view that prostitution is somehow “okay” is upheld by the myth that some, even many, women want to be prostitutes—there have now been studies done that prove that this simply isn’t so. A nine-country study of 854 individuals in prostitution revealed that 89 percent of them wanted to escape prostitution (Hughes 4). Another study done in 1998 in on sex industries in Indonesia, Thailand, the Philippines, and Malaysia found that 96 percent of the people interviewed would leave prostitution if they were able to (Hughes 4). A third study done in 1995 in San Francisco found that 88 percent of the 130 women who were interviewed wanted to leave prostitution (Hughes 5).

This overwhelming evidence put the lie to claims that prostitution is somehow fulfilling or helpful to women's rights movements—there is a distinct difference between sexual freedom and the need to sell one's body in order to survive.

A variety of tactics have been used to attempt to slow the demand by purchasers of sex acts for prostitution. The most simple and obvious measure is the criminalization of those who purchase sex acts—laws to this effect have been implemented in several countries, including Macedonia and Croatia, Sweden, and Finland—Sweden was the first country to institute these laws, hopefully others will follow (Hughes 25). A popular method in the United States has been what are referred to as car confiscation programs. In these programs men who are arrested for soliciting prostitutes have their cars confiscated and must work with the court to get their vehicle back (Hughes 29). While many law enforcement officials feel this program is a success at deterring men from purchasing sex acts it has been challenged legally, however in 1996 the U.S. Supreme Court upheld a law of this nature in Michigan (Hughes 29). Another, more worldwide issue, is combating those who travel to purchase sex acts—in a Norwegian study it was found that 80 percent of men who purchase sex acts do so abroad (Hughes 30). There are now 32 countries which have laws known as extra-territorial laws—these laws allow for citizens to be punished for crimes committed abroad, regardless of whether or not the crime is illegal in that country where it was committed (Hughes 30). The United States PROTECT Act of 2003 (Prosecuting Remedies and Tools Against the Exploitation of Children Today Act of 2003) is an example of this sort of law—through PROTECT American men are now subject to domestic child abuse and child exploitation laws even if the crime is committed abroad, the law also increases the maximum penalty to 30 years

imprisonment; it is clear that the PROTECT Act is designed to criminalize those who patronize Child Sex Tourism (Hughes 30). A recently popular trend in the United States and Canada has been the institution of “John Schools,” designed with the notion of rehabilitating those who purchase sex acts rather than simply criminalizing them (Hughes 31). These schools educate men about the harm their behavior causes—to women, to children, and to society; generally these schools are part of a first offender program, designed to get people thinking about what they are doing (Hughes 31).

Just as simply working to reduce the number of victimizable women is not enough to stop human sex trafficking, neither is reducing demand alone going to be a magical fix that will solve this large and criminal problem. A variety of methods must be used in coordination with one another. Law enforcement officials and investigators should be trained in how to recognize forced labor and human trafficking when they come across it and in how to react when such illegal businesses are found—this will begin the help victims be identified and make sure that valuable evidence is not lost due to misunderstanding or incomplete training. Nations that are primary sending nations must begin to crack down on false advertising and entrapment scams; these nations also need to educate women about how to avoid victimization and make sure it is illegal to traffic people within the country. High demand nations should take into account the various methods listed above for reducing demand—it is the responsibility of every nation to prevent its own citizens from helping continue the cycle of abuse. High demand nations are also responsible for finding and prosecuting those who are making money off the human sex trade—both in the form of corrupt officials and traffickers and brothels owners or pimps. If receiving nations can stop demand sending nations will have

nowhere to send women to, similarly if sending nations can stop trafficking women the receiving nations will have nothing to receive. Finally it is important for governments to work together—trafficking is a transnational crime, making it far more difficult to prosecute than crimes committed within one country. Traffickers often hold multiple citizenships or visas and can escape the country if they are in danger of being caught. It is the responsibility of federal law enforcement agencies to work together and to work with international law enforcement bodies to catch these criminals and make it clear to the world that human trafficking and abuse will not be tolerated. Increased public awareness has given hope for the future—now it is the responsibility of every person in government to heed this awareness and put a stop to human trafficking worldwide.

Works Cited

- Ballard, Elza Perry. Class Lecture. University of Tennessee, Knoxville, TN. 26 April 2007.
- Billings, Rebecca, et. al. "Trafficking In Person's Report." U.S. Department of State Publication 11407. Revised June 2007.
- Hughes, Donna M. "A Special Evil: Bush v. Slavery." *National Review Online*. 26 September 2003: 1-2.
- Hughes, Donna M. "Best Practices to Address the Demand Side of Sex Trafficking." Women's Studies Program, University of Rhode Island. August 2004.
- Hughes, Donna M. "Nyet to Trafficking." *National Review Online*. 18 June 2003: 1-2.
- Hughes, Donna M. "Supplying Women for the Sex Industry: Trafficking from the Russian Federation." The University of Rhode Island.
- Hughes, Donna M. "Traffic Lights." *National Review Online*. 2 August 2004: 1-3.
- Hughes, Donna M. and Tatyana Denisova. "Trafficking in Women from Ukraine." U.S. Ukraine Research Partnership. 2002.
- Hughes, Donna M. "Wolves in Sheep's Clothing." *National Review Online*. 9 October 2002: 1-2.
- "Slavery: It's Not History Yet." *Weekly Reader*. 2 April 2007: 4-5.