2007

When the diagnosis is disaster: Ethics and human rights

Susan Speraw
University of Tennessee, ssperaw@utk.edu

Follow this and additional works at: http://trace.tennessee.edu/utk_nurspubs

Recommended Citation
When the diagnosis is disaster: Ethics & human rights

Susan Speraw, PhD, RN
The University of Tennessee College of Nursing
Knoxville, TN, USA

International Council of Nurses
Yokohama, Japan

2007
Mass Casualty & Training

- Quality response to disaster impacted by quality of training and education of responders
- Nature of disasters has potential global impact
  - Global = borderless
  - Avian flu (H5N1) and threat of pandemic

Questions:
- What is essential content in education?
- At what level of practice should such education occur?
UN Declaration on Human Rights

December 10, 1948

- Generally Assembly requested this to be disseminated, displayed and taught in schools, without regard for political status of countries, territories
- 39 articles

Affirm “inherent dignity and inalienable rights of all members of the human family”

- Act toward each other in spirit of brotherhood
- No one held in slavery
- No distinction of any kind, such as race, color, gender, language, religion, political or other opinion, national or social origin, property, birth or other status
- Right to life, liberty, security, nationality
- Freedom of movement within borders; and freedom to go outside of borders and back again
- Family has the right to protection
- Freedom of conscience, thought, expression
- Recognition as a person in front of the law
Human Rights & Teaching Nursing

Human rights “assumed”
- Value of human beings central to nursing

Common meaning cannot be assumed
- Groups with differing status world-wide
  - Women
  - Children
  - Persons with disabilities

Burden of content / knowledge forces didactic choices
- Boards of nursing / accreditation requirements or limits on courses of study
- What is essential to “basic” nursing?

Personal “world view” involves core values, perceptions, assumptions that are rarely articulated
Ethics & Nursing

- Science of human duty; the body of rules of duty
- The rules or standards governing the conduct of a person or the members of a profession
- Systematizing, defending, and recommending concepts of right and wrong behavior
  - Meta-ethics: where our moral principles come from and what they mean
  - Normative ethics regulates right & wrong conduct
  - Applied ethics: how principles apply to specific situations
An Example of Ethical Principles

Question: Abortion

Meta-ethics asks: Where do rights come from? What kinds of beings have rights?

Normative ethics: Right of self-determination; Right to life

Applied ethics: Is abortion a “right” or ethical decision if the mother’s life is in danger? If the fetus has a genetic disorder incompatible with life under any circumstance? In the case of rape or incest? If the mother has a mental defect?
Ethics in Today’s News  (CNN.com 05/30/07)

- CDC: Airline passengers may have been exposed to drug-resistant Tuberculosis

- Two flights involved:
  - Air France 385 on May 12
  - Czech Air 0104 on May 24

- Should the US have stopped passenger from traveling?
Ethics as Topic for Instruction

Where does ethics fit into nursing curricula?

- Assumed?
- Subsumed?

Do we even need it?

- When we send sons & daughters to college or school, what do we want them to learn?
  - To graduate, thinking just like us?
  - To have their own ideas and ideals?
  - Do we want them to be critical thinkers?
## Critical Thinking: Guide to action

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Conceptualize</th>
<th>Gathered by…</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Apply</td>
<td>Observation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analyze</td>
<td>Experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Synthesize</td>
<td>Reflection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evaluate…</td>
<td>Reasoning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>information</td>
<td>Communication</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Based on universal intellectual values: clarity, accuracy, good reasons, precision, consistency, depth, relevance, evidence, breadth, and fairness

Entails examination of thought: purpose, concepts, empirical grounding; reasoning, assumptions, leading to conclusions, implications and alternative viewpoints
# Things that make our educational and professional challenges greater

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nature of the world</th>
<th>Nature of health care</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Have v. have not disparities greater (national &amp; international)</td>
<td>Profit-focused; $$ driven</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Global societies (&gt; obligation)</td>
<td>Short-stays</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Incidence of disasters</td>
<td>Greater acuity of illness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Politically influenced</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nature of nursing</th>
<th>Nature of nurses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Technologically-rich in more developed countries</td>
<td>Technology-savvy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 hour shifts ⇒ fatigue</td>
<td>Technology &amp; media influenced</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less emphasis on time, story, touch, basic assessment (non-technologically based)</td>
<td>Interest in “blood &amp; guts”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Time and story” at odds w/ profits-drive of corporations</td>
<td>Desensitized adrenalin “rush”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>“Being with” is lesser/ less skilled care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Interest in economic security</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Youth and lack of experience</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Ethics in Instruction

- A subject for undergraduates/diploma?
- A subject for graduates and researchers?
- Where to place it?
- How many of us have completed NIH-NCI Human Participant Protections Education for Research Teams certificate self-learning module?
Why Nurses Need to Know

Questions we never thought we would confront

- Who is dead?
  - How can you tell in the absence of senses?
    - In the absence of usual signs?
  - What can be ask nurses to do with regard to those presumed dead?

- Who is “qualified” to perform procedures?
  - How much to involve children?
    - How alone can we leave them to make decisions?

- Is it right to deprive nurses of physical freedom to assure care? How far can we go?

- Who is our patient? What are we obligated to do for them?
  - “The sick”?
  - The family?
  - Neighbors?
  - Community members?
Questions of Concern to Us: Framing our behavior

- Worrying about staff productivity
- Exposing patients to ridicule? Or preserving dignity?
  - Mardi Gras costumes
- Short supplies / wrong supplies
- “Looting” vs. “Borrowing to save life”
- Broken promises (“We’re coming!”)
- Taking weapons to work
- Who to evacuate? Patients? Families? Staff?
- Hiding identity as health professional—refusing to serve? Or preserving sanity?
What we can demand to know

- Health care facility responsibility
  - For patients
  - For staff
  - For administration?
  - For staff families/friends?

How can we “discharge” if they have nowhere to go? Boarder status?
  - If they don’t leave are they still patients? Do responsibilities to boarders change?
  - Or are they human beings first?

- Liability for behavior under duress
  - Abandonment in the face of hopelessness and duty to family vs. rescue at hand?
Are there any decisions that are not ethical at their core?
Our Responsibilities as Educators & Practitioners

- Prepare
- Consider hard questions
- Be willing to accept ambiguity
- Be willing to make decisions that are impossible
- Train students to face impossible choices
  - To plan for actions that are unthinkable
  - To articulate a rationale for what they have done
    - To face that decisions that look “right” in the moment may not be deemed “right” through lens of time
- Teach peers and students to care for each other in disaster (“Talk each other down”)
- Increase our own awareness of global realities and our role in global society
  - Venture beyond our own comfort zones
  - As ourselves “why” we believe and think as we do
Our Responsibilities

- Challenge ourselves to be informed
- Challenge ourselves to think in new ways
  - To accept our responsibilities in the world
- Challenge ourselves to change
- Encourage our sons and daughters to think and reason for themselves, and then challenge their thinking
- Make “ethics” and “human rights” part of our language and part of the way we live our lives
Susan Speraw, PhD, RN
Director, Homeland Security Nursing:
For homelands around the world

The University of Tennessee – Knoxville
USA
ssperaw@utk.edu