4-24-2006

Tennessee Municipal Benchmarking Project
FY2005

Al Major
Municipal Technical Advisory Service, Alan.Major@tennessee.edu

Follow this and additional works at: http://trace.tennessee.edu/utk_mtas_tmbp
Part of the Public Administration Commons

Recommended Citation
http://trace.tennessee.edu/utk_mtas_tmbp/6

This Report is brought to you for free and open access by the Municipal Technical Advisory Service (MTAS) at Trace: Tennessee Research and Creative Exchange. It has been accepted for inclusion in Tennessee Municipal Benchmarking Project by an authorized administrator of Trace: Tennessee Research and Creative Exchange. For more information, please contact trace@utk.edu.
TENNESSEE MUNICIPAL BENCHMARKING PROJECT

FY 2005 ANNUAL REPORT

PREPARED BY:

ALAN MAJOR
FINANCE & ACCOUNTING CONSULTANT

MTAS Municipal Technical Advisory Service
In cooperation with the Tennessee Municipal League
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TABLE OF CONTENTS</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COMMITTEE MEMBERS</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RESIDENTIAL REFUSE COLLECTED AND DISPOSAL</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>POLICE</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FIRE</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TENNESSEE MUNICIPAL BENCHMARKING PROJECT
FY 2005 ANNUAL REPORT
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This is the 2005 Annual Report of the Tennessee Municipal Benchmarking Project (TMBP). This is the fourth year of developing these comparisons. The performance and financial data is based on the actual results for the year ended June 30, 2005.

While every effort has been made to ensure the completeness and accuracy of the data used, there can be errors and inconsistencies in the reported information that may affect the results. Although we strive for an “apples to apples” comparison, there are exceptions. Sometimes, a city department provides a broader level of service or a higher quality of service than the norm. There is a narrative description of each city’s service describing unique situations that affect their performance measures. The graphs only tell part of the performance story.

There are eleven cities in this report. They are presented in ascending order of population. The populations of the cities range from 13,334 to 155,554. Those cities are Athens, Maryville, Brentwood, Cleveland, Collierville, Bartlett, Kingsport, Franklin, Murfreesboro, Clarksville, and Chattanooga.

This report could only be completed with the tremendous efforts from all the committee members. Thanks to all the steering committee members who reviewed their city’s departmental performance measures and prepared their financial data.

Although I put this report together, it was with the concerted efforts of several MTAS staff including Armintha Loveday, Francis O’ Brien, Sharon Rollins, Rex Barton, Ray Crouch, Dick Phebus and Ralph Cross.

There are three services measured and benchmarked in this report: residential refuse collection and disposal, police services, and fire services. There will be an addendum for select financial data. We are working on other services that may appear in the 2005 addendum. Each departmental service section begins with a
service description, next the raw data and performance measures is presented, and then each city’s graphs.

**COST DATA**

The cost data includes all direct costs of providing the service plus significant overhead items such as insurance, benefits administrations, and fleet maintenance.

The direct costs are generally those controlled by the departmental budget authority. The direct costs in this report are the actual expenditures for the year ended June 30, 2005.

The overhead or indirect cost items represent significant operational costs that are often budgeted in another department. These overhead costs are allocated to the service departments. Allocations are made based on the most appropriate method for the cost to be allocated.

The most common allocation method is the number of the service department employees divided by the total number of city employees. The resulting percentage is multiplied times an overhead cost to arrive at the amount to be allocated to the service department. Also, depreciation expense is calculated and added as indirect cost of service delivery. The resulting total cost of providing these services is comparable to that in the private sector.

**RESIDENTIAL REFUSE COLLECTION & DISPOSAL**

Residential refuse collection is the collection of household refuses from residential premises and other locations. The cost of disposal is included. Interestingly, some cities enjoy free tipping fees. For some, that contract for the service, the disposal cost is part of the package.

The service excludes waste from commercial dumpsters, yard waste, brush pickup, and leaves, collection of recyclable material and any other special or non-routine service. Some cities
are not involved in the refuse collection business at all as citizens contract directly with a private vendor.

**POLICE**

Police services consist of traditional law enforcement functions, including patrol, investigations, and police administration. These functions encompass preventive patrols, traffic enforcement, responding to calls for service, and investigation of crimes.

Specifically excluded from the service definition are: animal control and emergency communications (dispatch). The service definition does include all support personnel and services, except those relating to animal control and emergency communications.

**FIRE**

Fire services consist of the entire range of services provided by the city’s Fire Department, which may include fire suppression, fire prevention, fire code inspections, fire safety education, arson investigation, rescue, and/or Emergency Medical Services.

Readers are cautioned to avoid generalized conclusions regarding any particular city’s performance using the limited information gathered for this report. Comparison of government performance is a very inexact science, and the primary goal of the project is to provide a few more pieces of information to the managers and decision makers in the participating cities to assist in their management of the city. It is not the intention of this report to absolutely rank any city’s performance against the other participant cities, and users of the report are urged to bear that in mind as they read it.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NAME</th>
<th>CITY</th>
<th>TITLE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mike Keith</td>
<td>Athens</td>
<td>Finance Director</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mark Brown</td>
<td>Bartlett</td>
<td>Finance Director</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kirk Bednar</td>
<td>Brentwood</td>
<td>Assistant City Manager</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brian Smart</td>
<td>Chattanooga</td>
<td>Accounting Manager</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wilbur Berry</td>
<td>Clarksville</td>
<td>Finance Director</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Janice Casteel</td>
<td>Cleveland</td>
<td>Director of F &amp; A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David Smoak</td>
<td>Collierville</td>
<td>Asst. to City Manager</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Russ Truell</td>
<td>Franklin</td>
<td>Finance Director</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ray Griffin, Jr</td>
<td>Kingsport</td>
<td>City Manager</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John Tate</td>
<td>Maryville</td>
<td>Finance Director</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rob Lyons</td>
<td>Murfreesboro</td>
<td>Assistant City Manager</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NAME</th>
<th>CITY</th>
<th>TITLE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Shawn Lindsey</td>
<td>Athens</td>
<td>Public Works Director</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bill Yearwood</td>
<td>Bartlett</td>
<td>Public Works Manager</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Brentwood</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beverly Pasley</td>
<td>Chattanooga</td>
<td>Dep.Adm.Public Works</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Clarksville</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tom Grant</td>
<td>Cleveland</td>
<td>Public Works Director</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dynette Wisher</td>
<td>Collierville</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joe Williams</td>
<td>Franklin</td>
<td>Solid Waste Director</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Betsy Dale</td>
<td>Kingsport</td>
<td>Sanitation Mgr.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rick Whaley</td>
<td>Maryville</td>
<td>Public Works Manager</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joey Smith</td>
<td>Murfreesboro</td>
<td>Public Works Director</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## POLICE COMMITTEE:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NAME</th>
<th>CITY</th>
<th>TITLE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chuck Ziegler</td>
<td>Athens</td>
<td>Chief</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mark Hopper</td>
<td>Bartlett</td>
<td>Assistant Chief</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jeff Hughes</td>
<td>Brentwood</td>
<td>Lieutenant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lon Elders</td>
<td>Chattanooga</td>
<td>Accreditation Manager</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mark Smith</td>
<td>Clarksville</td>
<td>Deputy Chief</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wes Snyder</td>
<td>Cleveland</td>
<td>Chief</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jim Wilson</td>
<td>Collierville</td>
<td>Accreditation Manager</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jackie Moore</td>
<td>Franklin</td>
<td>Chief</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David Quillin</td>
<td>Kingsport</td>
<td>Deputy Chief</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tony Crisp</td>
<td>Maryville</td>
<td>Chief</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glenn Chrisman</td>
<td>Murfreesboro</td>
<td>Chief</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## FIRE COMMITTEE:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NAME</th>
<th>CITY</th>
<th>TITLE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bob Miller</td>
<td>Athens</td>
<td>Chief</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gary Graves</td>
<td>Bartlett</td>
<td>Assistant Chief</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kenny Lane</td>
<td>Brentwood</td>
<td>Chief</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kelvin L. Flint</td>
<td>Chattanooga</td>
<td>Assistant Chief</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mike Roberts</td>
<td>Clarksville</td>
<td>Chief</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rick Atchley</td>
<td>Cleveland</td>
<td>Chief</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Richard Arwood</td>
<td>Collierville</td>
<td>Assistant Chief</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rocky Garzarek</td>
<td>Franklin</td>
<td>Chief</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charles A. White</td>
<td>Kingsport</td>
<td>Chief</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ed Mitchell</td>
<td>Maryville</td>
<td>Chief</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David Baxter</td>
<td>Murfreesboro</td>
<td>Chief</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
RESIDENTIAL REFUSE COLLECTION AND DISPOSAL SERVICE

TENNESSEE MUNICIPAL BENCHMARKING PROJECT
FY 2005 ANNUAL REPORT
Residential Refuse Collection and Disposal
Service Definition and Terms

Service Definition

Routinely scheduled collection of household refuse or garbage from residential premises and other locations, including small businesses, using containers small enough that residents and/or workers can move or lift them manually. This service may include small bulky items. The service excludes waste from commercial dumpsters, yard waste and leaves, collection of recyclable material and any other special or non-routine service. Transportation of refuse to the disposal site (landfill or transfer station) is included, and disposal costs (tipping fees) are included for the first time.

This service is provided by 9 of the 11 cities participating in the project. Brentwood and Clarksville do not provide residential solid waste collection.

Definitions of Terms Used

Residential Refuse Collected – This figure includes household refuse collected on a regularly-scheduled basis, and those small businesses who use residential-sized containers that are collected on the same schedule as residences.

Residential Collection Points – A collection point is a single home, or an apartment or duplex unit or small business that has residential-sized containers that do not exceed the number of containers and/or capacity limit for residential service. It does not include commercial-sized containers that service multiple housing units, apartments or businesses.

Service Requests – This is a written or oral request that is recorded and requires an action. Examples would include missed pickups, spillage, missing containers or lids, traffic problems involving collection vehicles, etc. It excludes general information requests.

Tons of Refuse Collected Per FTE Employee – This measure is applied only to those cities that collect residential refuse with city employees and equipment (Bartlett, Chattanooga, Collierville, Kingsport, Knoxville, and Maryville) rather than through a contractor. It is a measure of the efficiency of the city refuse work crews, and is not available from contractors. An FTE is defined as 2,080 hours per year, which is one year at 40 hours per week.
## CITY DATA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AE</th>
<th>Population</th>
<th>City Area (sq. miles)</th>
<th>City Road Miles</th>
<th>Resid. Refuse Collected (Tons)</th>
<th>Residential Collection Points</th>
<th>Number of Full Time Equivalents</th>
<th>Service Requests</th>
<th>Collection Location:</th>
<th>Crews:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Athens</td>
<td>13,334</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>3,765</td>
<td>4,360</td>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>108</td>
<td>X X X X X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maryville</td>
<td>23,120</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>163</td>
<td>8,006</td>
<td>9,429</td>
<td>7.8</td>
<td>1,027</td>
<td>X X X X X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cleveland</td>
<td>37,192</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>268</td>
<td>10,721</td>
<td>12,873</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>750</td>
<td>X X X X X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collierville</td>
<td>41,923</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>257</td>
<td>14,575</td>
<td>12,603</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>763</td>
<td>X X X X X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bartlett</td>
<td>43,354</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>221</td>
<td>24,841</td>
<td>15,140</td>
<td>12.0</td>
<td>1,531</td>
<td>X X X X X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kingsport</td>
<td>44,905</td>
<td></td>
<td>423</td>
<td>16,125</td>
<td>16,250</td>
<td>16.5</td>
<td>583</td>
<td>X X X X X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Collection Frequency:
- **Curbside**
- **Back Door** Limited

### Crews:
- **City**
- **Contract**

### Residential Collection Fees
- $329,613
- $0
- $926,856
- $756,180
- $3,088,560
- $0

### Total Cost
- $500,971
- $690,687
- $1,035,185
- $719,233
- $2,335,608
- $1,610,407

## CALCULATED BENCHMARKS

### WORKLOAD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Tons/1,000 Population</th>
<th>Tons/1,000 Collection Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Athens</td>
<td>282</td>
<td>864</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maryville</td>
<td>346</td>
<td>849</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cleveland</td>
<td>288</td>
<td>833</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collierville</td>
<td>348</td>
<td>1,156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bartlett</td>
<td>573</td>
<td>1,641</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kingsport</td>
<td>359</td>
<td>992</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### EFFICIENCY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Cost/Ton Collected</th>
<th>Cost/Ton Collected - Curbside</th>
<th>Cost/Ton Collected - Back Door</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Athens</td>
<td>$133</td>
<td>$133</td>
<td>$115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maryville</td>
<td>$86</td>
<td>$86</td>
<td>$73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cleveland</td>
<td>$97</td>
<td>$97</td>
<td>$80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collierville</td>
<td>$49</td>
<td>$49</td>
<td>$57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bartlett</td>
<td>$94</td>
<td>$94</td>
<td>$154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kingsport</td>
<td>$100</td>
<td>$100</td>
<td>$99</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Cost/Collection Point</th>
<th>Cost/Collection Point - Curbside</th>
<th>Cost/Collection Point - Back Door</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Athens</td>
<td>$115</td>
<td>$115</td>
<td>$154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maryville</td>
<td>$73</td>
<td>$73</td>
<td>$154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cleveland</td>
<td>$80</td>
<td>$80</td>
<td>$57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collierville</td>
<td>$57</td>
<td>$57</td>
<td>$57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bartlett</td>
<td>$154</td>
<td>$154</td>
<td>$99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kingsport</td>
<td>$99</td>
<td>$99</td>
<td>$99</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Tons Collected/FTE (2,080 hrs.)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Athens</td>
<td>784</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maryville</td>
<td>1,026</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cleveland</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collierville</td>
<td>2,915</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bartlett</td>
<td>2,070</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kingsport</td>
<td>977</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### EFFECTIVENESS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Requests Per 1,000 Collect. Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Athens</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maryville</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cleveland</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collierville</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bartlett</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kingsport</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### CITY DATA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Franklin</th>
<th>Murfreesboro</th>
<th>Chattanooga</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Population</td>
<td>46,416</td>
<td>81,393</td>
<td>155,582</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City Area (sq. miles)</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City Road Miles</td>
<td>330</td>
<td>474</td>
<td>1,100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resid. Refuse Collected (Tons)</td>
<td>22,080</td>
<td>31,157</td>
<td>55,186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residential Collection Points</td>
<td>14,972</td>
<td>35,461</td>
<td>70,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Full Time Equivalents</td>
<td>19.0</td>
<td>20.9</td>
<td>43.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Requests</td>
<td>700</td>
<td>8,880</td>
<td>7,621</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collection Location:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curbside</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Back Door</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Limited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collection Frequency:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Once a Week</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Twice a Week</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crews:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contract</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residential Collection Fees</td>
<td>$404,244</td>
<td>$0</td>
<td>$0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Cost</td>
<td>$2,704,703</td>
<td>$1,732,305</td>
<td>$3,667,501</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### CALCULATED BENCHMARKS

#### WORKLOAD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Franklin</th>
<th>Murfreesboro</th>
<th>Chattanooga</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tons/1,000 Population</td>
<td>476</td>
<td>383</td>
<td>355</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tons/1,000 Collection Points</td>
<td>1,475</td>
<td>879</td>
<td>788</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### EFFICIENCY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Franklin</th>
<th>Murfreesboro</th>
<th>Chattanooga</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cost/Ton Collected</td>
<td>$122</td>
<td>$56</td>
<td>$66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost/Ton Collected - Curbside</td>
<td>$122</td>
<td>$56</td>
<td>$66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost/Ton Collected - Back Door</td>
<td>$0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost/Collection Point</td>
<td>$181</td>
<td>$49</td>
<td>$52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost/Collection Point - Curbside</td>
<td>$181</td>
<td>$49</td>
<td>$52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost/Collection Point - Back Door</td>
<td>$0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tons Collected/FTE (2,080 hrs.)</td>
<td>1,162</td>
<td>1,488</td>
<td>1,283</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### EFFECTIVENESS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Franklin</th>
<th>Murfreesboro</th>
<th>Chattanooga</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Requests Per 1,000 Collect. Points</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>250</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CITY OF ATHENS

Residential Refuse Collection and Disposal

Service Level and Delivery

- The City of Athens uses city crews, with a rear loader and 3 man crew to collect residential refuse weekly at curbside. The city picks up residential refuse 4 days a week with 4.8 FTE’s. The other day is used for leaf and brush pickup.

- The city provides a “pride” car service (a big trailer) to any residence at no charge. They utilize 5 trailers and move them every weekday and are available over the weekend. The trailers may be used for any residential refuse except building materials.

- A fee of $6.50/month funds refuse collection and disposal.

- Refuse is transported by city truck approximately 4.5 one-way miles to a County landfill. They make 4 trips per day to the landfill.

- The tipping fee is $16.00 per ton.

Conditions Affecting Service, Performance, and Cost

None.
# Maryville Residential Refuse Collection

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City Profile</th>
<th>Explanatory Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Population: 23,120</td>
<td><strong>Service Level and Delivery</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residential Refuse</td>
<td>Maryville collects residential refuse in thirty-five gallon containers once a week at curbside.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collected (tons): 8,006</td>
<td>The City provides back door pickup for handicapped and disabled residents.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residential Collection Points: 9,429</td>
<td>The City uses rear loading refuse trucks and three men crews on three routes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Requests: 1,027</td>
<td>The trucks average one trip per day to the landfill.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTE Positions: 7.8</td>
<td>The average distance to the landfill is five miles.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>There is no fee for residential service.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Conditions Affecting Service, Performance, and Cost**

Rear loading with a three-man crew is labor intensive and more expensive than using smaller crews and an automated system.

---

TENNESSEE MUNICIPAL BENCHMARKING PROJECT FY 2005 ANNUAL REPORT
RESIDENTIAL REFUSE COLLECTION AND DISPOSAL - ALL CITIES

Tons of Refuse Collected Per 1,000 Population

Tons of Refuse Collected Per 1,000 Collection Points

Tons of Refuse Collected Per FTE Employee

Service Requests Per 1,000 Collection Points

Cost Per Ton of Refuse Collected

Cost Per Ton of Refuse Collected at Curbside

Cost Per Ton of Refuse Collected Per Collection Point

TENNESSEE MUNICIPAL BENCHMARKING PROJECT
FY 2005 ANNUAL REPORT
CITY OF CLEVELAND

Residential Refuse Collection and Disposal

Service Level and Delivery

- The City of Cleveland contracts with Waste Connections of TN, Inc. for once per week curbside collection of residential refuse.
- Backdoor service is provided for handicapped and disabled residents.
- The city does not provide refuse containers.
- The monthly fee of $6.00 funds the costs of refuse collection and disposal.
- Waste Connections of TN, Inc. transports the waste a one-way distance of 14 miles for disposal at Lead Mine Landfill.

Conditions Affecting Service, Performance, and Cost

- The city closely monitors contractor performance and promptly handles complaints.
- Since standard carts are not used, the contractor uses rear-loading collection vehicles. Rear-loaders are less efficient than fully automated side loaders. However, standardized carts must be used with fully automated side-loaders.
- The city also contracts with Waste Connections of TN, Inc. to provide refuse collection for commercial customers.
TENNESSEE MUNICIPAL BENCHMARKING PROJECT
FY 2005 ANNUAL REPORT
CITY OF COLLIERVILLE

Residential Refuse Collection and Disposal

Service Level and Delivery

- The City of Collierville uses city crews, standard 90-gallon carts and fully automated side loaders to collect residential refuse weekly at curbside.
- A fee of $15/month funds refuse collection and disposal as well as collection of brush and bulky items.
- Refuse is disposed at a city-owned transfer station. Then refuse is transported by the city approximately 46 one-way miles to a landfill owned by Waste Connection, Inc., Walnut, Mississippi

Conditions Affecting Service, Performance, and Cost

- The department collects refuse in four nine-hour workdays, Monday-Thursday and 4 hours on Fridays.
- Use of fully automated side loaders has allowed the department to absorb growth without adding staff.
CITY OF BARTLETT

Residential Refuse Collection and Disposal

Service Level and Delivery

- The City of Bartlett uses city crews, standard 90-gallon carts and fully automated side loaders to collect residential refuse weekly at curbside.
- Backdoor service is provided for elderly and handicapped residents.
- A fee of $19/month funds refuse collection and disposal as well as collection of brush and bulky items.
- Refuse is disposed at a city-owned transfer station. Then refuse is transported by the city approximately 13 one-way miles to a BFI landfill.

Conditions Affecting Service, Performance, and Cost

- The number of customers are growing at about 30/month.
- Use of fully automated side loaders has allowed the department to absorb growth without adding staff.
RESIDENTIAL REFUSE COLLECTION AND DISPOSAL - ALL CITIES

ALL CITIES AVERAGE

- Tons of Refuse Collected Per 1,000 Population
- Bartlett
- 9 City Average

ALL CITIES AVERAGE

- Cost Per Ton of Refuse Collected
- Bartlett
- 9 City Average

ALL CITIES AVERAGE

- Tons of Refuse Collected Per 1,000 Collection Points
- Bartlett
- 9 City Average

ALL CITIES AVERAGE

- Cost Per Ton of Refuse Collected at Curbside
- Bartlett
- 9 City Average

ALL CITIES AVERAGE

- Tons of Refuse Collected Per FTE Employee
- Bartlett
- 8 City Average

ALL CITIES AVERAGE

- Service Requests Per 1,000 Collection Points
- Bartlett
- 9 City Average

ALL CITIES AVERAGE

- Cost Per Ton of Refuse Collected Per Collection Point
- Bartlett
- 9 City Average

TENNESSEE MUNICIPAL BENCHMARKING PROJECT
FY 2005 ANNUAL REPORT
## Kingsport Residential Refuse Collection and Disposal

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City Profile</th>
<th>Explanatory Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Population:</strong> 44,905</td>
<td><strong>Service Level and Delivery</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Residential Refuse</strong></td>
<td>The City of Kingsport uses two-men city crews and side loading and rear loading trucks to collect residential refuse weekly at curbside. Backdoor service is available for a fee.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Collected (tons): 16,125</strong></td>
<td>There is no fee for curbside refuse collection and disposal. Customers provide containers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Residential Collection Points: 16,250</strong></td>
<td>Refuse is disposed at a county-owned transfer station. The one-way haul distance is approximately 5 miles.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Service Requests:</strong> 583</td>
<td><strong>Conditions Affecting Service, Performance, and Cost</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>FTE Positions:</strong> 16.5</td>
<td>Re-designed collection routes resulted in the reduction of alley collections.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
RESIDENTIAL REFUSE COLLECTION AND DISPOSAL - ALL CITIES

Tons of Refuse Collected Per 1,000 Population

Kingsport
9 City Average

ALL CITIES AVERAGE

Cost Per Ton of Refuse Collected

Kingsport
9 City Average

ALL CITIES AVERAGE

Tons of Refuse Collected Per 1,000 Collection Points

Kingsport
9 City Average

ALL CITIES AVERAGE

Cost Per Ton of Refuse Collected at Curbside

Kingsport
9 City Average

ALL CITIES AVERAGE

Tons of Refuse Collected Per FTE Employee

Kingsport
9 City Average

ALL CITIES AVERAGE

Service Requests Per 1,000 Collection Points

Kingsport
9 City Average

ALL CITIES AVERAGE

Cost Per Ton of Refuse Collected Per Collection Point

Kingsport
9 City Average

ALL CITIES AVERAGE

TENNESSEE MUNICIPAL BENCHMARKING PROJECT
FY 2005 ANNUAL REPORT
City of Franklin  Residential Refuse Collection and Disposal

The City of Franklin uses city crews and 96-gallon carts to collect residential refuse weekly. Most residential refuse is collected by fully automated sideloaders. However, rear-end loaders are used to collect residential refuse in the immediate area surrounding the Central Downtown Business District. Mini packers are used to collect waste from residences unserviceable by standard means. Each home is eligible for six services per week: 1) containerized, 2) excess waste, 3) yard waste, 4) bulky waste, 5) brush and tree waste, and 6) white goods.

Residential customers pay $2.75 per container per month to cover disposal costs only, with the fee being billed on the water utility bill. The City furnishes one roll out container for each home. If additional containers are needed, they may be purchased for $75.00 per container.

Separated into four divisions, the department provides collection, disposal, fleet maintenance and consulting services to all departments within the City. The department's fleet maintenance division repairs all solid waste equipment and provides maintenance and repair of other City equipment on an “as-needed” basis. The City also operates a 500-ton per day transfer station. The City carries all waste from the transfer station to the Cedar Hill Landfill operated by Waste Management. The landfill is located in Lewisburg, TN, approximately 42 miles one way.

The City of Franklin has a fringe benefit program that is beneficial to its employees.

Franklin revised its pension formula in 2003 to a level that is 33% higher than the Tennessee Consolidated Retirement System. Additionally, Franklin adopted a "25 and out" program that provides full benefits after 25 years of service, regardless of retirement age. Those changes increased pension contributions by the City to 22% of covered payroll.

The City also provides comprehensive medical insurance to employees. The City requires employees to pay 8% of individual coverage and 12% of family coverage premiums. Other benefits, such as blanket life insurance and dental coverage, are provided at low cost or no cost to employees.

For FY06, the employee benefits totaled 43.2% of wages in the General Fund.

TENNESSEE MUNICIPAL BENCHMARKING PROJECT
FY 2005 ANNUAL REPORT
MURFREESBORO

Residential Refuse Collection and Disposal

- The City of Murfreesboro residents pay for Solid Waste services through local taxes so there is no monthly bill for service.

- The City of Murfreesboro provides once per week curbside collection of residential refuse by city crews.

- Limited backdoor pickup is available in special circumstances.

- The City of Murfreesboro provides a 96-gallon cart to each single family household free of charge.

Conditions Affecting Service, Performance, and Cost

- This standardization of container allows for the use of high efficiency equipment and less manpower.
RESIDENTIAL REFUSE COLLECTION AND DISPOSAL - ALL CITIES

ALL CITIES AVERAGE

Murfreesboro | 9 City Average
---|---

Tons of Refuse Collected Per 1,000 Population

- Murfreesboro: 383
- 9 City Average: 379

Tons of Refuse Collected Per 1,000 Collection Points

- Murfreesboro: 879
- 9 City Average: 1,053

Tons of Refuse Collected Per FTE Employee

- Murfreesboro: 1,488
- 8 City Average: 1,463

Service Requests Per 1,000 Collection Points

- Murfreesboro: 250
- 9 City Average: 88

Cost Per Ton of Refuse Collected

- Murfreesboro: $56
- 9 City Average: $89

Cost Per Ton of Refuse Collected at Curbside

- Murfreesboro: $56
- 9 City Average: $89

Cost Per Ton of Refuse Collected Per Collection Point

- Murfreesboro: $49
- 9 City Average: $96

TENNESSEE MUNICIPAL BENCHMARKING PROJECT
FY 2005 ANNUAL REPORT
## Chattanooga

### Residential Refuse Collection and Disposal

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City Profile</th>
<th>Explanatory Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Population:</td>
<td><strong>Service Level and Delivery</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The City of Chattanooga collects residential refuse once per</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>week at the curb. At the door pickup is provided for</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>handicapped and disabled citizens. The city uses primarily</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>fully automated refuse trucks with a one man crew, one semi-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>automated refuse truck with a two man crew, and one</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>conventional rear loader refuse truck with a three man crew.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residential Refuse</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collected (tons):</td>
<td>There are thirteen routes and the trucks make two trips per</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>day to the landfill, which is approximately five miles from</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>the city. There is no fee for refuse collection service.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ninety-five gallon containers are provided where there is</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>automated service.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collection Points:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Conditions Affecting Service, Performance, and Cost</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hilly terrain in many parts of the city necessitates the use</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>of the more costly 2 and 3 man crew vehicles on some routes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Requests:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTE Positions:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Population**: 155,582

**Residential Refuse Collected (tons)**: 55,186

**Residential Collection Points**: 70,000

**Service Requests**: 7,621

**FTE Positions**: 43.0
RESIDENTIAL REFUSE COLLECTION AND DISPOSAL - ALL CITIES

ALL CITIES AVERAGE

Tons of Refuse Collected Per 1,000 Population

Chattanooga

9 City Average

355

379

0 100 200 300 400 500 600 700 800 900

ALL CITIES AVERAGE

Cost Per Ton of Refuse Collected

Chattanooga

9 City Average

$66

$89

0 $100 $200 $300 $400 $500

Tons of Refuse Collected Per 1,000 Collection Points

788

1,053

0 500 1,000 1,500 2,000 2,500 3,000

ALL CITIES AVERAGE

Cost Per Ton of Refuse Collected at Curbside

Chattanooga

9 City Average

$66

$89

0 $100 $200 $300 $400 $500

Tons of Refuse Collected Per FTE Employee

1,283

1,463

0 1,000 2,000 3,000 4,000

ALL CITIES AVERAGE

Cost Per Ton of Refuse Collected Per Collection Point

Chattanooga

9 City Average

$52

$96

0 $100 $200 $300

Service Requests Per 1,000 Collection Points

109

88

0 100 200 300 400

TENNESSEE MUNICIPAL BENCHMARKING PROJECT
FY 2005 ANNUAL REPORT
POLICE SERVICES

TENNESSEE MUNICIPAL BENCHMARKING PROJECT
FY 2005 ANNUAL REPORT
Police Service – Service Definition and Terms Used

Police Service Definition

Police Services consists of traditional law enforcement functions, including patrol, investigations, and police administration. These functions encompass preventive patrols, traffic enforcement, responding to calls for service, and investigation of crimes. Specifically excluded from the service definition are: animal control and emergency communications (dispatch). The service definition does include all support personnel and services, except those relating to animal control and emergency communications.

Definitions of Terms Used

TIBRS A & B Crimes – The Tennessee Incident-Based Reporting System is now the standard statewide system for reporting crimes in Tennessee. Part A Crimes consist of 22 specific serious crimes, including arson, assault, burglary, homicide, kidnapping, larceny/theft, fraud, drug crimes and sex crimes. Part B Crimes include 11 less serious categories of crimes such as bad checks, loitering and vagrancy, DUI, disorderly conduct, non-violent family offenses, liquor law violations, and trespassing.

Dispatched Calls – Calls that result in a response from a Police Patrol unit. Some cities may have a “teleserve” program, where low priority requests for service are handled via telephone, with no officer dispatched, which may be a factor in reducing the number of Dispatched Calls. Also includes officer-initiated calls.

FTE Positions – Number of hours worked in Police Patrol converted to “Full Time Equivalent” positions at 2,080 hours per year, where those figures were available. Since a standard work year is used, this figure may not correspond to the number of positions budgeted in the Patrol function. For some cities, the number of FTE’s may be a budgeted figure, rather than actual hours worked, which could result in either understating or overstating the actual hours worked.
### Cities By Increasing Population

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City</th>
<th>Athens</th>
<th>Maryville</th>
<th>Brentwood</th>
<th>Cleveland</th>
<th>Collierville</th>
<th>Bartlett</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Population</td>
<td>13,334</td>
<td>23,120</td>
<td>30,617</td>
<td>37,192</td>
<td>41,923</td>
<td>43,354</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City Area (sq. miles)</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calls Actually Dispatched</td>
<td>34,062</td>
<td>32,997</td>
<td>24,257</td>
<td>67,048</td>
<td>36,472</td>
<td>25,141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TIBRS Type A Crimes *</td>
<td>2,268</td>
<td>1,456</td>
<td>923</td>
<td>1,333</td>
<td>1,729</td>
<td>5,541</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TIBRS Type B Crimes *</td>
<td>236</td>
<td>256</td>
<td>466</td>
<td>2,274</td>
<td>889</td>
<td>789</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td># of FTE'S</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>122</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td># of Support Personnel</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td># of Budgeted Certified Positions</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traffic Accidents</td>
<td>920</td>
<td>1,706</td>
<td>750</td>
<td>3,082</td>
<td>994</td>
<td>1,255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Property Accidents</td>
<td>686</td>
<td>1,288</td>
<td>672</td>
<td>2,207</td>
<td>806</td>
<td>908</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Property Accidents w/Injury</td>
<td>176</td>
<td>248</td>
<td>151</td>
<td>363</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motor Driven Police Vehicles</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alarm Calls</td>
<td>1,249</td>
<td>2,480</td>
<td>3,423</td>
<td>3,116</td>
<td>2,961</td>
<td>4,131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Cost</td>
<td>$1,918,055</td>
<td>$3,827,425</td>
<td>$5,016,735</td>
<td>$7,307,773</td>
<td>$6,463,339</td>
<td>$7,927,634</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Calculated Benchmarks

#### Workload

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Athens</th>
<th>Maryville</th>
<th>Brentwood</th>
<th>Cleveland</th>
<th>Collierville</th>
<th>Bartlett</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cost/1,000 pop.</td>
<td>$143,847</td>
<td>$165,546</td>
<td>$163,855</td>
<td>$196,488</td>
<td>$154,172</td>
<td>$182,858</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type A &amp; B Crimes/1,000 pop.*</td>
<td>188</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTE's/1,000 pop.</td>
<td>2.53</td>
<td>1.79</td>
<td>1.79</td>
<td>2.74</td>
<td>2.91</td>
<td>2.33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTE's/road mile</td>
<td>0.23</td>
<td>0.25</td>
<td>0.24</td>
<td>0.38</td>
<td>0.45</td>
<td>0.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTE's/square mile</td>
<td>2.28</td>
<td>2.95</td>
<td>1.35</td>
<td>3.92</td>
<td>4.21</td>
<td>4.39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accidents/Road Mile</td>
<td>4.70</td>
<td>7.90</td>
<td>2.99</td>
<td>8.24</td>
<td>2.97</td>
<td>4.11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Efficiency

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Athens</th>
<th>Maryville</th>
<th>Brentwood</th>
<th>Cleveland</th>
<th>Collierville</th>
<th>Bartlett</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cost/FTE's</td>
<td>$56,747</td>
<td>$92,674</td>
<td>$91,296</td>
<td>$71,645</td>
<td>$52,978</td>
<td>$78,491</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost/dispatched call</td>
<td>$56</td>
<td>$116</td>
<td>$207</td>
<td>$109</td>
<td>$177</td>
<td>$315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dispatched Calls/FTE's</td>
<td>1008</td>
<td>799</td>
<td>441</td>
<td>657</td>
<td>299</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Effectiveness

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Athens</th>
<th>Maryville</th>
<th>Brentwood</th>
<th>Cleveland</th>
<th>Collierville</th>
<th>Bartlett</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Traffic Injury/ Accidents</td>
<td>25.7%</td>
<td>19.3%</td>
<td>22.5%</td>
<td>16.4%</td>
<td>22.3%</td>
<td>15.2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* The validity of these numbers is questionable.
## Tennessee Municipal Benchmarking Program
### Police Performance Data 7/1/2004 - 6/30/2005

#### 1/31/06

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Kingsport</th>
<th>Franklin</th>
<th>Murfreesboro</th>
<th>Clarksville</th>
<th>Chattanooga</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Population</td>
<td>44,905</td>
<td>46,416</td>
<td>81,393</td>
<td>103,455</td>
<td>155,554</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City Area (sq. miles)</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City Road Miles</td>
<td>423</td>
<td>330</td>
<td>515</td>
<td>638</td>
<td>1,100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calls Actually Dispatched</td>
<td>42,428</td>
<td>43,658</td>
<td>70,617</td>
<td>128,417</td>
<td>146,199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TIBRS Type A Crimes *</td>
<td>9,939</td>
<td>1,941</td>
<td>10,299</td>
<td>11,082</td>
<td>22,822</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TIBRS Type B Crimes *</td>
<td>2,417</td>
<td>468</td>
<td>3,153</td>
<td>1,326</td>
<td>869</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td># of FTE'S</td>
<td>121</td>
<td>152</td>
<td>203</td>
<td>285</td>
<td>623</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td># of Support Personnel</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traffic Accidents</td>
<td>3,302</td>
<td>2,124</td>
<td>5,121</td>
<td>6,548</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Property Accidents</td>
<td>2,423</td>
<td>2,124</td>
<td>4,133</td>
<td>3,062</td>
<td>12,648</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Property Accidents w/Injury</td>
<td>645</td>
<td>362</td>
<td>1,015</td>
<td>1,059</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motor Driven Police Vehicles</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>173</td>
<td>293</td>
<td>480</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alarm Calls</td>
<td>3,018</td>
<td>3,215</td>
<td>10,545</td>
<td>10,660</td>
<td>12,912</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Cost</td>
<td>$7,765,451</td>
<td>$10,539,148</td>
<td>$15,493,427</td>
<td>$16,939,379</td>
<td>$38,798,808</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### CALCULATED BENCHMARKS

#### WORKLOAD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Kingsport</th>
<th>Franklin</th>
<th>Murfreesboro</th>
<th>Clarksville</th>
<th>Chattanooga</th>
<th>11 City Average</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cost/1,000 pop.</td>
<td>$172,931</td>
<td>$227,059</td>
<td>$190,353</td>
<td>$163,737</td>
<td>$249,423</td>
<td>$182,752</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type A &amp; B Crimes/1,000 pop.*</td>
<td>275</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>165</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>152</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTE's/1,000 pop.</td>
<td>2.69</td>
<td>3.26</td>
<td>2.49</td>
<td>2.75</td>
<td>4.01</td>
<td>2.66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTE's/road mile</td>
<td>0.29</td>
<td>0.46</td>
<td>0.39</td>
<td>0.45</td>
<td>0.57</td>
<td>0.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTE's/square mile</td>
<td>2.69</td>
<td>4.00</td>
<td>4.14</td>
<td>2.85</td>
<td>4.33</td>
<td>3.37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accidents/Road mile</td>
<td>5.73</td>
<td>6.44</td>
<td>8.03</td>
<td>4.80</td>
<td>11.50</td>
<td>6.13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### EFFICIENCY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Kingsport</th>
<th>Franklin</th>
<th>Murfreesboro</th>
<th>Clarksville</th>
<th>Chattanooga</th>
<th>11 City Average</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cost/FTE's</td>
<td>$64,177</td>
<td>$69,565</td>
<td>$76,322</td>
<td>$59,436</td>
<td>$62,277</td>
<td>$70,510</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost/dispatched call</td>
<td>$183</td>
<td>$241</td>
<td>$219</td>
<td>$132</td>
<td>$265</td>
<td>$184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dispatched Calls/FTE's</td>
<td>351</td>
<td>288</td>
<td>348</td>
<td>451</td>
<td>235</td>
<td>466</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### EFFECTIVENESS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Kingsport</th>
<th>Franklin</th>
<th>Murfreesboro</th>
<th>Clarksville</th>
<th>Chattanooga</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Traffic Injury/ Accidents</td>
<td>26.6%</td>
<td>17.0%</td>
<td>24.6%</td>
<td>34.6%</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* The validity of these numbers is questionable.
ATHENS

Police Service

Service Level And Delivery

Athens operates a full-service police department including community service programs. They do not have school resource officers or dogs.

For the purpose of this report, the police department includes administration, patrol and criminal investigations. The police department headquarters is part of the city’s municipal building.

Officers work eight hour shifts and are generally scheduled to work 40 hours per week. Court appearances are extra work often beyond the 40-hour workweek. The department does not have a “take-home” car program.

Conditions Affecting Service, Performance, And Cost

The police department has a policy to engage the public. Their dispatched calls includes officer initiated contacts.
MARYVILLE

Service Level and Delivery

Maryville operates a full-service police department, including school resource officers and community precinct officers. The department currently operates out of the Blount County Sheriff’s Department complex, due to ongoing renovation of the police headquarters and city hall. The department maintains a “home fleet,” where officers are allowed to drive their police cars home.

Officers normally work five, eight-hour shifts per week. The department has utilized a schedule of four, ten-hour shifts in the past and may return to that schedule.

Conditions Affecting Service, Performance, and Cost

Maryville is approximately 15 miles from Knoxville, a city of 173,000 people. It also shares a boundary with the City of Alcoa, with a population of 7,000.
BRENTWOOD

Service Level And Delivery

Brentwood operates a full-service police department including community service programs.

For the purpose of this report, the police department includes administration, patrol and criminal investigations. The department has an in-house dispatch operation, but that unit is not included in this report. The police department headquarters is part of the city’s municipal building.

Officers work eight hour shifts and are generally scheduled to work 40 hours per week. The department does not have a “take-home” car program.

Conditions Affecting Service, Performance, And Cost

Brentwood is part of the Nashville/Davidson County metropolitan area and is served by an interstate highway.
Injuries Per Traffic Accident

Cost Per Dispatched Police Call

Police Cost Per FTE

Police FTE Per 1,000 Population

Dispached Calls Per FTE

TIBRS Group A & B Crimes Per 1,000 Population

Police Cost Per 1,000 Population

Traffic Accidents Per Road Mile

FTE's Per Road Mile
CLEVELAND

Service Level and Delivery

Cleveland operates a full-service police department, including a part-time telephone response unit. The telephone response unit, staffed sporadically by officers on “light duty” due to illness or injury, relieves the department of physically responding to some calls for service, such as minor theft complaints, by taking the report via telephone. The department also provides DARE and School Resource Officers for the local school system.

The department operates a police headquarters separate from the city municipal building. The department provides take-home vehicles for all but a few police officers.

Officers generally work four, 10-hour days per week. The 10-hour shifts allow significant overlapping of personnel during certain times of the day and certain days of the week.

Conditions Affecting Service, Performance, and Cost

Cleveland is located less than 20 miles from Chattanooga, a city with a population in excess of 155,000, and is located on an interstate highway.
TENNESSEE MUNICIPAL BENCHMARKING PROJECT
FY 2005 ANNUAL REPORT
COLLIERVILLE

Service Level and Delivery

Collierville operates a full-service police department, including DARE, traffic officers and community relations officers.

The police department maintains a headquarters in the city hall building and operates a municipal jail. For the purpose of this study, the dispatch center and the jail unit are not included in this report. The city also operates a General Sessions Court.

Conditions Affecting Service, Performance, and Cost

Collierville is part of the Memphis metropolitan area and is immediately adjacent to the City of Memphis, a city of 650,000 people.
BARTLETT

Service Level and Delivery

Bartlett operates a full-service police department, including DARE, traffic officers and community relations officers.

The police department maintains a headquarters separate from the city hall building and operates a municipal jail. For the purpose of this study, the dispatch center and the jail unit are not included in this report. The city also operates a General Sessions Court.

Conditions Affecting Service, Performance, and Cost

Bartlett is part of the Memphis metropolitan area and is immediately adjacent to the City of Memphis, a city of 650,000 people. The city has significant commercial and retail development and multiple interstate exits.
KINGSPORT

Service Level and Delivery

Kingsport operates a full-service police department, including DARE and School Resource Officers.

The department shares space with the county in a two-story justice center adjacent to city hall. The department also has substations or offices outside of the police department headquarters. For the purpose of this study, dispatch and jail functions will not be addressed in this report.

Most patrol officers work 12-hour shifts, and the shift schedule results in an 80-hour work schedule every two-week work period. Others are assigned to “Power Shifts” and work an 8 hour day on an 80 hour work period.

The department has a “home fleet” where the majority all officers are assigned a specific vehicle, and most officers drive the vehicles home.

Conditions Affecting Service, Performance, and Cost

The city has annexed multiple exits along the interstate, resulting in long “fingers,” well away from the city proper, that officers must patrol and answer calls for service.
Franklin

Service Level and Delivery

The City of Franklin operates a full-service police department, excluding animal control. The department is divided into three divisions: Patrol/Operations, Administration, and Criminal Investigations. There are three shifts and patrol officers work four 10-hour days per week. The department also maintains several specialized units such as, but not exclusively, Special Response Team, Hostage Negotiation Team, Canine, Dive Search and Recovery Team, Critical Incident Response Team, and an Incident Command Vehicle for Homeland Security Region 5 responses and other emergency incidents. The police officers provide community service programs for Franklin residents such as the Citizens Police Academy, Explorers, and Neighborhood Watch. Franklin also participates in the “take home” car program for all officers who live in Williamson County.

Franklin Police Department is a Commission on Accreditation for Law Enforcement Agencies, CALEA, certified agency.

The department currently operates out of Franklin City Hall and is in the process of planning a new facility due to the expanded growth of the City and space needs of the department. Officers currently patrol four zones that cover the City of Franklin, with an adjustment to eight zones in the near future. The present ratio of patrol officers is 2.24 officers per 1,000 residents.

The City of Franklin revised its pension formula in 2003 to a level that is 33% higher than the Tennessee Consolidated Retirement System. Additionally, Franklin adopted a “25 and out” program that provides full benefits after 25 years of service, regardless of retirement age. Those changes increased pension contributions by the City to 22% of covered payroll.

The City also provides comprehensive medical insurance to employees. The City requires employees to pay 8% of individual coverage and 12% of family coverage premiums. Other benefits, such as blanket life insurance and dental coverage, are provided at low cost or no cost to employees. For FY06, the employee benefits totaled 43.2% of wages in the General Fund.

Conditions Affecting Service, Performance, and Cost

Franklin is approximately 15 miles south of Nashville and is served by Interstate 65, which is the gateway for traffic from the south. Several State roads also serve Franklin.

Franklin is significantly impacted by commercial and residential development due to corporations such as the North American Nissan Headquarters relocating from California.

Franklin is known for local historical sites, which attract tourists of all ages.

All patrol vehicles are equipped with mobile data terminals, and in-car cameras.

Officers receive overtime for court appearances, as well as overtime for working holidays and special events such as Main Street Festival, Dickens of a Christmas, Rotary Christmas Parade, Franklin on the Fourth, Jazz Festival, etc.

TENNESSEE MUNICIPAL BENCHMARKING PROJECT
FY 2005 ANNUAL REPORT
Service Level and Delivery

Murfreesboro offers a full-service police department, including uniformed patrol and criminal investigation, supplemented by flex shifts, community policing precincts in housing areas, traffic enforcement including the use of motorcycles and an alcohol-countermeasures team, a special operations unit, canine support, vice and domestic violence sections, and a variety of community service programs. These programs include D.A.R.E., Citizens Police Academy, National Night Out and other community crime prevention efforts. The Murfreesboro Police/Fire Communications Center is operated from within the Police Department and handles a substantial percentage of all 911 calls for Rutherford County.

Murfreesboro is home to Middle Tennessee State University, the state's largest undergraduate university, with a consistent enrollment of greater than 20,000 students per semester. MTSU is also home to the TSSAA Boys and Girls state basketball tournaments each spring, and the home of the TSSAA football championships each fall. In 2005, TSSAA elected to bring the Spring Fling series to Murfreesboro. MTSU and the events connected to that campus bring thousands of tourists into Murfreesboro each year, increasing law enforcement service demands.

Murfreesboro is served by I-24 and I-840 and is a regional destination for commercial, retail and medical services. The City's proximity to Nashville provides opportunity for residents to commute to Nashville for work, while allowing Nashvillians to commute to MTSU for classes. Nissan operates a major manufacturing plant less than five minutes from the Murfreesboro City limits, and fuels a number of satellite suppliers in the surrounding area. As a result, the City is experiencing unprecedented growth and development.

Conditions Affecting Service, Performance and Cost

To extend police services into annexed areas and for the City's increasing population, additional police employees are being hired, trained and deployed. This process of integrating new positions into the workforce takes time. To maintain staffing levels and provide an expected level of service delivery during peak periods, overtime assignments are frequently used.
POLICE - ALL CITIES

TENNESSEE MUNICIPAL BENCHMARKING PROJECT
FY 2005 ANNUAL REPORT

Injuries Per Traffic Accident

TIBRS Group A & B Crimes Per 1,000 Population

Police Cost Per FTE

Cost Per Dispatched Police Call

Dispatched Calls Per FTE

Police Cost Per 1,000 Population

Traffic Accidents Per Road Mile

FTE's Per Road Mile

TENNESSEE MUNICIPAL BENCHMARKING PROJECT
FY 2005 ANNUAL REPORT
CLARKSVILLE

Service Level and Delivery

Clarksville operates a full-service police department, including DARE officers. The department has three distinct districts, each operated almost as an independent police department. Each district has traffic, criminal investigation and patrol responsibilities.

The department has a headquarters building, and two districts have their own office space in other buildings. The department maintains a “home fleet” with officers allowed to drive the police vehicles home.

The department works 12-hour shifts, and officers are scheduled to work some “short” shifts to reduce the number of scheduled work hours below the overtime threshold.

Conditions Affecting Service, Performance, and Cost

A portion of the U. S. Army’s Fort Campbell is inside the city, and the city is significantly impacted by commercial and residential development associated with the presence of the military base. The city is served by Interstate 24 and serves as a gateway for traffic going into and out of Kentucky.
CHATTANOOGA

Service Level and Delivery

The Chattanooga Police Department is a full-service police department, including DARE and School Resource Officers. The city is divided into distinct geographical areas, with Patrol Commanders having authority over all aspects of patrol activity in their area. The department has opened “precinct” offices in the city. The department operates a “tele-serve” unit, which handles complaints by telephone when the complainant does not need to speak to an officer in person.

The officers generally work eight-hour shifts. The department has a partial “home fleet,” with some officers allowed to drive the police vehicles home.

For the purpose of this study, the dispatch and animal control functions of the department are not included in this report.

Conditions Affecting Service, Performance, and Cost

Two major interstates intersect in Chattanooga, producing a high traffic volume. The city is at the center of a metropolitan area and serves as a major shopping hub for a multi-county area, including counties in North Georgia. Chattanooga is a tourist destination and hosts conferences and conventions.
POLICE - ALL CITIES

Tennessee Municipal Benchmarking Project
FY 2005 Annual Report

Police Cost Per FTE

Chattanooga: $62,277
11 City Average: $70,510

Cost Per Dispatched Police Call

Chattanooga: $265
11 City Average: $184

Police FTE Per 1,000 Population

Chattanooga: 4.01
11 City Average: 2.66

TIBRS Group A & B Crimes Per 1,000 Population

Chattanooga: 152
11 City Average: 125

Dispatched Calls Per FTE

Chattanooga: 235
11 City Average: 466

Traffic Accidents Per Road Mile

Chattanooga: 54

FTE's Per Road Mile

Chattanooga: 0.57
11 City Average: 0.38

TENNESSEE MUNICIPAL BENCHMARKING PROJECT
FY 2005 ANNUAL REPORT

54
FIRE SERVICES

TENNESSEE MUNICIPAL BENCHMARKING PROJECT
FY 2005 ANNUAL REPORT

55
Fire Service – Service Definition and Terms Used

Service Definition

Fire Service consists of the entire range of services provided by the city’s Fire Department, which may include fire suppression, fire prevention, fire code inspections, fire safety education, arson investigation, rescue, and/or Emergency Medical Services.

Definitions of Terms Used

Calls For Service – Includes all response categories for both emergency and non-emergency service that require use of Fire Department personnel and equipment.

Fire Calls – The total of all reported fires of all types, including structure fires. The reporting standard for all fire data is TFIRS, the Tennessee Fire Incident Reporting System, which complies with the standards of NFIRS, the National Fire Incident Reporting System operated by the U.S. Fire Administration, part of the Federal Emergency Management Agency (FEMA).

Fire Inspections – Includes inspections performed by both certified fire inspectors and by the staff of the city’s engine companies.

FTE Positions – Number of hours worked in the Fire Department converted to “Full Time Equivalent” positions at 2,760 hours per year. Since a standard work year is used, this figure may not correspond to the number of positions budgeted in the Fire Department. For some cities, the number of FTE’s may be a budgeted figure, rather than actual hours worked, which could result in either understat ing or overstating the actual hours worked.

Fire Response Time – The beginning time at which the fire department (not the 911 or dispatch center) first becomes aware of the call and the ending time of when the first arriving FD unit is on the scene of the incident. The difference between these two times is the classic Fire Response Time.
## Tennessee Municipal Benchmarking Program

### Fire Performance Data

**1/31/06**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cities By Increasing Population</th>
<th>Athens</th>
<th>Maryville</th>
<th>Brentwood</th>
<th>Cleveland</th>
<th>Collierville</th>
<th>Bartlett</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Population</td>
<td>13,334</td>
<td>23,120</td>
<td>30,617</td>
<td>37,192</td>
<td>41,923</td>
<td>43,354</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City Area (sq. miles)</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City Road Miles</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>163</td>
<td>225</td>
<td>268</td>
<td>221</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Emergency Calls for Service</td>
<td>154</td>
<td>469</td>
<td>250</td>
<td>881</td>
<td>676</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emergency Calls for Service</td>
<td>298</td>
<td>1,234</td>
<td>1,891</td>
<td>193</td>
<td>1,499</td>
<td>3,152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Calls</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>157</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>778</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Structure Fires</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inspections by Fire Inspectors</td>
<td>420</td>
<td>3,541</td>
<td>436</td>
<td>450</td>
<td>2,518</td>
<td>2,589</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inspections by Fire Companies</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>621</td>
<td>173</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Code Citations- Notice</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Code Violations Issued</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>1,377</td>
<td>390</td>
<td>1,371</td>
<td>483</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Code Violations-% Cleared</td>
<td>94%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>93%</td>
<td>94%</td>
<td>56%</td>
<td>95%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td># of Full Time Equivalents</td>
<td>20.6</td>
<td>42.4</td>
<td>43.6</td>
<td>83.0</td>
<td>59.1</td>
<td>60.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td># of Budgeted Certified Positions</td>
<td>20.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>57.0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>59.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City Appraised Value (Millions)</td>
<td>$1,052</td>
<td>$1,851</td>
<td>$5,154</td>
<td>$2,462</td>
<td>$4,121</td>
<td>$2,838</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### CALCULATED BENCHMARKS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Athens</th>
<th>Maryville</th>
<th>Brentwood</th>
<th>Cleveland</th>
<th>Collierville</th>
<th>Bartlett</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fire Service Cost Per 1,000 Pop.</td>
<td>$99,333</td>
<td>$125,752</td>
<td>$160,474</td>
<td>$150,063</td>
<td>$127,906</td>
<td>$108,947</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calls for Service Per 1,000 Pop.</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Inspections Per 1,000 Pop.</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Code Violations-% Cleared</td>
<td>94.00%</td>
<td>100.00%</td>
<td>93.00%</td>
<td>94.00%</td>
<td>56.00%</td>
<td>95.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Structure Fires Per 1,000 Pop.</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>0.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emergency Response Time</td>
<td>2:18</td>
<td>4:01</td>
<td>5:04</td>
<td>3:30</td>
<td>4:33</td>
<td>5:52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost Per Calls For Service</td>
<td>$2,930</td>
<td>$1,707</td>
<td>$2,295</td>
<td>$5,197</td>
<td>$2,465</td>
<td>$1,498</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Cause Determined</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>93%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>97%</td>
<td>90%</td>
<td>96%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Tennessee Municipal Benchmarking Program
#### Fire Performance Data
**7/1/2004 - 6/30/2005**

**Kingsport**
- Population: 44,905
- City Area (sq. miles): 45
- City Road Miles: 423
- Non-Emergency Calls for Service: 1,476
- Emergency Calls for Service: 4,207
- Fire Calls: 1,572
- Structure Fires: 84
- Inspections by Fire Inspectors: 2,507
- Inspection by Fire Companies: 0
- Fire Code Citations- Notice: 0
- Fire Code Violations Issued: 7,579
- Fire Code Violations-% Cleared: 98%
- # of Full Time Equivalents: 96.0
- City Appraised Value (Millions): $5,514
- Total Response Time: 6:51
- Dispatch Time: 1:36
- Emergency Response Time: 4:29
- Fire Cause Determined: 90%
- Fire Loss: $4,070,495
- EMS Service Levels: ALS
- EMS Calls: 4,203
- ISO Rating: 3/7
- Number of Fire Stations: 6
- Median Age of Population: 41.9
- Total Cost: $6,159,362

**Franklin**
- Population: 46,416
- City Area (sq. miles): 38
- City Road Miles: 330
- Non-Emergency Calls for Service: 0
- Emergency Calls for Service: 4,613
- Fire Calls: 124
- Structure Fires: 50
- Inspections by Fire Inspectors: 320
- Inspection by Fire Companies: 1,273
- Fire Code Citations- Notice: 0
- Fire Code Violations Issued: 960
- Fire Code Violations-% Cleared: 95%
- # of Full Time Equivalents: 136.5
- City Appraised Value (Millions): $4,889
- Total Response Time: 6:02
- Dispatch Time: 1:43
- Emergency Response Time: 4:19
- Fire Cause Determined: 73%
- Fire Loss: $2,864,719
- EMS Service Levels: 1st responder
- EMS Calls: 3,215
- ISO Rating: 3/9
- Number of Fire Stations: 5
- Median Age of Population: 33.0
- Total Cost: $10,393,285

**Murfreesboro**
- Population: 81,393
- City Area (sq. miles): 49
- City Road Miles: 474
- Non-Emergency Calls for Service: 0
- Emergency Calls for Service: 5,577
- Fire Calls: 293
- Structure Fires: 144
- Inspections by Fire Inspectors: 4,470
- Inspection by Fire Companies: 2,010
- Fire Code Citations- Notice: 15
- Fire Code Violations Issued: 1,132
- Fire Code Violations-% Cleared: 85%
- # of Full Time Equivalents: 177.0
- City Appraised Value (Millions): $4,352
- Total Response Time: 3:46
- Dispatch Time: 33
- Emergency Response Time: 3:13
- Fire Cause Determined: 70%
- Fire Loss: $1,634,452
- EMS Service Levels: 1st responder
- EMS Calls: 3,435
- ISO Rating: 3
- Number of Fire Stations: 9
- Median Age of Population: 28.7
- Total Cost: $11,772,124

**Clarksville**
- Population: 103,455
- City Area (sq. miles): 100
- City Road Miles: 638
- Non-Emergency Calls for Service: 334
- Emergency Calls for Service: 5,811
- Fire Calls: 523
- Structure Fires: 88
- Inspections by Fire Inspectors: 1,615
- Inspection by Fire Companies: 0
- Fire Code Citations- Notice: 0
- Fire Code Violations Issued: 6,330
- Fire Code Violations-% Cleared: 100%
- # of Full Time Equivalents: 176.0
- City Appraised Value (Millions): $10,057
- Total Response Time: 5:03
- Dispatch Time: 15
- Emergency Response Time: 4:48
- Fire Cause Determined: 80%
- Fire Loss: $1,226,100
- EMS Service Levels: 1st responder
- EMS Calls: 4,057
- ISO Rating: 2
- Number of Fire Stations: 10
- Median Age of Population: 28.8
- Total Cost: $10,634,160

**Chattanooga**
- Population: 155,554
- City Area (sq. miles): 144
- City Road Miles: 1,100
- Non-Emergency Calls for Service: 0
- Emergency Calls for Service: 9,769
- Fire Calls: 5,428
- Structure Fires: 287
- Inspections by Fire Inspectors: 2,566
- Inspection by Fire Companies: 3,883
- Fire Code Citations- Notice: 0
- Fire Code Violations Issued: N/A
- Fire Code Violations-% Cleared: N/A
- # of Full Time Equivalents: 418.0
- City Appraised Value (Millions): $7,861,044
- Total Response Time: 6:04
- Dispatch Time: 0:55
- Emergency Response Time: 5:11
- Fire Cause Determined: 90%
- Fire Loss: $7,861,044
- EMS Service Levels: 1st responder
- EMS Calls: 4,341
- ISO Rating: 0
- Number of Fire Stations: 17
- Median Age of Population: 37.1
- Total Cost: $27,888,621

### Calculated Benchmarks

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Metric</th>
<th>Kingsport</th>
<th>Franklin</th>
<th>Murfreesboro</th>
<th>Clarksville</th>
<th>Chattanooga</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fire Service Cost Per 1,000 Pop.</td>
<td>$179,286</td>
<td>$144,633</td>
<td>$102,790</td>
<td>$103,455</td>
<td>$155,554</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calls for Service Per 1,000 Pop.</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Inspections Per 1,000 Pop.</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Code Violations-% Cleared</td>
<td>100.00%</td>
<td>85.00%</td>
<td>100.00%</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>91.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Structure Fires Per 1,000 Pop.</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>1.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emergency Response Time</td>
<td>5:11</td>
<td>5:11</td>
<td>4:48</td>
<td>5:29</td>
<td>5:11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost Per Calls For Service</td>
<td>$2,855</td>
<td>$2,111</td>
<td>$1,731</td>
<td>$2,253</td>
<td>$2,109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Cause Determined</td>
<td>90%</td>
<td>80%</td>
<td>70%</td>
<td>80%</td>
<td>90%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 11 City Average

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Metric</th>
<th>Kingsport</th>
<th>Franklin</th>
<th>Murfreesboro</th>
<th>Clarksville</th>
<th>Chattanooga</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fire Service Cost Per 1,000 Pop.</td>
<td>$141,842</td>
<td>$144,633</td>
<td>$102,790</td>
<td>$103,455</td>
<td>$155,554</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calls for Service Per 1,000 Pop.</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Inspections Per 1,000 Pop.</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>164</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>164</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Code Violations-% Cleared</td>
<td>91.00%</td>
<td>91.00%</td>
<td>91.00%</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>91.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Structure Fires Per 1,000 Pop.</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>1.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emergency Response Time</td>
<td>5:11</td>
<td>5:11</td>
<td>4:48</td>
<td>5:29</td>
<td>5:11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost Per Calls For Service</td>
<td>$2,109</td>
<td>$2,111</td>
<td>$1,731</td>
<td>$2,253</td>
<td>$2,109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Cause Determined</td>
<td>90%</td>
<td>90%</td>
<td>90%</td>
<td>90%</td>
<td>90%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City Profile</td>
<td>Explanatory Information</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Population: 13,334</td>
<td>Athens operates a full-service fire department, and provides almost all of the services offered in Fire departments across the state.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Land Area: 15 sq. mi.</td>
<td>Fire departments across the state.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calls For Service: 452</td>
<td>The department provides fire prevention, public fire education, and code enforcement services.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emergency Calls: 298</td>
<td>Their fleet management fund allows for timely purchase of capital needs.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Calls: 74</td>
<td>The employees work three 4 day cycles. Four days from 7 to 5; Four days from 5 to 7; Four days off.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Structure Fires: 30</td>
<td>See the “Fire Services Provided” table at the beginning of this section for more detail.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTE Positions: 20.6</td>
<td>Fire Code Violations Cleared Within 90 Days: 94%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Inspections: 453</td>
<td>None</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Code Violations: 107</td>
<td>Conditions Affecting Service, Performance, and Cost</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Response Time: 2:18</td>
<td>None</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMS Level: None</td>
<td>None</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMS Calls: 0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TENNESSEE MUNICIPAL BENCHMARKING PROJECT
FY 2005 ANNUAL REPORT
**City Profile**

| Population:   | 23,120 |
| Land Area:   | 14 sq. mi. |
| Calls For Service: | 1,703 |
| Emergency Calls: | 1,234 |
| Fire Calls: | 107 |
| Structure Fires: | 16 |
| FTE Positions: | 42.4 |
| Fire Inspections: | 4,162 |
| Fire Code Violations: | 28 |
| Fire Code Violations Cleared Within 90 Days: | 100 |
| Fire Response Time: | 4:01 |

**Explanatory Information**

**Service Level and Delivery**

Maryville operates a full-service fire department, and provides almost all of the services offered in Fire departments across the state.

The department provides fire prevention, public fire education, and code enforcement services.

Firefighter pay scales are related to levels of training and certification.

See the "Fire Services Provided" table at the beginning of this section for more detail.

**Conditions Affecting Service, Performance, and Cost**

None
FIRE CHARTS - ALL CITIES

ALL CITIES COMPARED TO AVERAGE

- **Fire Services Cost Per 1,000 Population**
  - Maryville: $125,752
  - 11 City Average: $141,842

ALL CITIES COMPARED TO AVERAGE

- **Structure Fire Per 1,000 Population**
  - Maryville: 0.7
  - 11 City Average: 1.2

ALL CITIES COMPARED TO AVERAGE

- **Calls For Fire Services Per 1,000 Population**
  - Maryville: 74
  - 11 City Average: 68

ALL CITIES COMPARED TO AVERAGE

- **Emergency Response Time**
  - Maryville: 4:01
  - 11 City Average: 4:23

ALL CITIES COMPARED TO AVERAGE

- **Fire Inspections Per 1,000 Population**
  - Maryville: 180
  - 11 City Average: 54

ALL CITIES COMPARED TO AVERAGE

- **Cost Per Calls For Service**
  - Maryville: $1,707
  - 11 City Average: $2,109

ALL CITIES COMPARED TO AVERAGE

- **Percentage of Fire Code Violations Cleared in 90 Days**
  - Maryville: 100.0%
  - 10 City Average: 91.0%

ALL CITIES COMPARED TO AVERAGE

- **Percentage of Structure Fires Where Cause is Determined**
  - Maryville: 93%
  - 11 City Average: 89%

TENNESSEE MUNICIPAL BENCHMARKING PROJECT
FY 2005 ANNUAL REPORT
Brentwood Fire Service

### City Profile

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Data</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Population</td>
<td>30,617</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Land Area</td>
<td>41 sq. mi.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calls For Service</td>
<td>2,141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emergency Calls</td>
<td>1,891</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Calls</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Structure Fires</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTE Positions</td>
<td>43.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Inspections</td>
<td>609</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Code Violations</td>
<td>1,377</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Code Violations Cleared Within 90 Days</td>
<td>93%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Explanatory Information

#### Service Level and Delivery
Brentwood operates a full-service fire department, and provides almost all of the services offered in any fire department in the state.

#### Conditions Affecting Service, Performance and Cost

- The department also offers a wide range of non-emergency services including fire prevention, public fire education, and code enforcement activities.
- They also provide fire alarm acceptance testing.
- The department has a written Master Plan. Firefighter pay scales are related to levels of training and certification.
- See the “Fire Services Definitions” table at the beginning of this section for more details.

- Fire Response Time: 5:04
- EMS Level: BLS
- EMS Calls: 1,080
- None

---

TENNESSEE MUNICIPAL BENCHMARKING PROJECT FY 2005 ANNUAL REPORT
**FIRE CHARTS - ALL CITIES**

**ALL CITIES COMPARED TO AVERAGE**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Brentwood</th>
<th>11 City Average</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fire Services Cost Per 1,000 Population</td>
<td>$160,474</td>
<td>$141,842</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Structure Fire Per 1,000 Population**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Brentwood</th>
<th>11 City Average</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Calls For Fire Services Per 1,000 Population</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Emergency Response Time**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Brentwood</th>
<th>11 City Average</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fire Inspections Per 1,000 Population</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Cost Per Calls For Service**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Brentwood</th>
<th>11 City Average</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of Fire Code Violations Cleared in 90 Days</td>
<td>93.00%</td>
<td>91.00%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Percentage of Structure Fires Where Cause is Determined**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Brentwood</th>
<th>11 City Average</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of Structure Fires Where Cause is Determined</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>89%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Cleveland

### Fire Service

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City Profile</th>
<th>Explanatory Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Population:</strong> 37,192</td>
<td><strong>Service Level and Delivery</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Median Age:</strong> 34</td>
<td>Cleveland operates a modern, up-to-date fleet of fire apparatus and provides the traditional services offered by most departments.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Calls For Service:</strong> 1,074</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Emergency Calls:</strong> 193</td>
<td>However, they do not provide emergency medical services.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Fire Calls:</strong> 157</td>
<td>The fire department also provides fire prevention education and code enforcement services.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Structure Fires:</strong> 36</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Fire Inspections:</strong> 450</td>
<td>Cleveland also provides fire protection services for Bradley County (337 square miles).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Fire Code Violations:</strong> 390</td>
<td>Costs and incidents outside the city limits are not included in this data.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Fire Code Violations Cleared Within 90 Days:</strong> 94</td>
<td>See the “Fire Services Definitions” table at the beginning of this section for more detail.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Number of full time equivalents (FTE’s):</strong> 83</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Fire Response Time:</strong> 3:30</td>
<td><strong>Conditions Affecting Service, Performance, and Cost</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ISO Rating:</strong> 3</td>
<td>Fire Inspector provides plan review and administers the City’s safety program.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>EMS Level:</strong> None</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>EMS Calls:</strong> None</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

TENNESSEE MUNICIPAL BENCHMARKING PROJECT FY2005 ANNUAL REPORT

65
FIRE CHARTS - ALL CITIES

ALL CITIES COMPARED TO AVERAGE

Fire Services Cost Per 1,000 Population

Cleveland

11 City Average

$150,663

$141,842

$0

$50,000

$100,000

$150,000

$200,000

$250,000

ALL CITIES COMPARED TO AVERAGE

Structure Fire Per 1,000 Population

Cleveland

11 City Average

1.0

1.2

0.0

1.0

2.0

3.0

ALL CITIES COMPARED TO AVERAGE

Calls For Fire Services Per 1,000 Population

Cleveland

11 City Average

29

68

ALL CITIES COMPARED TO AVERAGE

Emergency Response Time

Cleveland

11 City Average

3:30

4:23

0:00

1:00

2:00

3:00

4:00

5:00

6:00

ALL CITIES COMPARED TO AVERAGE

Fire Inspections Per 1,000 Population

Cleveland

11 City Average

12

54

ALL CITIES COMPARED TO AVERAGE

Cost Per Calls For Service

Cleveland

11 City Average

$5,197

$2,109

ALL CITIES COMPARED TO AVERAGE

Percentage of Fire Code Violations Cleared in 90 Days

Cleveland

10 City Average

94.00%

91.00%

ALL CITIES COMPARED TO AVERAGE

Percentage of Structure Fires Where Cause is Determined

Cleveland

11 City Average

97%

89%

TENNESSEE MUNICIPAL BENCHMARKING PROJECT
FY 2005 ANNUAL REPORT
Collierville

Fire Service

City Profile

Explanatory Information

Population: 41923

Service Level and Delivery

Collierville operates a full-service fire department, and provides almost all of the services offered in any fire department in the state.

Emergency Calls: 1,499

The department also offers a wide range of non-emergency services including fire prevention, public fire education, and code enforcement activities.

FTE Positions: 59

Firefighter pay scales are related to levels of training and certification.

Fire Code Violations: 1,371

See the "Fire Services Provided" table at the beginning of this section for more details.

Fire Code Violations Cleared Within

Conditions Affecting Service, Performance and Cost

None

90 Days: 56%

Fire Response Time: 4:33

EMS Level: ALS

EMS Calls: 1,395

TENNESSEE MUNICIPAL BENCHMARKING PROJECT
FY 2005 ANNUAL REPORT
FIRE CHARTS - ALL CITIES

ALL CITIES COMPARED TO AVERAGE

Fire Services Cost Per 1,000 Population

$127,906  $141,842

0

$100,000

$50,000

$250,000

$200,000

$150,000

$0

ALL CITIES COMPARED TO AVERAGE

Structure Fire Per 1,000 Population

0.0

1.0

2.0

3.0

0.7

1.2

ALL CITIES COMPARED TO AVERAGE

Calls For Fire Services Per 1,000 Population

0

50

100

150

200

52

68

ALL CITIES COMPARED TO AVERAGE

Emergency Response Time

0:00

1:00

2:00

3:00

4:00

5:00

6:00

4:33

4:23

ALL CITIES COMPARED TO AVERAGE

Fire Inspections Per 1,000 Population

0

50

100

150

200

60

54

ALL CITIES COMPARED TO AVERAGE

Cost Per Calls For Service

0

2000

4000

6000

8000

$2,465

$2,109

ALL CITIES COMPARED TO AVERAGE

Percentage of Fire Code Violations Cleared in 90 Days

0.0%

25.0%

50.0%

75.0%

100.0%

56.00%

91.00%

ALL CITIES COMPARED TO AVERAGE

Percentage of Structure Fires Where Cause is Determined

0%

25%

50%

75%

100%

90%

89%

TENNESSEE MUNICIPAL BENCHMARKING PROJECT
FY 2005 ANNUAL REPORT
Bartlett Fire Service

City Profile

Population: 43,354
Land Area: 23 sq. mi.
Calls For Service: 3,152
Emergency Calls: 3,152
Fire Calls: 778
Structure Fires: 34
FTE Positions: 60.8
Fire Inspections: 2,769
Fire Code Violations: 483
Fire Code Violations Cleared Within 90 Days: 95%
Response Time: 5:52
EMS Level: Transport
EMS Calls: 2,374

Explanatory Information

Service Level and Delivery

Bartlett operates a full-service fire department, and provides all of the services offered in any Fire department in the state.

The department provides fire prevention, public fire education, code enforcement services, and ambulance transport.

See the “Fire Services Definitions” table at the beginning of this section for more detail.

Conditions Affecting Service, Performance, and Cost

This is the only city providing ambulance transport services. Therefore, the costs of ambulance transport is not included in this cost analysis.
FIRE CHARTS - ALL CITIES

ALL CITIES COMPARED TO AVERAGE

$108,947
$141,842

$0

Fire Services Cost Per 1,000 Population

Bartlett
11 City Average

ALL CITIES COMPARED TO AVERAGE

0.8
1.2

0.0

Structure Fire Per 1,000 Population

Bartlett
11 City Average

ALL CITIES COMPARED TO AVERAGE

73 68

0

Calls For Fire Services Per 1,000 Population

Bartlett
11 City Average

ALL CITIES COMPARED TO AVERAGE

95.00% 91.00%

0.00%

Fire Inspections Per 1,000 Population

Bartlett
11 City Average

ALL CITIES COMPARED TO AVERAGE

5:52
4:23

0:00

Emergency Response Time

Bartlett
11 City Average

ALL CITIES COMPARED TO AVERAGE

$1,498
$2,109

0

Cost Per Calls For Service

Bartlett
11 City Average

ALL CITIES COMPARED TO AVERAGE

96%
89%

0%

Percentage of Structure Fires Where Cause is Determined

Bartlett
11 City Average

TENNESSEE MUNICIPAL BENCHMARKING PROJECT
FY 2005 ANNUAL REPORT
## Kingsport Fire Service

### City Profile

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Population</th>
<th>44,905</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Land Area</td>
<td>45 sq. mi.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calls For Service</td>
<td>5,683</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emergency Calls</td>
<td>4,207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Calls</td>
<td>1,572</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Structure Fires</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTE Positions</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Inspections</td>
<td>2,507</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Code Violations</td>
<td>7,579</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Code Violations Cleared Within 90 Days</td>
<td>98%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Response Time</td>
<td>4:29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMS Level</td>
<td>ALS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMS Calls</td>
<td>4,203</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Explanatory Information

**Service Level and Delivery**

Kingsport operates a full-service fire department, and provides almost all of the services offered in any fire department in the state.

The department provides fire prevention, public fire education, and code enforcement services.

The fire department has a written Master Plan.

See the “Fire Services Definitions” table at the beginning of this section for more detail.

**Conditions Affecting Service, Performance, and Cost**

Response time for the Kingsport department is affected by the city’s past annexation policy, which has resulted in lengthy, irregular extensions of the city limits which add to response time.
Franklin operates a full-service fire department and provides almost all of the services offered in any fire department in the state. The department also offers a wide range of non-emergency services including fire prevention, public fire education, and code enforcement activities.

A delay in development has stalled the construction of a new fire station that has prevented us from receiving a Class 2 ISO rating. The department currently has a Class 3 ISO rating.

Franklin provides staffing equal to four personnel for each engines, quint, and truck with two personnel allocated for each rescue. We staff four engines, two quint, three trucks, four rescues, and one shift commander housed at five fire stations. The department responds with two engines, one truck, one rescue and one shift commander to all fire alarms. For structure fires, the department adds one truck and one rescue. Apparatus is maintained to the highest level.

Suppression is operated on a 24 hour on duty and 48 hour off duty shift rotation and does not have sleep time differential.

The department has three personnel in prevention; one who primarily handles plans reviews and administrative related duties, one who primarily conducts all new construction inspections and complaints, and one dedicated to public education.

In FY05, overtime was elevated due to backfill for several military deployments, several employees on extended medical leave, and training initiatives.

Franklin has a full scale training center that includes a 350’ X 350’ driving pad, a 4 story tower with a Class A burn room, and a two story annex with one Class A burn room and one Natural gas powered prop. The department conducts most multi-company training at this facility.

The department investigates all fires for cause and origin but can only rule 73% with conclusive causes.

The City of Franklin has a fringe benefit program that is beneficial to its employees.

Franklin revised its pension formula in 2003 to a level that is 33% higher than the Tennessee Consolidated Retirement System. Additionally, Franklin adopted a “25 and out” program that provides full benefits after 25 years of service, regardless of retirement age. Those changes increased pension contributions by the City to 22% of covered payroll.

The City also provides comprehensive medical insurance to employees. The City requires employees to pay 8% of individual coverage and 12% of family coverage premiums. Other benefits, such as blanket life insurance and dental coverage, are provided at low cost or no cost to employees.

For FY06, the employee benefits totaled 43.2% of wages in the General Fund.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City Profile</th>
<th>Explanatory Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Population: 81,393</td>
<td>Service Level and Delivery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Land Area: 49 sq. mi.</td>
<td>Murfreesboro operates a full-service fire department, and provides all of the services offered in any Fire department in Tennessee.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calls For Service: 5,577</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emergency Calls: 5,577</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Calls: 293</td>
<td>The department provides fire prevention, public fire education, and training.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Structure Fires: 144</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTE Positions: 177</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Inspections: 6,480</td>
<td>See the “Fire Services Definitions” table at the beginning of this section for more detail.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Code Violations: 6,330</td>
<td>Conditions Affecting Service, Performance, and Cost</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Code Violations Cleared Within 90 Days: 85%</td>
<td>Operational readiness is assured by proper staffing, equipment, and training.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Response Time: 3:13</td>
<td>Management plans capital improvement projects and timetables for implementation. Also, specifications for new equipment and apparatus are developed, reviewed, and approved.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMS Level: 1st Responder</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMS Calls: 3,435</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TENNESSEE MUNICIPAL BENCHMARKING PROJECT FY 2005 ANNUAL REPORT
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City Profile</th>
<th>Explanatory Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Population:</strong> 103,455</td>
<td><strong>Service Level and Delivery</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Land Area: 100 sq. mi.</td>
<td>Clarksville operates a modern well-equipped department, and is moving aggressively to improve fire services and enhance training of firefighters.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calls For Service: 6,145</td>
<td>Fire Calls: 523 Significant investments are being made to train firefighters to a higher overall level of competency.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emergency Calls: 5,811</td>
<td>Structure Fires: 88 The department provides fire prevention, public fire education, and code enforcement activities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Calls: 523</td>
<td>FTE Positions: 176 See the “Fire Services Definitions” table at the beginning of this section for more details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Inspections: 1,615</td>
<td>Fire Code Violations: 1,132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Code Violations Cleared Within 90 Days: 100%</td>
<td><strong>Conditions Affecting Service, Performance, and Cost</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Response Time: 4:48</td>
<td>The rapid growth of the city has made it difficult for the department to both expand service delivery and maintain coverage density.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMS Level: 1&lt;sup&gt;st&lt;/sup&gt; Responder</td>
<td>The department has first-out, emergency response vehicles that are over 21 years old, which could affect performance.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMS Calls: 4,057</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TENNESSEE MUNICIPAL BENCHMARKING PROJECT FY 2005 ANNUAL REPORT
FIRE CHARTS - ALL CITIES

ALL CITIES COMPARED TO AVERAGE

**Fire Services Cost Per 1,000 Population**
- **Clarksville**
- **11 City Average**

**Calls For Fire Services Per 1,000 Population**
- **Clarksville**
- **11 City Average**

**Fire Inspections Per 1,000 Population**
- **Clarksville**
- **11 City Average**

**Percentage of Fire Code Violations Cleared in 90 Days**
- **Clarksville**
- **10 City Average**

**Structure Fire Per 1,000 Population**
- **Clarksville**
- **11 City Average**

**Emergency Response Time**
- **Clarksville**
- **11 City Average**

**Cost Per Calls For Service**
- **Clarksville**
- **11 City Average**

**Percentage of Structure Fires Where Cause is Determined**
- **Clarksville**
- **11 City Average**

---

TENNESSEE MUNICIPAL BENCHMARKING PROJECT
FY 2005 ANNUAL REPORT
## Chattanooga Fire Service

### City Profile

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Population:</th>
<th>155,554</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Land Area:</td>
<td>144 sq. mi.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calls For Service:</td>
<td>9,769</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emergency Calls:</td>
<td>9,769</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Calls:</td>
<td>5,428</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Structure Fires:</td>
<td>287</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTE Positions:</td>
<td>418</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Inspections:</td>
<td>6,449</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Code Violations:</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Explanatory Information

**Service Level and Delivery**

Chattanooga has made a major effort in the past few years to modernize and upgrade their fire department.

A significant capital investment is being made to modernize the fire department fleet.

The department provides fire prevention, public fire education, and code enforcement services.

Firefighter pay scales are related to levels of training and certification.

See the “Fire Services Provided” table at the beginning of this section for more details.

**Conditions Affecting Service, Performance, and Cost**

The department has many first-out, emergency response that are over 21 years old, which could affect performance.

Replacement of those vehicles could affect future operational costs.

### TENNESSEE MUNICIPAL BENCHMARKING PROJECT

FY 2005 ANNUAL REPORT
FIRE CHARTS - ALL CITIES

ALL CITIES COMPARED TO AVERAGE
- **Fire Services Cost Per 1,000 Population**
  - Chattanooga: $179,286
  - 11 City Average: $141,842

- **Calls For Fire Services Per 1,000 Population**
  - Chattanooga: 63
  - 11 City Average: 68

- **Fire Inspections Per 1,000 Population**
  - Chattanooga: 41
  - 11 City Average: 54

- **Structure Fire Per 1,000 Population**
  - Chattanooga: 1.8
  - 11 City Average: 1.2

- **Emergency Response Time**
  - Chattanooga: 5:11
  - 11 City Average: 4:23

- **Cost Per Calls For Service**
  - Chattanooga: $2,866
  - 11 City Average: $2,109

- **Percentage of Structure Fires Where Cause is Determined**
  - Chattanooga: 90%
  - 11 City Average: 89%

TENNESSEE MUNICIPAL BENCHMARKING PROJECT
FY 2005 ANNUAL REPORT