University of Tennessee, Knoxville
Trace: Tennessee Research and Creative Exchange

Sociology Publications and Other Works | Sociology

January 2007

Review of Do Glaciers Listen? Local Knowledge, Colonial Encounters and Social Imagination by Julie Cruikshank

Paul K. Gellert
University of Tennessee - Knoxville, pgellert@utk.edu

Follow this and additional works at: http://trace.tennessee.edu/utk_socopubs

Part of the Nature and Society Relations Commons, Politics and Social Change Commons, and the Social and Cultural Anthropology Commons

Recommended Citation
Gellert, Paul K., "Review of Do Glaciers Listen? Local Knowledge, Colonial Encounters and Social Imagination by Julie Cruikshank" (2007). *Sociology Publications and Other Works.*
http://trace.tennessee.edu/utk_socopubs/68

This is brought to you for free and open access by the Sociology at Trace: Tennessee Research and Creative Exchange. It has been accepted for inclusion in Sociology Publications and Other Works by an authorized administrator of Trace: Tennessee Research and Creative Exchange. For more information, please contact trace@utk.edu.

space of finite, inexpansible status. Thus, advancing a new moral vocabulary inevitably implies working to delegitimize another. Acknowledging this zero-sum dynamic is helpful for understanding why some cultural differences necessarily lead to conflict. This idea has broad implications for thinking about cultural conflict. The book ends with a short conclusion.

Emerging Moral Vocabularies is a good book that could have been better. Its primary fault is a lack of engagement with sociological literatures that speak precisely to the problem that Lowe wants to address. Abbott's work on professional ecologies (and John Evans's extension of it to the bioethics debate) is formally very similar to Lowe's model. Boltanksi and Thévenot's work on "repertoires of justification" and the neo-institutionalists' emphasis on legitimacy processes (among others) seem like vital points of reference for thinking about ideological ecologies. Engaging these thinkers would have added breadth to the book's target audience, depth to its argument, and (presumably) generated new insights into the movements in question.

Similarly, the author hints at the work of Lamont and Swidler on cultural repertoires in some tantalizing ways, but never really puts these connections to good use. For instance, one idea that Lowe considers briefly, but that I would like to have seen more fully explored, is that the "moral toolkit" is a more internalized, more emotionally salient subset of the "cultural toolkit." After all, despite his choice of words, Lowe makes clear that moral vocabularies are more than just words we use; in some cases, they have the power to shape entire lives.

In the end, however, these weaknesses might have more to do with the fragmented structure of the field than with any failing on the author's part. For scholars who are interested in bridging the field's structural holes, this book has much value. Cultural sociologists who want to understand better the struggles that produce shared meaning and social movement scholars who want to think about the broader cultural impact of the movements they study should take a look.

POPULATION, COMMUNITIES, AND THE ENVIRONMENT

Do Glaciers Listen? Local Knowledge, Colonial Encounters, and Social Imagination, by **Julie Cruikshank.** Vancouver, BC: UBC Press and Seattle, WA: University of Washington Press, 2005. 312 pp. $25.00 paper. ISBN: 0295985143.

PAUL K. GELLERT
University of Tennessee
pgellert@utk.edu

There is no doubt that a book that asks readers to conceive of glaciers as sentient beings takes on a challenge. Nature's agency?! Most sociologists, as well as other social scientists steeped in Western epistemologies and ontologies, will reject this notion as out of hand. Yet, Julie Cruikshank's *Do Glaciers Listen?* broaches nature's agency—"a sentient landscape that listens and responds to human indiscretion" (p. 142)—in order to examine the complex intersection of culture and nature, so long separated in Western scientific analyses by sociologists and others. Building on early encounters between Western explorers and colonists with First Nation people in the Saint Elias Mountains of what is now the Yukon Territory, she argues not only that earlier, more equal transfers of knowledge have been replaced by more unbalanced encounters, but also that stories continue to matter for contemporary debates about environmentalism and global warming, as well as biodiversity and local knowledge.

The book is divided into three interwoven sections on Matters of Locality, Practices of Exploration, and Scientific Research in Sentient Places. The sections illuminate, respectively, questions of local culture and memory; intersecting narratives and the unequal power relations surrounding them in various encounters between outsiders and indigenous peoples; and the application of science, mapping, and new scientific fields such as Indigenous Knowledge (IK). One could read each section separately, but the cumulative effect is worth the effort. Cruikshank builds

Delivered by Ingenta to :
University of Tennessee
Mon, 26 Oct 2009 15:07:04

from local indigenous viewpoints to the nineteenth century colonial projects in "Russian" America and "British" North America to twentieth and twenty-first century global projects of environmental sustainability represented by the designation of much of this area as a UNESCO World Heritage Site. Cruikshank's own project is sociologically complex and historically satisfying for she concretely demonstrates how the local and global are not two "locations," but different aspects or moments of on-going processes of conquest and resistance. Moreover, the processes may seem pre-determined in retrospect, but as Cruikshank reconstructs the past encounters and the selectivity of scientific reporting, one increasingly appreciates the historical intermingling of ideas and practices and her insistence that we listen to other voices—including even the glaciers that are listening to us.

Cruikshank, professor emerita of anthropology at the University of British Columbia, has spent decades in the region, studying a "place" that moves from the time of the Little Ice Age (1550–1900) and the many local people and outsiders who have moved around this liminal location. The main text begins with thirteen oral histories shared with Cruikshank by three elderly Tlingit women in the 1970s. Tlingit stories portray glaciers as conscious and responsive; they are deeply offended by the smell of cooking with grease and open up, posing great danger to humans—especially those with the hubris to ignore their desires. Cruikshank's aim is not just to offer alternative voices, but to problematize our own "normalized understandings of what 'nature' means" so that we might end our complicity in smothering indigenous narratives as "irrelevant to the modern world" (p. 258).

To do so, she turns to the historical records and oral accounts of travels by the French Jean-Francois de La Pérouse, American John Muir and British Edward Glave in three fascinating chapters on the more balanced eighteenth and nineteenth century encounters between European explorers and indigenous groups. French and Tlingit fur traders meet inside Lituya Bay on new land emerging at the end of the Little Ice Age. The encounter is largely ignored in Tlingit accounts emphasizing the losses of life from ecological disaster but serves to sediment Enlightenment notions of nature/culture separation for the French. A century later, when the U.S. military preferred to maintain order by force, Muir brought transcendental notions of spirit to a people who rejected any idea of a desocialized spirit. Over numerous visits, they shared stories about nature, glacial retreat and religion, seeking common ground on philosophical questions such as whether wolves have souls or glaciers respond to humans. Ironically, Muir's New York editor at *The Century Magazine* excised thoughtful observations about Tlingit views of nature "lest they shake up categories already shaping the American environmental movement" (p. 244). Thus, the encounters were shaped by their interpreters and audiences back in the metropole. The Tlingit audience, meanwhile, dismissed Muir as witchlike for his lengthy excursions by himself onto the glaciers. Lastly, Cruikshank pairs Glave's narratives of Alaska and of the Congo, effectively demonstrating how initial receptiveness morphed into Congo-based hostility towards unfriendly glaciers and equally unfriendly humans and speculating that what he learned in the Arctic may have influenced his anti-slavery activism in the Congo.

Delivered by Ingenta to:
University of Tennessee
Mon, 26 Oct 2009 18:07:04

As greater globalizing forces impinge on the region, beginning with the gold rush that brought forty thousand goldseekers to the Yukon, Cruikshank briefly examines questions of science and power. The mapping over of indigenous territories by Russian, U.S., and Canadian authorities, as James Scott has pointed out, is typical of the ways in which Western states "see" by emphasizing boundary lines and ignoring humans and social activity in the landscape. Finally, Cruikshank notes the simultaneous exaltation of Indigenous Knowledge and abuses of traditional knowledge as it is re-"discovered" by scientists and conservationists. Global environmental narratives, she argues, are deployed to place pristine, primordial wilderness under human protection.

Sociologists of culture, environmental sociologists, and sociologists of science, knowledge, and technology should be interested in this volume. It could be usefully assigned in advanced undergraduate and graduate courses to explore a wide array of themes. For courses on colonialism and globalization it might be paired with a work that recounts the material processes of conquest that are

too briefly mentioned in this work. Finally, I would make a broader case that this book should be read more widely in sociology to remind us all that the taken-for-granted separation of categories of nature and culture (or society) were produced during particular periods of empire and colonial expansion. Cruikshank's beautifully crafted volume is a call to consider more carefully what it means to be modern and what our role as modern social analysts might be.

Ethnic Origins: The Adaptation of Cambodian and Hmong Refugees in Four American Cities, by **Jeremy Hein.** New York, NY: Russell Sage Foundation, 2006. 304 pp. $37.50 cloth. ISBN: 0871543362.

STEVEN J. GOLD
Michigan State University

Since the 1960s, the most visible studies to analyze the role of a group's culture in determining its place in American society have endorsed the culture of poverty thesis. As such, they contend that impoverished groups remain poor not because of structural factors like class inequality, economic restructuring, and racism, but rather because of intergenerationally transferred values that preclude upward mobility.

By claiming that poverty is due to dysfunctional culture rather than unjust social arrangements, such studies conclude that social and economic reforms intended to foster advancement among the poor are bound to fail since impoverished groups lack the values required to take advantage of them. This allows right-wing ideologues who oppose economic redistribution to assert that their position is not rooted in greed, but rather is justified by scientific research that predicts the failure of such policies.

Because sociologists are convinced that structure affects mobility, most shy away from placing cultural matters at the center of their studies of immigrant and ethnic groups in American society. In *Ethnic Origins: the Adaptation of Cambodian and Hmong Refugees in Four Americans Cities,* Jeremy Hein argues for the reversal of this trend. He urges social scientists to examine groups' historical backgrounds and cultural outlooks. Without doing so, he insists, they cannot fully understand migrants' fate. Hein calls this perspective *the ethnic origins hypothesis.*

To prove his point, Hein compares the experience of two Southeast Asian refugee groups—the Hmong and Cambodians—marked by similar regional origins, resettlement contexts, levels of English competence, skill and education, yet distinct patterns of adaptation, community formation, identity, and political outlook in the U.S. Given that the groups are marked by contextual similarities yet exhibit differing patterns of adaptation, the author concludes that culture and history offer the best explanation for these differences.

He shows the distinct ethnic origins of Hmong and Cambodians. Cambodians are individualistic in outlook, Theravada Buddhist in religion, and bilateral in family orientation. As a result, they display a weak collective identity in the U.S., react in a relatively passive manner to racism and anti-immigrant welfare reform policies, and are open to Pan-Asian identities.

In contrast, the Hmong are highly collective in outlook, patrilineal and clan-based in family orientation, and animist in religion. Having originated in China prior to their dispersal into the Laotian highlands, they possess a strong sense of group consciousness upon arrival in the U.S. Accordingly, they tend to preserve group solidarity, actively challenge racialization and welfare reform, discourage intermarriage, and feel little connection to Pan-Asian identity.

Delivered by Ingenta to :
University of Tennessee
Wed, 30 Apr 2009 18:07:04

Having established the utility of this perspective, Hein goes on to show how ethnic origins can be incorporated into prominent models of immigrant adaptation—including assimilation, segmented assimilation, group position theory, and ethnic competition theory. Hein strongly argues for disaggregating the racial-ethnic categories normally used in governmental reports and social science research on migrant populations (black, white, Asian, and Hispanic), since this system of classification impedes researchers' ability to learn about specific groups' histories, outlooks, and identities.

In addition to offering a well-researched and systematically argued statement about the importance of group culture in shaping migrants' adaptation to the United States, *Ethnic Origins* also offers a wealth of informa-